



CANADA

# House of Commons Debates

---

VOLUME 135 • NUMBER 234 • 1st SESSION • 36th PARLIAMENT

---

OFFICIAL REPORT  
(HANSARD)

**Monday, May 31, 1999**

**Speaker: The Honourable Gilbert Parent**

## CONTENTS

(Table of Contents appears at back of this issue.)

All parliamentary publications are available on the  
“Parliamentary Internet Parlementaire” at the following address:

**<http://www.parl.gc.ca>**

# HOUSE OF COMMONS

Monday, May 31, 1999

The House met at 11 a.m.

---

*Prayers*

---

## PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS

• (1100)

[*English*]

**Mr. John Godfrey (Don Valley West, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I think you will find there is unanimous consent in the House for the following motion.

That notwithstanding any standing order and the usual practices of the House, Bill S-18, an act respecting the Alliance of Manufacturers & Exporters Canada, be now called for second reading; and that the House do proceed to dispose of the bill at all stages without debate, including committee of the whole.

**The Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in such a fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(Motion agreed to)

\* \* \*

## AN ACT TO INCORPORATE THE ALLIANCE OF MANUFACTURERS & EXPORTERS CANADA

**Mr. John Godfrey (Don Valley West, Lib.)** moved that Bill S-18, an act respecting the Alliance of Manufacturers & Exporters Canada, be read the second time and, by unanimous consent, referred to committee of the whole.

• (1105)

[*Translation*]

(Motion adopted, bill read the second time, considered in committee of the whole and reported to the House without amendment, concurred in at report stage, read the third time and passed)

\* \* \*

## CANADIAN ARMED FORCES

The House resumed from April 21 consideration of the motion.

**Mr. Robert Bertrand (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of National Defence, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, I am pleased to take advantage of the opportunity provided by this motion to speak of the role of Parliament in the procurement of goods and services for the Canadian forces.

I must begin by stating clearly that the government is opposed to the motion calling for a standing committee of the House of Commons to hold public hearings on every proposed procurement of goods or services by the Canadian armed forces valued at more than \$100 million. In order for hon. members to clearly understand why, I would like to describe the present procurement process.

• (1110)

This process, which has been in place for many years in the Department of National Defence and in fact in all departments, is an important instrument of public scrutiny. I would like to speak as well of the potential impact of the proposed change on the expeditious delivery of the necessary equipment to the armed forces.

The procurement of equipment, goods and services is of vital importance to the success of the Canadian forces. The quantity and type of equipment purchased has a direct influence on the forces' capacity to fulfil their role, which in turn influences where and how they can be deployed by the government.

The 1994 white paper on defence defined these roles as protecting Canada, co-operating with the United States in the defence of North America, and contributing to peace and international security.

These are important jobs and I know I speak for everyone here today when I say that the Canadian armed forces have delivered an exceptional calibre of service in everything from their contribution during last year's ice storm to the present operations in Yugoslavia.

However, in order to maintain this level of excellence, the Canadian armed forces must be able to count on the appropriate equipment at a fair price and when they need it. The procurement process of the Department of National Defence complies with Treasury Board requirements. When possible and feasible, all large dollar contracts are put out to tender in an open and transparent manner.

*Private Members' Business*

All capital projects are included in the annual budget tabled in the House and all major government projects, that is those over \$100 million, containing an element of risk, are examined by the Treasury Board and by cabinet. Because major government projects also affect several departments, they must meet strict conditions and national requirements.

Not surprisingly, there is a comprehensive procurement process for major government projects, starting with the identification of needs and continuing through to delivery of the product. It is also transparent and fair. I will describe this process briefly.

The Canadian forces may need a particular good or service for several reasons. Repairing some of its equipment might not be cost-effective. Operational changes might make different equipment necessary. Technological advances may necessitate the updating of equipment or, again, a strategic analysis may lead to the identification of new requirements.

When a need is identified, a preliminary list of potential solutions is drawn up, and costs are estimated. Next, options are analysed, feasibility studies done, scenarios tried out and, finally, risks are assessed. The cost evaluations are then refined, and various aspects of the study are reviewed by the Treasury Board secretariat and by a senior advisory committee in charge of contracts comprising the heads of various departments.

This committee must make sure that the proposal receives the attention of senior managers, is covered by broad government policy and is in keeping with the government's objectives.

The proposal and procurement strategy are then reviewed by cabinet, and, if it is deemed acceptable, receives approval in principle. At this point, Treasury Board looks at the proposal with a view to a preliminary approval, and this step is followed by the procurement process. Once the strategy has been approved, a call for tenders is put out.

• (1115)

The Minister of National Defence again presents the proposal to cabinet, taking different factors in consideration this time, including the reconfirmation of the need, the underlying justification, the implementation plan, the global cost and other aspects.

If the procurement strategy has already led to a call for tenders, cabinet would also approve the choice of a bidder at this stage. Once a decision has been made, the proposal moves to final approval by Treasury Board.

The contract is awarded by another department—Public Works and Government Services—which ensures an independent, fair and transparent process. I must add here this practice is unusual among Canada's allies.

It should be noted that the government's major procurement proposals often contribute to other objectives, including regional industrial and economic spinoffs, business opportunities for small business and economic development for native peoples.

The involvement of many other federal agencies and departments ensures that the major government's projects are carried out according to the policies and goals of the government and of the people of Canada.

This process has a significant impact on the Canadian forces, from financial management to defence planning operations. We should not consider any change that could inhibit the ability of the Department of National Defence to provide our Canadian forces with the tools they need to fulfil their missions.

There are at least three reasons for which the House should not support this proposal. First, a number of departments, including DND, have already taken measures to improve the procurement process so that Canada can get the best equipment at the best price.

The Department of National Defence has shown innovative spirit to ensure that our country has a multipurpose combat-capable force, at a fair price. For example, the decision makers have looked at the possibility of acquiring products sold on the market, since military equipment that is made to order is very costly and takes a very long time to get.

Moreover, two recent procurements, one involving 100 utility tactical transport helicopters and the other one 15 Cormorant search and rescue helicopters, are evidence that the Canadian forces can be provided with excellent material at a very good cost and take delivery much more quickly.

There are other innovative procurement processes that involve new financial arrangements. The acquisition last year of Upholder class submarines from Great Britain is an excellent example of innovative procurement. What maximizes the value of this transaction for Canadian taxpayers is an 8-year interest free loan-purchase. In addition to the Canadian forces getting the submarines for one quarter of the price of new ones, this project will generate economic spinoffs of some \$350 million for Canadian businesses.

I could go on, because I have other very interesting things to say, but I see that my time is up and I must give the floor to someone else.

[English]

**Mr. Gurmant Grewal (Surrey Central, Ref.):** Madam Speaker, I rise on behalf of the people of Surrey Central to speak to this private member's motion.

Motion No. 73 calls on the House to establish a House of Commons committee to hold public hearings on every proposed procurement of goods and services by the Canadian forces valued at more than \$100 million.

With respect, I would hesitate to support the motion because I believe it is not a good idea. The motion suggests adding another layer of political involvement in defence procurement. It would

also add another layer of bureaucracy causing the process to become even more extended. In my view and that of many Canadians, the defence procurement process could use a lot less political involvement.

• (1120)

The auditor general has also said that there is too much bureaucracy within our procurement process. In a presentation on procurement to the defence committee, it was said that the problems of our defence procurement process lies with the military, bureaucratic and political interface.

The EH-101 helicopter is a prime example of political interference. Both the Liberals and Tories messed up the military requirements with their interference and left the coast guard operations in jeopardy.

In the hard face of all these contracts that have either been awarded, cancelled or altered, it is the direct political interference that is responsible for all this mess. The official opposition does not support adding another layer of political involvement.

The Reform Party of Canada has always pursued a policy of reducing bureaucracy and red tape. We want to get rid of big government and reduce the role that government's play in our daily lives. If we were to follow what the Bloc is recommending, all of a sudden there would be a myriad of politicians wanting to jump into the fray making sure that a chunk of the \$100 million contracts would end up in their ridings.

The defence department needs to be able to purchase the equipment it needs to do its job. There is always a political element to every purchase but that is where experts should come in to advise the politicians. It needs politicians to leave it alone and not to tell it what to buy and from where to buy it.

There has always been the question of sole sourcing where there is no bidding process. It would be nice to have the assurance that there would be a greater number of open bid contracts and not the sole sourcing we have seen in many cases in Canada.

There is always a question of political interference in sole sourcing contracts being awarded. I can see coming into the mix, if we have these public hearings, politicians demanding that they be involved and that industries in their ridings be involved.

I will not support contracting of purchasing being brought to the committee table. I am not able to say that I have full confidence in the existing structure and functioning of the committees of the House of Commons. The way committees work in the House needs functional improvement. Committees are not managing their own affairs efficiently. Even having a quorum has been a problem many times. I can say this because I usually arrive on time and watch

### *Private Members' Business*

most other members come in late, or sometimes having been called in to the committee.

We have an ongoing problem of leaked reports from the committees. I do not see any political will by the government to solve the problem. Even the "leaked committee report" was also leaked.

All parties unanimously decided some time ago to televise committee proceedings from gavel to gavel but we still do not have that in the committees. Is the government chickening out? I really have to wonder.

The Private Members' Business subcommittee has serious problems. I maintain, from what I have seen, that it cannot prove itself to be fair, respectful and empowering of the backbencher members of parliament. It is an exercise in futility. Heckling in committees and the House is excessive and absolutely unnecessary. Partnership prevails in all the Liberal dominated committees.

There has been a problem with the fairness of the chairmen. The Liberal chairs of various committees often unduly defend the Liberal members and their friendly witnesses, in particular their ministers. The chairs are often unfair in timing and in allowing opposition members to ask questions, or even in entertaining motions from opposition members. Most members look through the lens of political stripes and rarely through the lens of issues.

For instance, recently in the immigration committee the Liberal members who dominate the committee refused to allow the committee to study in its future business the abuse of the immigration and refugee system by drug dealers, criminals or terrorists. How can we do that if we are looking through the lens of issues? Many times the committee set-up is inefficient.

• (1125)

The scrutiny of regulations committee, of which I am a co-chair, has had unresolved regulations in the pipeline for as long as 25 years. We do not even have a clear disallowance procedure in place in that committee. Ministers and agencies do not respond in a timely fashion. With all of this inefficiency and mismanagement, how can anyone expect committees to do a good job in administering the over \$100 million defence contracts?

Politicians should not make decisions for experts, specialists or administrators. We all know by now how the Prime Minister's aid was involved in securing the infamous grant to the Prime Minister's associate, friend, constituent or whatever we call it in the Shawinigate. How was the RCMP contract to build a road to the Prime Minister's residence awarded without any bidding? How has Revenue Canada staff been shifted in the Shawinigan shenanigans?

Who does not remember the contract awarded to Bombardier for NATO flight training in western Canada? This was an untendered contract awarded by the Liberal government to the tune of \$2.85 billion. Who on the government side can justify the 90% to 92% of

*Private Members' Business*

CIDA contracts being awarded to two central Canadian provinces for years and years? How can we expect fairness in committee in awarding defence contracts by these politicians?

I will not be supporting the motion. It borders on sabotaging our defence procurement process. It would add another level of bureaucracy, placing our troops much further from what they need to get the job done. The motion would actually increase the opportunity for political interference in the procurement process.

**Mr. Mac Harb (Ottawa Centre, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, I was quite interested in my colleague's comments concerning partisanship in committees and in the House. However, I was quite disappointed that he spent seven out of ten minutes on partisan rhetoric. He was taking potshots with comments that had absolutely no foundation whatsoever. There is no truth to them whatsoever.

He then moved on to personally attack members of the House of Commons, some of whom are the finest leaders the country has had over its history. I do not want to spend my 10 minutes responding because it would take me a lot longer to respond from this end if I am to put the points on the line.

I want to go back to the motion before the House. It states:

That, in the opinion of this House, the government should have a standing committee of the House of Commons hold public hearings on every proposed procurement of goods or services by the Canadian Armed Forces valued at more than \$100 million, in order to ensure that the procurement process is transparent and fair to all concerned.

I just want to refer members to a comment made to the standing committee on defence by a witness, Joseph Haddock, director for International Business (Canada), Sikorsky Canada Inc., on the issue of contracting out. He said that he was a veteran for over 29 years in the U.S. navy, that he was quite experienced and that he had been involved firsthand in the procurement aspect of the defence industry in the United States. He moved on to make a comment specifically on the whole issue of the public process of holding hearings. He said:

First, on a positive note, Canada's process appears to me to be simpler than the U.S. system with regard to the budgeting process. In the U.S. the multitude of congressional reviews and political manipulation of planned budgets wreak havoc on planning and execution, both from the government's perspective as well as industry's.

• (1130)

This gentleman's comments before the Standing Committee on National Defence and Veterans Affairs speak volumes. It is a golden statement which sums up what I would probably say in response to the motion proposed by my colleagues from the Reform Party.

I sit on the public accounts committee. I assure the House that when the auditor general senses there is even the slightest bit of a

problem or perceived problem, and not necessarily a wrongdoing, he is out there like a hawk with his crew digging through thousands of papers. He goes through every single contract in any government department, crown corporation or agency that is involved. He never gives up until he gets to the bottom of a story. We already have an ombudsman who is always on the lookout to protect the interests of the public whenever he senses there is a potential problem.

Some of the finest public servants on this planet work for the Government of Canada, in the Department of Public Works and Government Services, the Department of National Defence and the Treasury Board. They go through the fine print of contracts that are for \$100 million or more but even those that are less, to ensure they meet the objectives set out by the Government of Canada to ensure transparency and that the public is getting its money's worth and a return on its investment.

Certainly setting up another parliamentary committee to cross the country every time we have a project of \$100 million is going to invite partisanship. It is going to invite regionalism and conflict. It will open the door for possible political pressure and political lobbying of all sorts. It will not serve the public interest.

Why do we want to create another bureaucracy when we already have a multitude of agencies that do exactly the kind of thing my colleague wants to do? There is absolutely nothing preventing any member of the House or any member of a committee of the House from inspecting or bringing in the head of an agency, a deputy minister or a minister to appear before a committee to answer questions with regard to a contract.

I would say this government, this society and this country enjoy the finest when it comes to the public tendering process and to dealing with the public purse. As a parliamentarian I am proud of what the Department of National Defence and the Department of Public Works and Government Services are doing in the field in conjunction with Treasury Board. I have every faith they are doing a fine job, far away from political interference, public pressure and regional interests that might come into play from time to time with major contracts.

Certainly I am not going to hide the fact that if a company in my constituency was bidding on a \$100 million contract and a parliamentary committee was holding hearings across the country on the project, you bet I would make submissions to the committee saying that the company was doing a great job and it would do a fine job if it got the contract. That is the nature of the beast.

As politicians we have a responsibility to protect the interests of those in our constituencies who create jobs. I am right to do that. But if every one of my colleagues is going to do the same thing I am doing, we are going to create confusion if not chaos in the political process. As well we are going to put that specific

*Private Members' Business*

committee in an extremely awkward position. At the end of the day, when somebody has to make a decision and the yeas and the nays are given, somebody is going to be happy and somebody else is going to be unhappy, just like everything else in life.

To that extent, if it is not broken, why fix it? The system works. It works effectively and efficiently. It is transparent. It is one of the finest systems in the world. Let us protect the integrity of the system. Let us leave the political interference out of it.

• (1135)

I will be voting against this motion when it comes before the House.

**Mr. Leon E. Benoit (Lakeland, Ref.):** Madam Speaker, I appreciate being given this time. I had not planned to speak on this motion but after listening to the last member speak, I thought I should make some comments.

I was surprised by the way the member for Ottawa Centre spoke against the motion. I have had members from my party speak against it from the point of view that they do not want political interference in the process of making decisions on contracts. The motion reads:

That, in the opinion of this House, the government should have a standing committee of the House of Commons hold public hearings on every proposed procurement of goods or services by the Canadian Armed Forces valued at more than \$100 million, in order to ensure that the procurement process is transparent and fair to all concerned.

It does not say that the standing committee would make decisions on whether the contract would go ahead; it says that it would make the process more transparent. From that point of view, I will speak in favour of the motion. I am going to speak in favour of it for two reasons.

First, looking at the committee structure and the value of House of Commons committees, there is a need for a pretty dramatic change. Last year the Standing Committee on National Defence and Veterans Affairs, and I was a member of that committee, did a study on the quality of life in the Canadian forces. We listened to members of the forces, members in the community and people who were interested in the Canadian armed forces. I do not feel that the report that was presented at the end of this extensive process represented what was heard.

Second, even though that report was presented and even though it was not anywhere near complete and in a lot of areas it did not reflect what we had heard, it was pretty much ignored. I do not expect that in the end there will be much done about that at all.

Having the function of scrutinizing the procurement process in the forces of contracts over \$100 million would be a very important role for that committee. It would increase the value of the

committee. The committees are not very useful right now. Often a lot of good work is done but very little happens as a result. In this case the committee could serve a very important role.

I am sure opposition members and even some government members would ask important questions about the procurement procedure in particular contracts. Those questions may well spark a more intensive study by the auditor general. In some cases where the information is damning enough, it may cause the defence department to back off or reissue certain contracts.

An important function of the committees should be to carefully scrutinize the spending of taxpayers' dollars. That is not happening enough right now. Even when it does happen through the estimates and bringing ministers before the committee and so on, often the quality of the scrutiny is not good enough and it is pretty much ignored anyway. So what is the purpose?

In this case that function would be worthwhile. It would be valuable because issues surrounding the contracts would be brought to the attention of the government, the department, the auditor general and most important, the public.

I congratulate the member brought forward Motion No. 73. It is certainly not enough but I will support the motion as far as it goes. It makes a lot of sense.

• (1140)

I am concerned that the member for Ottawa Centre spoke out against this further scrutiny. It cannot be provided properly by any other body, or at least it has not been. He spoke out against it as something that would be of little value. Maybe the member is not looking at how ineffective House of Commons committees have become, particularly in this parliament. In the last parliament the committees functioned better. They were given a larger role than they had before, but that has been taken away.

As the Reform critic for immigration and as a member of the immigration committee, I certainly know the value of that committee has been reduced very dramatically. I question whether it is worth going to the meetings. That is how ineffective that committee has become.

Other members from all parties, including the government party, have indicated that a lot of committees are like that now. They have lost their value, which is unfortunate. House of Commons committees could truly be the place where the useful background and detailed work could be done. It could help to improve legislation. The legislation would be debated in the House of Commons. It would be better quality legislation.

Clearly it is a deliberate move on the part of the government to make sure the committees do not work like that. Their value has been reduced dramatically. This is one way we could improve the

*Private Members' Business*

quality of whatever committee would perform that function. Probably it would be the defence committee.

Personally, I would like to see this motion pass. I encourage all members to look at it. It does not say that there would be political interference in the decision. The role of the committee would be to bring important considerations that otherwise might be missed to the forefront and to the attention of the public.

I appreciate having had the time to make this presentation. I encourage other members to allow this change to take place. It would increase the value of that committee. It would allow the committee to do something important, which would be very hard for government and for the defence department to ignore. This kind of motion is to be applauded.

**Ms. Bev Desjarlais (Churchill, NDP):** Madam Speaker, I too want to offer my support for this motion. I thank the hon. member for bringing it forward.

If anybody doubts it, we just have to look at the ratings of politicians and lawyers on the scale of who people trust to see that over the years people have lost faith in politicians. They have lost faith in the process because of underhanded dealings, because of what is perceived as misuse of taxpayers' dollars. The government has not been at the forefront in ensuring that there was a good process that people could trust as being done fairly.

This motion tries to address the lack of respectability that government and politicians have. It wants to ensure that taxpayers' dollars are spent fairly and that the public is able to see that these dollars are being spent fairly.

A key issue in this whole debate is that we are not talking about a small amount of dollars; we are talking about contracts of \$100 million. It is hard to believe the government would be going against having some kind of public scrutiny for the expenditure of \$100 million on a contract. It is unconscionable to even think that government members could be arguing that it is not right.

I listened to the hon. member from the Liberal Party speak. He seemed to think that we will take this out to the public and it will become a real partisanship issue. The problem is that there has been too much partisanship and that is why it needs to go to the public. If that is not there, then take it to the public and show the public that it is not there. Do not be afraid to put it on the plate for them. The problem is it is not there and that is why these kinds of motions come forth.

• (1145)

It is extremely important that this motion receive support from all parties in the House to show Canadians that we are willing to stand for a system that is working. If it is not working, then let the

public know. If it is working, let them know. We must let the public gain back some trust in the processes.

I believe we have really good public servants. The problem is, it is not just the public servants who are involved in issuing \$100 million contracts. We all know there are other areas that come into question. There are questions of partisanship and patronage. It is extremely important that we let Canadians know that it is not there. If we really believe it is not there, then let us show Canadians.

My hon. colleague for Halifax West spoke on this issue previously and commented on the auditor general's scathing report. Yes, the auditor general is there, but he prepares the report and he expects this House to come forth with policies and legislation that will support him in ensuring that where there is a problem we will be able to address it. With the way things are now, that is impossible.

I will not belabour the issue, but I want to ask all parties to support the motion. If we are to gain some degree of respectability within our government system it is time we put forth these types of motions so the public can see there is reason to trust in our democratic system.

**Mr. Rick Borotsik (Brandon—Souris, PC):** Madam Speaker, I am pleased to rise on behalf of my colleague for Compton—Stansstead to speak to Motion No. 73 put forward by the Bloc member. I will say at the outset that the Progressive Conservatives, at least the member for Compton—Stanstead and myself, will be supporting this private member's legislation when it is voted on sometime in the near future.

I have heard Liberal members give excuses as to why it is not necessary to have a special committee struck to deal with procurement in national defence. They used excuses such as transparency and openness being in place now. Liberal members also state that procedures are in place which allow Canadians to believe that they are well served and well protected by the process currently in place. I would suggest that is not the case.

This motion came forward because the hon. member believes that the committee system we currently have does not seem to be working in this particular area. I believe that the agriculture committee, on which I sit, works fairly well, is open and transparent. I am very pleased to say that the majority of the government members who sit on that committee are open to honest discussion and honest debate. Some of those members are here today and that was not meant to try to endear them to my heart.

There are certain committees which work, but that does not seem to be happening in the defence committee. Unfortunately there does not seem to be openness when dealing with estimates. There does not seem to be openness when the minister appears before the committee. When members of that committee do not have the



opportunity to get the true facts, then obviously it means there is a necessity to put other options forward. This is, in our estimation, a reasonable option under the circumstances.

Let me give the House an example of the efficiency that was spoken of by members of the government. Let me tell members about the cost effectiveness of this government when dealing with military procurement. Let me deal with a very simple example, that of the procurement of the EH-101 helicopter.

The government would love to forget about the EH-101, but that procurement took place rationally, logically and nominally. An agreement was reached to buy helicopters which were required by the Canadian military. However, the Liberal government, in its own fashion and in its own way of wasting Canadian taxpayer dollars, decided at the stroke of a pen that it would, through political expediency, not accept the contract that was negotiated, developed and in place at a penalty cost in excess of \$1 billion to the Canadian public. In excess of \$1 billion of Canadian public dollars was expended needlessly by the government because of political expediency. That in itself speaks to the need for some type of committee watchdog that will put some openness and transparency back into the system.

• (1150)

A government member recently said “But we do have a watchdog. We do have that backstop. We have the auditor general who comes in and if there should be any improprieties in any part of the process, then that watchdog will look at all of the papers and documents. He will go through all of the process and then he will come forward and say that this was wrong”. He is right, that is what the auditor general does.

The auditor general provides a very valuable service. The problem is that no one listens to him on the government side. They do not listen to the auditor general. They turn a deaf ear and they simply continue with the same type of political expediency that is now in place.

The motion proposes the idea of a committee being struck to deal with expenditures in the military of over \$100 million. That is a lot of money. The motion itself reflected that when it spoke to the number of \$100 million. Anything below that certainly can and will be dealt with by the department of defence and the treasury department.

The government says that this cannot happen because there is an operational requirement for the Department of National Defence and if we had a committee it would stop the operational necessities of the department. That is not true. One hundred million dollars allows the normal operations of the Department of National Defence to continue. However, there should be an opportunity for anything above \$100 million to be vetted by Canadians.

### *Private Members' Business*

The government talks about Canadians having a return on investment. Canadians need a return on their investment right now. This is one area in which this could begin. If the committee system worked it would not be necessary. If investigation by the auditor general worked it would not be necessary. Unfortunately we can point to too many problems associated not only with this department but with the government.

We will be voting in favour of this motion. We will continue to strive for openness and transparency when it comes to procurement by the Department of National Defence.

In closing I would like to cite two other examples. One of them was a contract that was not tendered but was awarded to Bombardier for \$2.85 billion for training. It was done by the Liberal government. I do not think Canadians were well served by that particular contract, which was not negotiated.

The other example I would like to touch on briefly is that of alternative service delivery. ASD makes sense, to a degree, but unfortunately there is no openness, there is no transparency and there is no ability for Canadians or parliamentarians to be able to put forward their opinions on this particular program. That is why a committee of this nature would be a good operational necessity for parliament.

I stand on behalf of the Progressive Conservative Party and the member for Compton—Stanstead to say that we will support this motion. I wish the government would only listen. It does not understand that what it is doing now does not resonate with the Canadian public. It does not understand that what it is doing is wrong.

All we have to say is EH-101 and I am sure Canadians will understand.

**Mr. Hec Clouthier (Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, it is simply unbelievable. The member for Brandon—Souris was indulging in nothing more than scurrilous rhetoric. He was talking about simple things. It is simply not true. The hon. gentleman, and I use that term very loosely, simply does not know. I forgive him and I know that the people on this side of the House forgive him. He indulges in rhetoric. He waves his arms like a big water buffalo, and I mean that amicably. He just keeps on flailing away, thinking that it is actually going to resonate with the people of the House and the voting public who are listening, but that is simply not true.

• (1155)

I listened with great interest to my colleague from Ottawa Centre and the parliamentary secretary give a pointed, coherent rationale of why we will oppose this motion.

I am pleased to speak to the motion put forward by the hon. member for Joliette, but let me first look at it in terms of public

*Private Members' Business*

relations. I might add that some members opposite could have used public relations firms to garner some insight and knowledge before they stood to make these rather insane comments about this motion.

Let us look at what we call the optics. How does it look? How does it look not only to the government side but to the Canadian public? There are circumstances under which this motion would actually make sense; not many circumstances, but there are a few. For example, if the House had no oversight on procurement, whether for the armed forces, the specific object of this motion, or any other department, it would make sense if this procurement were done secretly, but it is not.

The motion would make sense if ministers of the government were not accountable to parliament. Au contraire, we know that they are accountable and they will continue to be accountable. There are always elections to maintain the accountability of the government, as well as question period and when ministers appear before a standing committee.

The hon. member opposite is not a member of the standing committee on national defence so he knows not of which he speaks. His hon. colleague, the member for Compton—Stanstead, is a member of the DND committee. Quite obviously he is not here because he knows we are right in this regard and he has asked the hon. member to stand in for him. I must say that after listening to what he has said he probably will not ask him to do so again.

We can appear before standing committees which can address this and any other issue.

There are five major policy cornerstones which uphold the procurement process of the Government of Canada. They are: the pre-eminence of operational requirements, competition, fairness, transparency and accessibility.

Let us look at how this system works from a practical standpoint and not an impractical viewpoint as we have heard expressed on the other side.

First, ministers and their ministries are responsible and accountable for following stringent contracting regulations and Treasury Board policies on contracts. The preferred route for most contracts above \$25,000 is always competitive bidding.

In the great riding of Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke there is a person who takes bids by the name of Colonel Ken Dillabough. He says, as only they can say in the upper Ottawa valley “Okay, lads and lassies, get up and loosen the purse strings. Put your hand up and do the competitive bidding”. That is what we prefer to do at all times, but there are exceptions.

There are exceptions to each and every rule, regardless of where we are in life, when a contract must be sole sourced. One example is proprietary interest. If a supplier is the only one with the right to

build and sell parts for the equipment it has developed and marketed, the government is obliged to use that supplier for that equipment. This makes sense and this government is committed to making sense, as opposed to some of my hon. colleagues opposite who come forth with nonsensical motions brought forward by people who do not know of what they speak.

Sometimes sole sourcing must be used in pressing emergencies. Quite simply, something has to be done fast and there is no time to get bids. When national security or the national interest is an issue, sole sourcing may be necessary. When that happens, ministers of the crown and officials must follow strict rules, and they are accountable to the government and ultimately to the House for their actions.

• (1200)

The truth is that most procurement is done through the competitive process and that competitive procurement is on the rise. In 1996, for instance, \$83 of every \$100 spent for procurement contracts over \$25,000 were committed through the competitive process. In 1997, the last year for which Treasury Board has its full figures, \$89 of every \$100 was spent as a result of competitive bidding.

Let us consider another example of service contracts. I am talking about everything from building maintenance to contracting for medicinal services. In 1995, 55% of these contracts were competitively let. The hon. member opposite knows full well that 55% of these contracts were competitively let. I will hold up my fingers so the member understands. In 1997, only two years later, this figure had risen to over 80%. I will get to the member for Lakeland if I can get through this.

The system is transparent. Almost all procurement is done competitively, and competitive bidding is on the rise. The trend is toward more competition, not less competition; more transparency; and more responsible use of public money.

Comparing our procurement system to those of other countries, the treasury board secretariat has found that our performance is much better than that of either the United States or the European Union.

There is only one question remaining. Are the provisions for oversight sufficient, especially for the steadily declining fraction of procurement that is not done through the competitive process? I believe they are and the government believes they are. The mechanisms which ensure fair, transparent and accessible procurement are in place.

For example, interdepartmental review committees that determine defence procurement strategies review all procurements of \$2 million or more. These committees may spot significant socio-economic opportunities in procurement. When they do, they can suggest that conditions be included that open all or part of the

*Government Orders*

process to minority or new business interests which might otherwise be frozen out. After the reviews are done, most of the procurement action proposed are posted on the government's electronic tendering service, on the Internet for bidding. To ensure fairness they are published in the government's business opportunities bulletin.

I occasionally disagree with the auditor general, but he does look at issues and does report to the House. If a procurement matter arises it can be the object of questions, of debate or of study by any number of standing committees.

What does the author of this motion suggest? Is it that we set up yet another standing committee for the sole purpose of looking at major military procurements? Is there no standing committee on national defence?

I know the hon. member for Lakeland mentioned that, but he used to be on the standing committee of national defence. I guess his own party basically pulled him from it because he knew not of what he spoke. He made rather pejorative, egregious comments by the DND SCONDVA committee saying that it had done nothing. The Canadian public disagrees and the military disagrees.

We gave pay raises and more money for quality housing. I suppose that is why the hon. member for Lakeland is no longer on the DND committee. I suppose his own party yanked him from it because he was doing no good there. He was of no benefit to us because we were doing the things that the Canadian military and Canadian public wanted. Is there no Standing Committee on Public Accounts?

My time has run out. In conclusion, let it be said that the government is opposed to the motion. We will not indulge in the scurrilous rhetoric of members opposite. We will oppose the motion because it is right that we oppose it.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The hon. member is correct; his time has run out. In fact the time for Private Members' Business has now expired and the order is dropped to the bottom of the order of precedence on the order paper.

That in relation to Bill C-32, an Act respecting pollution prevention and the protection of the environment and human health in order to contribute to sustainable development, not more than one further sitting day shall be allotted to the consideration of the report stage of the bill and one sitting day shall be allotted to the third reading stage of the said bill and, fifteen minutes before the expiry of the time provided for government business on the day allotted to the consideration of the report stage and on the day allotted to the third reading stage of the said bill, any proceedings before the House shall be interrupted, if required for the purpose of this Order, and in turn every question necessary for the disposal of the stage of the bill then under consideration shall be put forthwith and successively without further debate or amendment.

**Some hon. members:** Shame.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Some hon. members:** No.

**The Deputy Speaker:** All those in favour will please say yea.

**Some hon. members:** Yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** All those opposed will please say nay.

**Some hon. members:** Nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** In my opinion the yeas have it.

*And more than five members having risen:*

**The Deputy Speaker:** Call in the members.

• (1250)

(The House divided on the motion, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 455)*

**GOVERNMENT ORDERS**

• (1205)

[*Translation*]

**CANADIAN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ACT, 1999**

BILL C-32—TIME ALLOCATION MOTION

**Hon. Don Boudria (Leader of the Government in the House of Commons, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, I move:

**YEAS**

Members

Adams  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau

Alcock  
Assad  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Carroll  
Cauchon  
Chan  
Clouthier

*Government Orders*

Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Godfrey
Goodale	Gray (Windsor West)
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harvard
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jennings	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
MacAulay	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Manley	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McLellan (Edmonton West)	McTeague
McWhinney	Mifflin
Minna	Mitchell
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Pratt
Provenzano	Redman
Reed	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Scott (Fredericton)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	St-Julien
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Volpe
Whelan	Wilfert
Wood—135	

Sauvageau	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
St-Jacques	Stoffer
Strahl	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)—61	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Debien	Desrochers
Dion	Duceppe
Dumas	Graham
Laurin	McCormick
Ménard	Mercier
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)	O'Brien (Labrador)
Plamondon	Proud
Richardson	Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)
Turp	Wappel

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare the motion carried.

[*English*]

## REPORT STAGE

The House resumed from May 27 consideration of Bill C-32, an act respecting pollution prevention and the protection of the environment and human health in order to contribute to sustainable development, as reported (with amendment) from the committee; and of Group No. 4.

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.):** Madam Speaker, I am pleased to participate in the report stage debate of the Canadian Environmental Protection Act. There are 10 amendments in Group No. 4 which deal with several issues. One of the issues is cost effectiveness.

Motion No. 9 proposes to amend the bill to reinsert cost effectiveness into the definition of the precautionary principle. The internationally accepted definition of the precautionary principle was endorsed in Rio by over 150 countries including Canada. This Rio definition of sustainable development states the following:

Where there are threats of serious or irreversible damage, lack of full scientific certainty shall not be used as a reason for postponing cost effective measures to prevent environmental degradation.

This definition is now clearly recognized as a fundamental tenet of international environmental law. The government response stated that this definition of the precautionary principle would be incorporated into the Canadian Environmental Protection Act.

When Bill C-32 was tabled in the House the Rio definition of sustainable development including cost effectiveness was included in the bill. However, when the bill went to the standing committee some committee members voted to change this internationally accepted definition by removing all references to cost effectiveness.

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Alarie	Anders
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Bellehumeur	Benoit
Bigras	Blaikie
Borotsik	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Cadman
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	Doyle
Earle	Epp
Gagnon	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Goldring	Gouk
Grewal	Guimond
Hardy	Harris
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Konrad	Laliberte
Lalonde	Lebel
Loubier	Lunn
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Mark	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Morrison
Picard (Drummond)	Reynolds

*Government Orders*

Dropping cost effectiveness from the precautionary principle will cause major problems for the future for both government and industry. Industry must be able to implement sustainable development measures and remain competitive and profitable.

Our approach to the environment must be balanced. We need a strong and health economy to take concrete action to protect our environment. These two work hand in hand. Simply put, if the money is not there, we cannot and will not take action.

When there is no scientific certainty, which occurs in many cases and is the essence of many voluntary agreements and MOUs which the government has signed with industry, industry will take cost effective actions to protect the environment. However when science provides a clearer picture and demonstrates that damage can occur then more onerous measures are considered and will be applied.

• (1255)

The precautionary principle allows Canadians to proceed with caution in the interim phase. However when we eliminate cost effectiveness from the equation it is likely that we will lose the voluntary commitment of industry, which is critical to the continued protection of the environment.

One of the reasons Reform opposed Bill C-74 in the last parliament was the fact that the old CEPA bill would have made it too difficult and costly for industry to implement realistically. This is not a question of industry or the environment. It is a question of what is in the best interest of all Canadians. The environment is not a black or white issue. It is grey. Protecting the environment affects all Canadians.

I am pleased to note that the government supports our position on sustainable development and has proposed an identical amendment to Reform Motion No. 9 with Liberal Motion No. 8. However I am concerned that the government has failed to reinsert references to cost effectiveness that were contained throughout the bill when it was originally tabled in the House. These sections were critical to the delicate balance which was struck when the government consulted with industry and environment to draft Bill C-32.

When Bill C-32 was originally tabled in the House cost effectiveness was incorporated into a number of sections of the bill including administrative duties, information gathering provisions and pollution prevention planning. Some members of the standing committee voted to eliminate these sections on cost effectiveness from the bill. These amendments will not promote greater environmental action or attention. They will not create greater financial resources for government and industry to take action because Canadians simply do not have the means to take action beyond what is reasonable and cost effective.

In fact these amendments to the act may backfire by creating a reluctance for partners to sign agreements that are neither cost

effective nor realistic. Without these amendments chances are that we will see less, not more action.

Our Motions Nos. 10, 16 and 47 in this group propose to address this concern by reinserting cost effectiveness into the bill. Bill C-32 must integrate the principles of sustainable development including environmental, economic and social considerations.

Moving through this group of amendments, our Motion No. 18 contained within this group proposes to eliminate a new section in the bill that was added in committee. The section which we are proposing to eliminate simply makes little sense and opens the bill to gross misinterpretation. This sections states:

Nothing in this section shall be construed so as to prevent the taking of any action to protect the environment or human health for the purposes of this Act.

This is simply far too open ended. Our amendment proposes to reinstate the original clause put forward by the government when Bill C-32 was tabled in the House more than a year ago. The original section provided legal direction as to which legislation would take precedence if there were a duplication between acts which provide for the protection of the environment and human health. When this section was removed it eliminated the decision making mechanism from the act.

As well, Motion No. 22 in this grouping put forward by the NDP proposes to integrate a new definition of hormone disrupting substances into the definitions of the act. We will not support this amendment as the proposed definition of hormone disrupting substances is inconsistent with the internationally accepted working definition originally proposed in the legislation. The internationally accepted definition is:

Hormone disrupting substance means an exogenous substance that causes adverse health effects in an intact organism, or its progeny, consequent to changes in endocrine function.

We have put this definition of hormone disrupting substances forward in our amendments to the bill and therefore will not support Motion No. 22.

Motion No. 23, also put forward by the NDP, proposes a definition of recyclable material in the interpretation section of the act. The proposed definition reads:

Recyclable material means any material or aggregate of materials that, at any particular time and place, has use or value".

• (1300)

Anything can be interpreted as having use or value. This definition of recyclable material is clearly unacceptable. It is too broad and open to be interpreted as meaning any thing or any substance.

Motion No. 24 also proposes a new definition in the act where it proposes to introduce a definition of waste. The proposal was to define waste as any solid, liquid or gaseous material or materials, or a combination of them, discarded or intended to be discarded as

*Government Orders*

useless and valueless, but excludes recyclable material. Similar to Motion No. 23, the proposed definition is far too vague and far too open-ended. Such definitions are redundant as they serve absolutely no purpose when they are so open to interpretation. These amendments serve little purpose in fulfilling what is the intended mandate of the legislation.

We do not support amendments to the bill which extend the application of the bill to deal with all waste, particularly when dealing with exports. Our amendments to the bill propose that the section of the bill dealing with export of hazardous waste be limited to just that.

There is one item from this group of amendments that must be addressed and that is the inclusion of cost-effectiveness throughout the bill. I believe this is critical and hope members from all sides of the House will give this issue serious consideration before voting.

*[Translation]*

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Thibeault):** Pursuant to order made on Thursday, May 27, 1999, the questions on the motions in Group No. 4 are deemed put and the recorded divisions are deemed requested and deferred.

*[English]*

The House will now proceed to the debate on the motions in Group No. 5. Pursuant to order made on Thursday, May 27, the motions in Group No. 5 are deemed moved and seconded.

This groups contains Motions Nos. 17, 20, 21, 27 to 29, 34, 35, 40, 44, 45, 54, 55, 72, 75 to 79, 82, 92, 98 to 100, 102 to 104, 114, 124, 126, 127, 131, 134, 136, 140 to 145, 152, 157, 158, 162 to 166, 168, 170, 175, 177 to 180, 182, 184, 188, 190, 196, 199, 217 to 224, 226 to 229, 232 and 234 to 236.

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.)** moved:

Motion No. 17

That Bill C-32, in Clause 2, be amended by replacing line 6 on page 5 with the following:

“ings arising from health, environmental and”

Motion No. 20

That Bill C-32, in Clause 3, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 16 on page 8 with the following:

“la production de polluants”

Motion No. 21

That Bill C-32, in Clause 3, be amended by replacing, in the English version, line 18 on page 8 with the following:

“(a) a work or undertaking”

Motion No. 27

That Bill C-32, in Clause 6, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 7 on page 12 with the following:

“tones, choisis de la façon”

Motion No. 28

That Bill C-32, in Clause 6, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 10 and 11 on page 12 with the following:

“tochtones—sauf inuit—de Terre-Neuve, de l'Île-du-Prince-Edouard, de la Nouvelle-Écosse et du Nouveau-Brunswick,”

Motion No. 29

That Bill C-32, in Clause 6, be amended by replacing, in the English version, lines 39 and 40 on page 12 with the following:

“(2)(c)(i) to (v), the representative of the Inuit or of aboriginal people for the region, as the”

Motion No. 34

That Bill C-32, in Clause 17, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 22 on page 18 with the following:

“d) un bref exposé des éléments de preuve à l'appui de la”

Motion No. 35

That Bill C-32, in Clause 43, be amended

(a) by replacing line 14 on page 26 with the following:

“this Part.”

(b) by replacing, in the French version, lines 19 and 20 on page 26 with the following:

“«substance hormonoperturbante» Substance ayant le pouvoir de”

Motion No. 40

That Bill C-32, in Clause 44, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 16 to 19 on page 28 with the following:

“ci et de détermination de leurs effets—actuels ou potentiels, à court ou à long terme—sur l'environnement et la santé humaine, ainsi que les mesures de prévention et de lutte contre ces effets.”

Motion No. 44

That Bill C-32, in Clause 46, be amended by replacing line 21 on page 29 with the following:

“64 or that may become toxic;”

Motion No. 45

That Bill C-32, in Clause 46, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 37 on page 29 with the following:

“ces en péril ou d'autres espèces fauniques ou”

Motion No. 54

That Bill C-32, in Clause 57, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 4 on page 36 with the following:

“partie, utiliser, s'il satisfait à tout ou partie”

Motion No. 55

That Bill C-32, in Clause 57, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 12 on page 36 with the following:

“(2) Si le plan utilisé au titre du paragraphe”

Motion No. 72

That Bill C-32, in Clause 68, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 14 on page 41 with the following:

“effectivement ou potentiellement toxique ou”

*Government Orders*

## Motion No. 75

That Bill C-32, in Clause 71, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 28 on page 43 with the following:

“effectivement ou potentiellement toxique ou”

## Motion No. 76

That Bill C-32, in Clause 71, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 14 on page 44 with the following:

“toxicologiques disponibles, des données disponibles sur les activi-”

## Motion No. 77

That Bill C-32, in Clause 73, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 6 and 7 on page 45 with the following:

“en se fondant sur les renseignements disponibles, celles qui, à leur avis:”

## Motion No. 78

That Bill C-32, in Clause 73, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 16 on page 45 with the following:

“(2) Si les renseignements disponibles”

## Motion No. 79

That Bill C-32, in Clause 73, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 22 to 26 on page 45 with the following:

“(3) Lorsqu'ils classent par catégories des substances inscrites sur la liste intérieure, les ministres les examinent afin de déterminer s'il y a lieu de modifier la liste en vue d'y indiquer qu'elles sont assujetties au paragraphe”

## Motion No. 82

That Bill C-32, in Clause 76.1, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 27 on page 47 with the following:

“prudence lorsqu'ils procèdent à l'évaluation et aux examens”

## Motion No. 92

That Bill C-32, in Clause 78, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 33 on page 50 with the following:

“sauf si une autre disposition de la présente partie”

## Motion No. 98

That Bill C-32, in Clause 81, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 11 on page 53 with the following:

“mentaires—ac-”

## Motion No. 99

That Bill C-32, in Clause 81, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 23 and 24 on page 53 with the following:

“précise, les renseignements réglementaires—accompagnés des”

## Motion No. 100

That Bill C-32, in Clause 81, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 11 and 12 on page 54 with the following:

“chimique subie par une substance dans le cadre de son utilisation ou en raison de son entreposage”

## Motion No. 102

That Bill C-32, in Clause 82, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 31 and 32 on page 56 with the following:

“s'applique. Le cas échéant, les paragraphes 81(9) à (13) s'appliquent.”

## Motion No. 103

That Bill C-32, in Clause 83, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 35 on page 56 with the following:

“re, les renseignements disponibles sur”

## Motion No. 104

That Bill C-32, in Clause 83, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 2 and 3 on page 57 with the following:

“les ministres évaluent les renseignements disponibles sur une substance, notamment en”

## Motion No. 114

That Bill C-32, in Clause 91, be amended by replacing, in the English version, line 16 on page 64 with the following:

“tion (4), the Ministers shall take into consider-”

## Motion No. 124

That Bill C-32, in Clause 96, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 6 to 8 on page 71 with the following:

“de l'autorité ou à une personne à qui un rapport peut être présenté au titre de l'article 95.”

## Motion No. 126

That Bill C-32, in Clause 98, be amended by replacing, in the English version, lines 12 and 13 on page 72 with the following:

“95(2)(b) to the extent that that person knowingly or negligently caused or contributed to the”

## Motion No. 127

That Bill C-32, in Clause 98, be amended by replacing, in the English version, lines 27 to 29 on page 72 with the following:

“tion (3) to an extent greater than the extent to which the person knowingly or negligently caused or contributed to the release.”

## Motion No. 131

That Bill C-32, in Clause 101, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 26 on page 74 with the following:

“mité avec les règlements pris en vertu du”

## Motion No. 134

That Bill C-32, in Clause 102, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 19 on page 75 with the following:

“peut exporter les substances”

## Motion No. 136

That Bill C-32, in Clause 106, be amended

(a) by replacing line 39 on page 77 with the following:

“with the prescribed information, on or before the date”

(b) by replacing line 10 on page 78 with the following:

“with the prescribed information, on or before the date”

## Motion No. 140

That Bill C-32, in Clause 108, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 9 on page 81 with the following:

“re, les renseignements disponibles sur”

*Government Orders*

## Motion No. 141

That Bill C-32, in Clause 108, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 15 and 16 on page 81 with the following:

“les ministres évaluent les renseignements disponibles sur un organisme vivant, notam-”

## Motion No. 142

That Bill C-32, in Clause 109, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 2 on page 82 with the following:

“ments disponibles, les ministres soup-”

## Motion No. 143

That Bill C-32, in Clause 110, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 4 on page 83 with the following:

“ments disponibles sur un organisme”

## Motion No. 144

That Bill C-32, in Clause 110, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 24 on page 83 with the following:

“g) à l'égard de ces activités, les renseigne-”

## Motion No. 145

That Bill C-32, in Clause 112, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 30 on page 84 with the following:

“activités, les renseignements qui doivent”

## Motion No. 152

That Bill C-32, in Clause 117, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 37 on page 87 with the following:

“désignée par règlement en une concentration supérieu-”

## Motion No. 157

That Bill C-32, in Clause 119, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 47 on page 88 with the following:

“conditionneur d'eau présente pour”

## Motion No. 158

That Bill C-32, in Clause 119, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 20 to 22 on page 89 with the following:

“g) faire rapport au ministre sur les mesures prises en vue de se conformer à l'ordre.”

## Motion No. 162

That Bill C-32, in Clause 122, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 14 on page 91 with the following:

“a) Rejet délibéré de substances en”

## Motion No. 163

That Bill C-32, in Clause 122, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 3 on page 92 with the following:

“objets placés sur le fond des mers,”

## Motion No. 164

That Bill C-32, in Clause 129, be amended by replacing, in the English version, line 17 on page 98 with the following:

“necessary for the protection of marine life, any”

## Motion No. 165

That Bill C-32, in Clause 129, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 26 on page 98 with the following:

“substances à immerger ou à incinérer;”

## Motion No. 166

That Bill C-32, in Clause 133, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 4 and 5 on page 100 with the following:

“133. (1) Le texte des permis canadiens et de ses conditions—originales ou modifiées—sont publiés par le ministre dans la Gazette du”

## Motion No. 168

That Bill C-32, in Clause 135, be amended by replacing, in the English version, line 18 on page 101 with the following:

“lowed for sampling, analysing, testing, measuring or”

## Motion No. 170

That Bill C-32, in Clause 139, be amended by replacing, in the English version, lines 16 and 17 on page 103 with the following:

“sell a fuel that does not meet the prescribed requirements.”

## Motion No. 175

That Bill C-32, in Clause 145, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 28 on page 106 with the following:

“utilisée;”

## Motion No. 177

That Bill C-32, in Clause 148, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 7 to 9 on page 108 with the following:

“g) faire rapport au ministre sur les mesures prises en vue de se conformer à l'ordre.”

## Motion No. 178

That Bill C-32, in Clause 149, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 23 to 25 on page 108 with the following:

“a) constructeur ou fabricant, au Canada, de véhicules, moteurs ou équipements;”

## Motion No. 179

That Bill C-32, in Clause 149, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 30 on page 108 with the following:

“c) importateur au Canada de véhicules, moteurs ou”

## Motion No. 180

That Bill C-32, in Clause 155, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 30 on page 111 with the following:

“a) destinés à une utilisation au Canada, sur justifica-”

## Motion No. 182

That Bill C-32, in Clause 157, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 21 and 22 on page 114 with the following:

“faire donner avis conformément au règlement, au ministre, à”

## Motion No. 184

That Bill C-32, in Clause 161, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 7 on page 118 with the following:

“titre du présent article, un texte législatif édicté par un”

## Motion No. 188

That Bill C-32, in Clause 170, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 23 on page 124 with the following:



*Government Orders*

“170. (1) Sa Majesté du chef du Canada peut recouvrer les frais directs et indirects”

Motion No. 190

That Bill C-32, in Clause 175, be amended by replacing line 15 on page 127 with the following:

“175. In this Division, “water”

Motion No. 196

That Bill C-32, in Clause 180, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 29 on page 131 with the following:

“(3) Sous réserve du paragraphe (4), les personnes mentionnées au paragra-”

Motion No. 199

That Bill C-32, in Clause 187, be amended by replacing, in the English version, lines 34 and 35 on page 135 with the following:

“of a waste or material referred to in paragraph 185(1)(a), the Minister shall publish in the”

Motion No. 217

That Bill C-32, in Clause 220, be amended by replacing, in the English version, line 8 on page 163 with the following:

“(c) seize any printout or other output for”

Motion No. 218

That Bill C-32, in Clause 260, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 11 and 12 on page 182 with the following:

“(2) La personne citée à comparaître a droit aux indemnités appli-”

Motion No. 219

That Bill C-32, in Clause 284, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 7 on page 189 with the following:

“284. Malgré toute autre disposition de la présente”

Motion No. 220

That Bill C-32, in Clause 287, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 25 and 26 on page 190 with the following:

“contrevenant a fait preuve d'incompétence, de négligence ou d'insouciance;”

Motion No. 221

That Bill C-32, in Clause 287, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 34 and 35 on page 190 with the following:

“i) l'examen de toutes les sanctions applicables qui sont justifiées dans les”

Motion No. 222

That Bill C-32, in Clause 289, be amended by replacing, in the French version, lines 19 to 21 on page 191 with the following:

“peut surseoir au prononcé de la peine et, compte tenu de la nature de”

Motion No. 223

That Bill C-32, in Clause 296, be amended by replacing line 20 on page 196 with the following:

“(ii) paragraph 272(1)(c), (d) or (e),”

Motion No. 224

That Bill C-32, in Clause 306, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 37 on page 201 with the following:

“présente loi ou une enquête sur une”

Motion No. 226

That Bill C-32, in Clause 325, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 31 on page 209 with the following:

“325. Le”

Motion No. 227

That Bill C-32, in Clause 326, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 27 on page 210 with the following:

“tés ou concentrations des rejets -, produits en contenant”

Motion No. 228

That Bill C-32, in Clause 330, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 33 on page 212 with the following:

“par renvoi une norme, caractéristique technique, directive, méthode,”

Motion No. 229

That Bill C-32, in Clause 332, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 36 on page 213 with the following:

“publication les projets de décret, d'arrêtés, de règlement ou de texte—autre qu'un règlement—déjà”

Motion No. 232

That Bill C-32, in Clause 346, be amended by replacing, in the French version, line 2 on page 218 with the following:

“ment et mort ou blessures”

Motion No. 234

That Bill C-32, in Schedule 997, be amended by replacing, in the French version, the first line of item 4 on page 220 with the following:

“4. Les chlorofluorocarbures complètement halogénés dont la”

Motion No. 235

That Bill C-32, in Schedule 998, be amended by replacing, in the English version, the second line of item 20 of Part 2 on page 224 with the following:

“19.5%, 40%, 50%, 60% active ingredient and dusts containing”

Motion No. 236

That Bill C-32, in Schedule 999, be amended by replacing, in the French version, the first line of item 1 of Part 3 on page 224 with the following:

“1. Les chlorofluorocarbures complètement halogénés dont la for-”

**Ms. Paddy Torsney (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, all the motions relate to French and English concurrence. As the bill was amended during the committee process, we found that in many cases the French and English were no longer equivalent. It is important to all Canadians that the laws are able to be read and interpreted in both official languages and come out with the same meaning.

*Government Orders*

These motions correct errors that were found during a further review by the Department of Justice.

[*Translation*]

I trust that all members of this House will be in agreement with a process that is aimed at maintaining the equivalency of the English and the French in the bill. This is very important, and I trust that there will be unanimous agreement in this House.

• (1305)

**Ms. Jocelyne Girard-Bujold (Jonquière, BQ):** Madam Speaker, I am pleased to address the motions in Group No. 5.

There are many motions with which we agree in that group. There are also some with which we disagree. Consequently, we will vote against the group of motions, but we want to point out that we support French and English concurrence Motions Nos. 20, 21, 27, 28, 34, 40, 45, 76 to 79, 82, 92, 140 to 145, 217 to 224.

Motions Nos. 54 and 55 concern Part 4 of the act dealing with pollution prevention. The use of pollution prevention plans would centralize control over environmental matters in the hands of the federal government, and we cannot support that approach.

We will vote against Motion No. 124, dealing with clause 96 under the heading, "Release of Toxic Substances", because the deletion of certain terms deprives the provinces of their role and overlooks provincial provisions.

As for Motion No. 199, dealing with the export of material, we proposed amendments that were rejected by the committee. Therefore, we are opposed to any changes, even to ensure French-English concurrence, on this issue.

Motion No. 180 concerns Division 5 entitled "Vehicle, Engine and Equipment Emissions", and involves adjustments between the French and English versions. However, since we are opposed to that division of the act, we cannot support this block of amendments.

With respect to clauses 72 and 75, the proposed concurrence amendments indicate some serious problems of comprehension. They do not clarify particularly well the discrepancy between the French and the English. So, we cannot support them.

We have reached Group No. 5 in which the government has proposed a whole lot of concurrence amendments and new amendments to Bill C-32. This bill, it should be pointed out, concerns pollution prevention and the protection of the environment and human health in order to contribute to sustainable development.

It is surprising that the government, after allowing a committee to study amendments for weeks, arrives at report stage and suddenly begins to table motions concerning vital sectors such as

pollution prevention, toxic waste, substance exports, vehicle, engine and equipment emissions, and so on.

We can see the government did not structure this bill properly from the start so that, finally, in Canada, Quebec and the other provinces might have the elements they need to enable them to oversee environment policy within their jurisdiction.

Throughout the process, I could not help but notice this government really did not want to act. It spent its time saying "We will endeavour". In life, either you act or you do not. I note that this government does not honour areas of jurisdiction under its own Constitution.

It is curious that today a member of the Bloc Québécois is telling a Liberal government that it should honour its own Constitution. As a sovereignty party, we think that sovereignty within legislation that must be properly implemented begins with agreements with the authorities that are best able to make decisions and are closest to the real problems of the individuals and the society in general.

• (1310)

I cannot help but note that this government did not even deign to act. In the first version of Bill C-32 studied in committee, the government claimed to want to act, to want to do things. I thought that was good, and I took part to give them a hand so that the legislation on environment and protection would be good. As the days, weeks and months passed, they changed the word "act" to "perhaps". They said "We will perhaps act" to justify their inaction.

I note that, since this government took office, it has cut 40% of the budget of the Department of the Environment. These are the very Liberal members today, in this House, who let the government act.

Right now, there is a dearth of inspectors and money to enforce the present environmental legislation. There is a lack of consistency. They cannot agree among themselves. What is this? The government wants to regain control over all things provincial and do things its way.

Had it known what it wanted, it would have made funds available to the Department of the Environment. But that is not what it is doing. In addition, it is leaving the provinces to do the dirty work.

Last week, the member for Lac-Saint-Louis, who is now in the House, had the misfortune to mention the pulp and paper agreements between the Government of Quebec and the federal government.

I will give figures that are quite different from those provided by the member for Lac-Saint-Louis. In 1996, 65 pulp and paper plants in Quebec submitted their annual environmental compliance reports; daily and average SS release limits were respected by 25

plants 99% and 95% of the time; daily and average BOD5 release limits were respected 97% and 94% of the time; daily and average AOX release limits were respected 96% and 93% of the time.

I could provide other figures. It is true that agreements are important, that the federal government should allow the provinces to exercise authority within their own jurisdictions.

Giving out inaccurate information proves that it is not the Bloc Québécois that is hurting the government's image but the government itself, by failing to take action. If it were to actually do something, we would be working together—as we did in committee during the clause by clause analysis—towards fair and equitable legislation that would be a model for the world.

**Mr. Clifford Lincoln (Lac-Saint-Louis, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, I did not intend to speak to this group of amendments, but in response to the comments by my colleague from Jonquière, for whom I have a great deal of respect for his work in committee, I would like to point out that the pulp and paper statistics I quoted the other day for Quebec came from the report by the environment commissioner himself, which was tabled last week here in parliament.

These figures speak volumes. They show that in 1995, 1996, and 1997, if memory serves, there were deficient or problematical mills in 1995, 15 mills in 1996 and, I think, 27 in 1997. The figures may vary from year to year. Problematical mills for these three years add up to a total of 45. There was only one prosecution over those three years, according to the commissioner.

• (1315)

He also reported that Quebec had said that corrective action would be taken. In fact, this is a report to the federal government, stating something along the following “You sign agreements, make certain arrangements, but if the others who have signed these agreements—in this case, the province of Quebec—do not manage to get anything done under these agreements, what do you do?”

The commissioner pointed out that the federal government had not been able to produce the remedial reports it was supposed to in connection with the problems found in these plants. His report makes this very clear.

I am not the one saying this, the commissioner is in his official report. If the Government of Quebec does not agree with the commissioner, let it settle things with him.

The commissioner also indicated that the Government of Quebec was not the only one involved, as I also pointed out in my speech. In the case of the governments of Saskatchewan and Alberta, there had never been reports produced on the delegation of the Fisheries Act which, under section 36, as hon. members are aware, is

### *Government Orders*

administered by the Department of the Environment. There is a delegation of powers here as well, and the Alberta and Saskatchewan departments of the environment are not even required to table the reports to the federal government demanded by this section. The commissioner said that also.

This does not come from me. If the figures are incorrect, the governments of Quebec, Alberta or Saskatchewan just have to blame the environment commissioner.

Personally, I am willing to accept the figures and the statistics made public by the environment commissioner because he would not have made them public without making a thorough investigation. The figures are clear, and that is what is happening.

What I wanted to show is that many members of the Bloc Québécois have been saying that everything is always wonderful in Quebec and that all the problems are at the federal level. I admit there are problems at the federal level. It is clear from our comments in the Standing Committee on the Environment and Sustainable Development that we are not trying to hide the problems that exist at the federal level. That is what the commissioner did, which is what I wanted to point out. But, at the same time, we cannot say everything is fine at the provincial level and everything is bad at the federal level. We always hear the same tune.

The commissioner wanted to say very clearly, with regard to the delegation of powers, that we delegate to the provinces, which, in turn, delegate to everybody else. Budget cuts are being made on top of the ones made by Environment Canada, and the big losers are the environment and human health because, as I said, the fox is in charge of the chicken coop. That is what is happening with this hasty and excessive delegation of powers, and that is all I wanted to point out.

[*English*]

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Thibeault):** Pursuant to order made on Thursday, May 27, the divisions on the proposed motions in Group No. 5 are deemed demanded and deferred.

[*Translation*]

The House will now proceed to the debate on the motions in Group No. 6.

Pursuant to order adopted on Thursday, May 27, 1999, the motions in Group No. 6 are deemed to have been moved and seconded.

[*English*]

This group contains Motions Nos. 36 to 38, 41, 70 and 73.

**Mr. Rick Laliberte (Churchill River, NDP)** moved:

*Government Orders*

Motion No. 36

That Bill C-32, in Clause 43, be amended by adding after line 14 on page 26 the following:

““areas that are reasonably accessible to children” include homes, schools, day care centres, shopping malls, movie theatres, beaches and parks.”

Motion No. 37

That Bill C-32, in Clause 43, be amended by adding after line 14 on page 26 the following:

““environmental pollutant” means a substance that endangers the health, safety or welfare of humans or animal life, degrades or alters, or forms part of a process of degradation or alteration of, an ecosystem to an extent that is detrimental to its use by humans, animals or plants.”

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.)** moved:

Motion No. 38

That Bill C-32, in Clause 43, be amended by replacing lines 17 to 24 on page 26 with the following:

““hormone disrupting substance” means an exogenous substance that causes adverse health effects in an intact organism or its progeny, consequent to changes in endocrine function.”

**Mr. Rick Laliberte (Churchill River, NDP)** moved:

Motion No. 41

That Bill C-32, in Clause 44, be amended by adding after line 24 on page 28 the following:

“(5) The Ministers shall conduct research or studies relating to a safer environment for children and shall (a) identify environmental pollutants commonly used or found in areas that are reasonably accessible to children; (b) create a list that has been reviewed by a team of scientists of environmental pollutants identified under paragraph (a) to have known, probable, or suspected health risks to children; (c) create a scientifically reviewed list of safer-for-children substances and products recommended by the Ministers for use in areas that are reasonably accessible to children and that will minimize potential risks to children from exposure to environmental pollutants; (d) establish guidelines to help reduce and eliminate the exposure of children to environmental pollutants in areas reasonably accessible to children, including advice on how to establish an integrated environmental pollutant reduction program; (e) create a family right-to-know information kit that includes a summary of helpful information and guidance to families, including the list created under paragraph (c), the guidelines established under paragraph (d), information on the potential health effects of environmental pollutants, practical suggestions on how parents may reduce their children’s exposure to environmental pollutants and other relevant information, as determined by the Ministers; (f) make all information gathered under this subsection available to governments and the public; and (g) review and update the lists created under paragraphs (b) and (c) at least every two years.”

Motion No. 70

That Bill C-32, in Clause 67, be amended by replacing line 4 on page 41 with the following:

“the property or characteristic; and (e) respecting the guidelines, conditions and procedures relating to compliance to be followed, in relation to the property on characteristic of the substance, in areas that are reasonably accessible to children, to ensure a safer environment for children.”

Motion No. 73

That Bill C-32, in Clause 68, be amended by replacing line 24 on page 42 with the following:

“substance in the environment; and (d) correlate and evaluate any data collected or generated under paragraph (a) that would allow quantification and evaluation of child-specific and other vulnerable subpopulation-specific susceptibility to the exposure to and bioaccumulation of the substance present or released into the environment.”

● (1320)

[*Translation*]

**Ms. Jocelyne Girard-Bujold (Jonquière, BQ):** Madam Speaker, it is a pleasure to stand up once more in this Chamber to address the motions in Group No. 6. That group is made of Motions Nos. 36 to 38, 41, 70 and 73. They relate to hormone disrupting substances.

During the clause by clause study of the bill in committee, the Bloc Québécois approved the redefinition of those substances. That is why we cannot support Motions Nos. 36, 37, 41, 70 and 73, that the hon. member for Churchill put forward in the name of his party.

If they were adopted, these motions would give the federal government additional powers in areas outside its jurisdiction through clauses 43 and 45 of the act. For example, all things concerning children are under provinces’ jurisdiction. With those amendments the federal government could have a say about homes, schools, daycare facilities and the like. These areas are of no concern to the Minister of the Environment.

We are in a situation where several hon. members would like to reduce the powers of the provinces by giving the federal government exclusive jurisdiction in certain areas. Again, this is the bad habit of centralization through national standards with the objective of getting one’s hands on what belongs to others.

As for Motion No. 38, proposed by the hon. member for Nanaimo—Alberni, we cannot support it. Members of the Bloc do not accept the vision underlying this motion which narrows the definition of hormone disrupting substance by redefining it in very vague terms.

With that motion, the Reform Party is showing its true colours, in that it does not think that we need environmental protection legislation. Reformers think that we would be better off without such legislation. Everybody could do as he or she pleases and taxpayers would save money.

Throughout the committee hearings, every time we were dealing with the crucial amendments needed to set the course straight and tell the government: “You have cut the environment budget enough. You no longer have enough inspectors to enforce the current legislation”. Every time we did something to get things

moving, to provide a more specific framework, Reform members were against it. They wanted to ensure freedom of choice. But enough is enough.

As I have shown by putting forward 41 amendments in Group No. 2, we firmly believe that the provinces, including Quebec, have greater knowledge of the specifics of their natural environment and are in a position to arouse the interest and encourage the participation of local residents, are more open to the claims of environmental groups, are able to conclude significant agreements with national and international partners and lastly have indicated their desire to find solutions to environmental challenges and to contribute actively to sustainable development.

Before the Kyoto summit, it was impossible to find out what was the federal government's vision, its action plan. In 1997, all of the provincial ministers of the Environment attended a meeting.

• (1325)

They submitted a common proposal to the federal government. It expressed their vision and they wanted the federal government to bring it to Kyoto.

They had accomplished quite a feat. All provincial environment ministers had finally sat at the same table and reached an agreement. This was too much for the federal government; finally, there was a coalition. The ten provinces, gathered around the same table, were telling the federal government "That is it". But the federal government, and Liberal members in particular, are quite touchy.

What did they do? When they arrived in Kyoto, they took a completely opposite position. At last, the Canadian government could have had some influence on the international scene. It could have taken a strong position, with the support of the ten provinces. But it preferred to continue the tradition: what comes from the outside is not acceptable to this government.

I am not trying to impute motives here but the more I study the environment issue, the more I see this government acting just like the Reform Party. The member for Palliser mentioned the following in his speech last week "The Liberal Party spends the other 23 hours and 15 minutes—after the 45 minutes each day at question period when Liberal cabinet ministers, one after another, stand to condemn the Reform Party for all things that are wrong with this country—doing the business of the Reform Party in producing very bad legislation for this country".

I believe we could have introduced a truly progressive act. We were prepared to do so. We wanted to finally have an act dealing with urgent problems. Unfortunately, the centralizing approach of this government, based on its policy of double social security net for environmental protection, has been disappointing.

This is why we will be voting against Group No. 6 amendments.

### *Government Orders*

[English]

**Hon. Charles Caccia (Davenport, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, I rise to make an intervention to express an interest and a positive feeling in relation to Motions Nos. 41 and 70 proposed by the hon. member for Churchill River.

Motion No. 41 is a very forward-looking legislative thought because the Minister of the Environment and Minister of Health would be required to take certain actions, such as conducting research or developing guidelines in relation to environmental pollutants that might be harmful to children.

Motion No. 70 would broaden powers by allowing the development of regulations respecting substances to ensure a safer environment for children.

In both cases, the member for Churchill River, quite rightly, recognizes the fact, established in the case of lead for instance, that children are much closer to pollutants than adults when there are pollutants in the air and therefore ought to be given particular protection considering their sensitivity, their delicate nature and that they are in a development stage.

The member for Churchill River ought to be congratulated for taking the initiative that he has taken.

I would like to express the hope that the government will listen and take into account these two particular propositions by the member for Churchill River, who has certainly expressed a concern that is very timely and very well integrated with the overall thrust of a government that seems to put particular emphasis on the well-being of children.

• (1330)

**Mr. John Herron (Fundy—Royal, PC):** Madam Speaker, it is my pleasure to speak to the Canadian Environmental Protection Act and the amendments in Group No. 6. A few of the amendments were put forward by our Reform colleagues as well as by the member for Churchill River. I would like to highlight these at this time.

In Motion No. 38 Reform is attempting to alter the definition of endocrine disrupters included in the information gathering section of the bill to the Weybridge definition.

**Ms. Paddy Torsney:** Madam Speaker, I rise on a point of order. For clarification are we still on Group No. 5?

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Thibeault):** No, we are now discussing Group No. 6.

**Mr. John Herron:** Madam Speaker, during the committee hearings we often saw that the parliamentary secretary was a step

*Government Orders*

behind in some of the amendments throughout the clause by clause process. This actually replicates what we saw on an ongoing basis.

This replies to the issue with respect to the Reform and the government side on the Canadian Environmental Protection Act and endocrine disrupters. There has been a bit of debate about what is the accepted definition for these very harmful substances. I would like to point out that had it not been for the due diligence of members like the member for Lac-Saint-Louis, the member for York North, the member for Davenport, the NDP, the Bloc and the Progressive Conservatives, I doubt that there would have been the political pressure for any amendments with respect to endocrine disrupters in this bill.

This is an emerging science. There is no truly accepted international definition. A definition was exposed at the Weybridge conference a number of years ago and which a number of scientists in the international community actually saw. There is a definition in the United States Environmental Protection Act.

Essentially the definition we see here, which was moved by the NDP and was voted on and approved by the Bloc, the Progressive Conservatives and some government members, is a melange of the U.S. EPA and the Weybridge definitions. To use the words of the environment officials, it is indeed a very workable definition.

The Reform Party would have us believe that the Weybridge definition is internationally accepted. It is not. That definition came out of an OECD meeting held in Weybridge, U.K. A melange of the U.S. EPA and the Weybridge definitions is what is in the information gathering section of CEPA. The environment officials consider it to be very workable.

Canada is already a world leader in endocrine disrupters research. The definition we chose to work with should reflect our strength and knowledge of these substances. The NDP motions will add the need for the government to conduct research relating to a safer environment for children by identifying pollutants commonly found in areas accessible to children and identifying the risks in order to advise the public of potential danger. This is a good initiative for the well-being of children.

Children grow at a faster rate than adults do. The ongoing development of their organs makes them especially vulnerable to toxins in our environment. The nervous system in particular can be greatly affected by exposure to some toxins. We need to do more to ensure that they are protected from dangerous contaminants where they live, play and grow.

The metabolic pathways of newborns are not as sophisticated as those found in adults. This means their ability to fight off exposure to toxins in the environment is less than that of adults. They experience greater exposure to toxins than adults do because they consume more water, fruit and vegetables and when resting breathe more air than average adults do. Their tendency to place their dirty

hands in their mouths and play on the ground also provides them with a greater risk of exposure to environmental toxins.

• (1335)

Parents, doctors and governments need to be educated on the risks children are being exposed to on a daily basis. This is why we support the motion by my NDP friend and colleague from Churchill River. It is a valuable augmentation to the legislation. I encourage all members of this House to support that amendment.

**Mr. Rick Laliberte (Churchill River, NDP):** Madam Speaker, it is appropriate that we are dealing with Bill C-32 at this time. This is the beginning of environment week in Canada. The environment should be of utmost priority.

The group of amendments before us will strengthen the environmental protection of this country, its citizens and its whole biodiversity. The motions in Group No. 6 deal specifically with children. We have had great debate over this past year on Bill C-32.

The Canadian population has seen our environment experience major drastic changes and effects from pollution, toxic substances, pesticides and biotechnology. The growth of the industrial revolution and its impact on our environment, our livelihood and our health is coming to a point where we have to be very cautious of what we do in the future. If we are not cautious the children will be responsible for cleaning up the mess that we leave. We are cleaning up what the previous generation left us and we would hate to be responsible for leaving a mess for our children to clean up.

The motions in Group No. 6 challenge the federal ministers of health and the environment. As my hon. colleagues from the Bloc have highlighted, this may contradict their belief that federal and provincial responsibilities are the main question in their decision. I would beg all members of the House to look at the vulnerability of our children first. Let us put aside our federal and provincial differences. Let us put aside our partisan differences in the House and look at the vulnerability of our children as a whole. Let us look at our own homes, our children and grandchildren. Let us look at the role we hope to see ourselves play as grandparents in the future.

If we do not specify the uniqueness of our children and their vulnerability, we will have missed our responsibility as parliamentarians and as parents. Even before children are born and their growth pattern starts, they are immediately exposed by their mother's responsibility of providing food and drink. As our children are growing and developing we sometimes do not detect the effects of the many toxins and substances they are exposed to. We assume it is their natural growing and development curve.

If adults were exposed to the same toxins and are poisoned or affected neurologically in terms of behaviour or physically in terms of their organs, they would see a sudden change in that pattern.

*Government Orders*

They would look to their doctors for an analysis because they would know that something was drastically wrong. They would go to clinics and ask for help and seek advice from nurses.

Children cannot speak for themselves. We cannot find out what substances have been causing major changes in neurological and behaviour disorders, the function of their organs and their growing patterns. Children do not know if something is wrong. We naturally accept their growth and development to be the same as other children.

• (1340)

As the hon. member for Fundy Royal mentioned, pound for pound children consume more water, food and air than adults do so we have to take special care. The amendments we have put forward specifically look at the areas children inhabit, such as playgrounds and school yards. They may be adjacent to major industries and manufacturing companies. If the provincial and federal health and environment ministers send their information gathering officers out and they only take samples in general throughout the whole community they may overlook specific needs.

They may not look at swimming pools or waterslides. With temperatures like today's their use will rise during the summer. Children do not think about what kind of substances they are exposed to in swimming pools or at the many beaches, lakes and cottages where people seek a haven with a clean environment and clean air. Some waterways are affected by certain industries and if they go undetected there are drastic impacts.

We are looking at specific sites and recommending that due respect be given to the vulnerability of children. We must not overlook it. We must take our responsibility very seriously that we do not put them at risk.

Another contentious issue I bring forward is the leadership of our country on the environment. A recent report from the commissioner of the environment said that the government has done well in providing guidance and being in the lead of making press releases of initiatives but when it comes to action there is a major gap. Press releases and press conferences have highlighted what is going to happen and what hopefully will happen but when it comes to getting the budgets, the resources and the personnel to make it happen, that is where the major weakness is in the Liberal government's leadership.

That is why I call for time to reflect at this time. Let us make sure that the provisions of the act are strengthened. Let us make sure the protection of our children and children's specific issues are highlighted in the bill.

This past week we received a highlight of a major conference in New York. It was specifically on the impact of the environment on children and their specific health issues. The Government of Canada must take leadership on these issues and call on the provincial and municipal governments, the health leadership of this

country to create a dialogue about what specific issues have to be discussed.

Bill C-32 is on its way if the amendments do not diminish any of the strong clauses. Common sense prevailed through the committee process and it strengthened the bill. If this bill survives that whole process, this bill should be enacted and brought forward. It would give leadership to the people, the parents, the teachers, the health care workers, the caregivers and provide them with an opportunity to contribute. A lot of this could be driven on the needs of the children. That is what the provisions in Group No. 6 highlight.

We did not have an opportunity to speak on Group No. 5. We recognize that a lot of the amendments were concordance of the French and English translations, but there were substantive changes. We draw attention to a concern we have on the issue of interpretation and the law for loopholes because this will be a legal document.

Be careful on some of the amendments. They may look like housekeeping amendments but the government has proven to be untrustworthy in many cases through its record on environment. We will try to make it accountable right to the bitter end to make sure that the health and safety of Canadians, and specifically our children, are covered under Bill C-32.

• (1345)

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.):** Madam Speaker, there are six amendments in Group No. 6. Five of them are from the NDP and one is put forward by Reform.

Our amendment, Motion No. 38, deals with the definition of endocrine disrupters in clause 43. When we talk of endocrine disrupters many Canadians today are still uncertain as to what they are. This is for a very good reason. Hormone disrupters is a relatively new concept that has only come to light in recent years. It is still a matter of intense study and research. Hormone disrupting substances were first made popular by Theo Colborn in his book, *Our Stolen Future*, published around three years ago.

Hormones are produced and released into the blood stream by a variety of glands. Hormones are essential for regulating many of our biological processes. They guide the development of sexual characteristics, the immune and nervous systems, the brain, and behavioural characteristics.

Our hormones and our glands together make up our endocrine system. That is what we have been talking about: the endocrine system, our hormones and our glands. Hormone disrupters allegedly disrupt the endocrine system and may cause birth defects, cancer, genetic damage or even death. This is now a matter of international study and research.

As I stated when addressing the Group No. 4 amendments, when Bill C-32 was originally tabled in the House it contained a

*Government Orders*

definition of hormone disrupters which was consistent with the internationally accepted definition. This working definition of endocrine disrupters was adopted by the OECD in the United Kingdom in December 1996.

Unfortunately some members of the standing committee voted to come up with a new definition of hormone disrupters. This new definition puts Canada at a disadvantage as we will be out of step with the rest of the world. Canada should move forward in unison with the rest of the world to tackle key emerging endocrine issues. However, as our definition will be inconsistent we will not benefit as well from research and studies conducted elsewhere. Similarly our results and experience will not benefit others in the international community. Canada will benefit little, if at all, by going on its own in this very serious issue.

In conclusion, there is one significant amendment in this group which must be considered, and that is to ensure that Canada's definition of endocrine disrupting substances is consistent with that of the rest of the world.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Réginald Bélair (Timmins—James Bay, Lib.):** Madam Speaker, in 1995, when it reviewed the Canadian Environmental Protection Act, the Standing Committee on the Environment and Sustainable Development wrote "The government cannot protect the environment on its own, and it should not be expected to do so. Everybody has an interest in a healthy, clean and safe environment, and has a role to play in the protection of our environment".

Bill C-32 reflects the philosophy that protecting the environment is everybody's responsibility. It puts the emphasis on partnership with other governments in Canada and abroad in order to address common issues.

But governments cannot act alone, and the duties of the federal government as set out in Bill C-32 provide that it should encourage the participation of the people of Canada in the making of decisions that affect the environment, and facilitate the protection of the environment by the people of Canada.

Let me describe briefly how Bill C-32 translates these general duties in specific opportunities for public participation.

We want Canadians to know how their environment is faring.

● (1350)

Under Bill C-32, the minister may continue to publish reports on the state of the environment and is legally bound to publish the national inventory of releases of pollutants. This is how Canadians will know exactly what quantities of pollutants have been released in their own community.

However, the information is of no use if people cannot use it and have ready access to it. This provision requires the establishment of an environmental registry to facilitate access to these documents and to all other documents relating to the present bill, including notices of the periods set for the public to gather observations and to obtain a permit; intergovernmental agreements; objectives, directives and codes of practice; and, finally, the regulations under the Canadian Environmental Protection Act. The government also intends to add the Registry to the Internet to make it even more accessible.

Access to information on the environment does not simply just encourage public dialogue on environmental issues, it is vital as well to ensure enlightened participation in decision-making.

This bill also makes participation in decision-making easier by ensuring individuals always have the right to present a notice of opposition to a proposed regulation and by increasing avenues of intervention to include the right to make observations on the scientific merit of evaluations done to determine whether a substance is toxic and to make observations on proposed equivalence agreements and on agreements regarding the creation of legislation between the federal government and other governments in Canada.

The public must know the government takes their observations into account. This then is why Bill C-32 sets out clearly the minister's obligation to report on measures taken in response to such observations.

Bill C-32 also recognises that there are circumstances in which the public should be able to demand direct actions. It gives individuals the right to call for an investigation when, in their opinion, the CEPA has been infringed. This legislation will require the minister to be more accountable, because he will be obliged to periodically report the progress of the study.

Measures have also been taken in this bill to ensure that individuals reporting violations of the CEPA may do so without appear of reprisal. These individuals may ask that their identity be protected, and anyone revealing the identity of a whistleblower is committing an offence. This bill as well provides protection to people providing information at the work place: anyone found harassing, disciplining or dismissing an employee who has reported a violation of the CEPA is committing an offence.

Bill C-32 contains a new right allowing an individual who did not personally suffer a prejudice to bring an action against someone who is alleged to have violated the Canadian Environmental Protection Act.

The provisions granting this new right were drafted with great care to avoid frivolous actions. For example, the claimant can only bring an action after having asked the minister to launch an investigation on the alleged offence, and only if the measures contemplated by the minister following the investigation to ensure



compliance with CEPA or its regulations are unreasonable and the offence caused material injury to the environment.

To avoid having such actions being brought by “bounty hunters” trying to get rich, Bill C-32 explicitly limits the payment of damages. These provisions thus have the effect of preventing someone from bringing an action for the purpose of making money. However, the claimant may recover costs incurred for any investigation into the case and for the action.

• (1355)

Bill C-32 is a sincere effort to meet the expectations of the public, which wants to play a greater role in the protection of its environment. It is groundbreaking legislation on the rights of citizens, and we expect this House to give it the consideration that it deserves and to pass it as quickly as possible.

**The Speaker:** We will now proceed to Statements by Members.

---

## STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

[English]

### CROHN'S AND COLITIS FOUNDATION OF CANADA

**Mr. Lynn Myers (Waterloo—Wellington, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the Crohn's and Colitis Foundation of Canada is a voluntary, not for profit medical research foundation dedicated to finding the cure for Crohn's disease, ulcerative colitis and inflammatory bowel disease. There is no known cause or cure and there are an estimated 100,000 men and women in Canada suffering from IBD. People are most frequently diagnosed between the ages of 15 to 25.

The CCFC funds educational programs for health professionals, IBD patients and their families. To date the CCFC has invested more than \$21 million in major research projects.

This year marked the 11th time 260 M & M meat shops fired up their barbecues in their various communities in Canada for the annual fundraiser. This event nationwide raised \$702,000 this year,

*S. O. 31*

which now totals an astounding \$4 million. I congratulate the M & M meat shops across Canada for doing all that they do in this area.

\* \* \*

### PROSTATE CANCER

**Mr. Ted White (North Vancouver, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, last Wednesday Mr. Jim Pattison, perhaps B.C.'s most well known and respected entrepreneur, pledged \$20 million to help fund the Vancouver prostate cancer research team headed by Dr. Larry Goldenberg. The team also includes Dr. Martin Gleave who helped me with the Prostate Cancer Awareness Day for MPs which was held on the Hill in March 1998.

Thanks to the dedication of professionals like Dr. Goldenberg and the generosity of Jim Pattison, work on finding a cure for prostate cancer can proceed in Canada at a level that was previously only dreamed about.

The fact remains, though, that Mr. Pattison pledged more funding for prostate cancer research in one afternoon than the health minister has promised over five years, even though prostate cancer kills as many men as breast cancer kills women.

In the light of last Wednesday's announcement, I urge the minister to revisit his medical research priorities list and to significantly increase funding for prostate cancer research.

\* \* \*

### CANADIAN VOLUNTEER ADVISERS TO BUSINESS

**Mr. Bryon Wilfert (Oak Ridges, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, today I acknowledge the outstanding efforts of one of my constituents, Mr. Tom Gibson.

Accompanied by his wife Betty, he went on assignment to Lithuania with the Canadian Volunteer Advisers to Business. He spent six weeks in Vilnius, advising the municipality of the establishment of a tourism advisory board and preparing a business plan for the tourism department.

He drafted a constitution for the board modelled on Ontario bylaws and proposed the list of initial members. He developed the composition, duties and responsibilities of the board and contact associations, indirect suppliers and allied organizations.

Mr. Gibson expects the result of his work will be improved working relations between the municipality and the tourism industry. I ask the House to join me in congratulating Mr. Gibson for his fine work as a volunteer for the Canadian Volunteers Advisers to Business in this, its 31st year of service.

*S. O. 31*

## THE ENVIRONMENT

**Ms. Paddy Torsney (Burlington, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, it is my pleasure to rise today to celebrate Canadian Environment Week. The theme this year is community action on clean air and climate change. June 2 marks the first Clean Air Canada Day. Each year the Wednesday of environment week, starting this year, will celebrate Clean Air Day Canada.

I encourage all Canadians to pay particular attention to two of the many environmental priorities of the government: improving the quality of air Canadians breathe and addressing climate change by reducing greenhouse gas emissions. All of us have the chance on Wednesday to join environmental, health and transportation groups in promoting the activities these individuals engage in all year, and especially during May and June.

The Canadian commuter challenge involves Victoria, Vancouver, Calgary, London, and the national capital region. These cities are in competition to reduce air pollution and greenhouse gases by finding healthier ways to commute. Other cities will have other activities.

• (1400)

In celebration of environment week, please join me in encouraging all Canadians to participate in clean air activities. Walk to work on Wednesday, ride the—

**The Speaker:** The hon. member for Abitibi—Baie-James—Nunavik.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

## CANADA POST

**Mr. Guy St-Julien (Abitibi—Baie-James—Nunavik, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, Canada Post has just provided us with its performance report for the fiscal year that ended in March 1999.

Canada Post is the first postal administration in the world to have the quality of its service checked by a third party and to make the results public.

The service performance objectives set for the 1998-99 fiscal year were higher than those for the previous year. For the first time, the auditors were able to measure the performance of Canada Post in rural areas as well.

Despite the higher standards it had set for itself, Canada Post delivered 97% of local mail, 97% of regional mail, and 96% of national mail in a timely manner.

Congratulations to Canada Post, the Hon. André Ouellet and all the employees who have put so much effort into improving the service. Keep up the good work serving the people of Canada.

[English]

## IMPAIRED DRIVING

**Mr. Richard M. Harris (Prince George—Bulkley Valley, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, drunk drivers kill over 1,400 people a year and injure over 60,000. It is a tragic and senseless crime.

The Standing Committee on Justice and Human Rights last week presented a report and draft legislation aimed at fighting impaired driving. All parties on the committee agreed that the legislation would go a long way to fight this senseless crime and agreed to fast track it to get it done before the summer recess.

Now Bloc members are threatening to hold up the process, to kill the fast track and perhaps kill the bill. Maybe they should try to justify their actions to the families of the victims of Silvain Bwah. Maybe they should do that.

I urge the government to introduce this drunk driver bill immediately to ensure that this session does not end without us taking a giant step in the fight against impaired driving.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

## WORLD NO TOBACCO DAY

**Ms. Carolyn Bennett (St. Paul's, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, today is World No Tobacco Day.

[English]

I rise today to speak on the occasion of World No Tobacco Day. Youth smoking rates in Canada have increased by 25% since 1991 and recent figures show that half a million Canadian teenagers are daily smokers.

Tobacco kills approximately 3.5 million people a year worldwide, 10,000 per day. This afternoon the Canadian Society for International Health and the Pan American Health Organization will be hosting a public forum on Parliament Hill to discuss the nicotine issue and new approaches to cessation.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank all of the panellists: David Sweanor, senior legal counsel for the Non-Smokers' Rights Association, Dr. Andrew Pipe and Dr. Robert Reid from the University of Ottawa Heart Institute, and Dr. Mark Taylor, President of Physicians for a Smoke-Free Canada. I would also like to thank Janet Hatcher Roberts, the executive director of the Canadian Society for International Health, and Maureen Johnson, also of CSIH, for their help.

This is not just a Liberal issue, a government issue or even a Canadian issue. This is a world problem and I hope that I can count on all of my colleagues for their help.

*S. O. 31*

[*Translation*]

### NATURAL GAS RESOURCES

**Mr. Paul Crête (Kamouraska—Rivière-du-Loup—Témiscouata—Les Basques, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, the Quebec and New Brunswick ministers of natural resources recently agreed to begin negotiating without delay an agreement to give their markets expanded access to the Sable Island natural gas resources, thus creating conditions favorable to the completion of a 550 kilometer gas infrastructure.

This project will enable Quebec to ensure greater security of supply and to enjoy major economic benefits.

When the federal government authorized the line toward New England, it deprived Eastern Quebec and Northern New Brunswick of a strong competitive advantage.

\* \* \*

[*English*]

### TAXATION

**Mr. Monte Solberg (Medicine Hat, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, we have always known that money talks and high taxes make Canadians walk, but now we have direct evidence that the low tax policies of the Harris government in Ontario are contributing to national unity, unlike the cupboard love, flag waving and neglect offered by this tax and spend and then tax some more federal Liberal government.

Even our friends in the Bloc, who are encouraged to live in Quebec as a gesture of loyalty, are considering packing the moving vans and heading across the river to Ottawa to take advantage of Ontario's attractive low tax rates.

The lesson for the government is that cutting taxes would be an obvious good start to building a strong and united Canada. If low taxes will attract sovereignists to Ontario, when is the government going to figure out that low federal taxes will keep Quebecers in Canada?

The Harris government should be congratulated for its unwavering commitment to lower taxes to stimulate Ontario's economy. It goes to show that despite political and regional differences one thing unites us all: low taxes.

\* \* \*

● (1405)

### KUWAIT

**Mr. Mac Harb (Ottawa Centre, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, Kuwait is marking the new millennium in a special way. Recently the Kuwait cabinet and Emir made a historic decision that gave women the right to vote and run for office for the first time.

While Kuwait had many women in senior public and private sector positions, they were not able to fully participate in the democratic process.

On behalf of my colleagues in parliament and all Canadians, I would like to congratulate Ambassador Majdi Al-Dhafiri, his government and the people of Kuwait on this historic human rights decision.

\* \* \*

### HUMAN RIGHTS

**Ms. Libby Davies (Vancouver East, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, today the Prime Minister is hosting Andres Pastrana, the president of Colombia, while in that country massive atrocities continue as its population is subjected to horrific human rights violations, disappearances and murder.

If one is a labour leader or an activist, one's life is in peril. If one does not agree with the establishment, one may disappear. Even if one happens to be in the wrong place at the wrong time, one is at risk.

The federal NDP stands in solidarity with the people of Colombia, and we say to the Prime Minister and the Canadian government "Stop the killing". Tell Pastrana that the 2,700 trade unionists who have been killed since 1987 is unconscionable and justice must be done.

The Canadian Council of Churches Tribunal and Amnesty International have massive evidence of the brutality and murders. Today the Canadian government, in meetings with the Colombian president, must make it clear that under international law the Government of Colombia must be held accountable.

\* \* \*

[*Translation*]

### WORLD NO TOBACCO DAY

**Mrs. Pauline Picard (Drummond, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, today is World No Tobacco Day.

While we must all delight at the passage of strong legislation to counteract the ill effects of smoking, we must be able to implement the laws we pass. On the weekend, Health Canada acknowledged that it was having difficulty ensuring compliance with its anti-smoking legislation, because of a lack of inspectors. In Quebec, one corner store in two complies with the law by refusing to sell cigarettes to minors.

At home, as in the rest of Canada, the job is not easy. While the federal government is currently carrying out consultations on the various options open to it on regulations concerning the promotion of tobacco products, it must ensure that the measures are realistic and that it can properly put them into effect. Otherwise, the legislator's efforts to reduce the ill effects of smoking will be for naught. They will be fruitless.

*S. O. 31**[English]***ANNAPOLIS COUNTY SENIORS SAFETY PROGRAM**

**Mr. Mark Muise (West Nova, PC):** Mr. Speaker, over the past three years Annapolis County senior citizens have experienced an added sense of security as a result of a unique seniors safety program that was introduced by the Bridgetown RCMP detachment.

Initially designed as a summer project to open the lines of communication between seniors and the local RCMP, the program quickly generated much public support. Many local communities and business leaders, including the Annapolis West Health Foundation and the Soldiers Memorial Hospital Foundation, were instrumental in providing the necessary financial resources to allow the program to operate on a full time basis.

Ms. Sharon Elliott, its energetic program co-ordinator, has personally conducted in-home visits to over 1,700 seniors, providing them with safety information on how to protect themselves against criminal activity, as well as helpful hints on medication storage.

As we salute the United Nations International Year of the Older Person, let us recognize the heroic efforts of the Bridgetown RCMP detachment.

\* \* \*

**NATIONAL DRUG STRATEGY**

**Mr. Randy White (Langley—Abbotsford, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, almost 1,000 people met in Abbotsford, British Columbia last Thursday to discuss and express their concerns about hard drugs in our society.

People across Canada agree that not enough is being done. The government's national drug strategy does not work. It is not working on the street.

I am asking all hon. members of the House to seriously consider putting aside partisan politics to work on how we can best get programs implemented at the local level.

We need more education on the bad effects of illicit drugs. We need much improved rehabilitation initiatives. We need to consider addiction as a serious health concern. We need to seriously penalize non-addicted drug pushers. We need to clean up our prison drug problem. We need to co-ordinate federal, provincial and municipal programs. Most importantly, in the House we need to work together on this program now.

\* \* \*

**WATER QUALITY**

**Mr. Gordon Earle (Halifax West, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, the government continues to issue statements about multiculturalism

and racial equality. At the same time, a small, predominately black community in my riding does not even have a safe and healthy water supply.

• (1410)

The families of Hammonds Plains do not have adequate water, which is abominable in our country in this day and age. What makes it even more striking is the fact that this community borders the lake that supplies fresh water to Halifax and Dartmouth.

The people are drinking from wells where the water has been deemed to be unsafe and unsuitable. People have wells that run dry in the summertime. Quite often they have to call upon the local fire department to deliver water to them.

I trust that with new discussions about funding an infrastructure program this government is fully committed to ensuring it will do whatever is necessary to provide fresh water to the residents of Hammonds Plains.

It comes down to a matter of priorities. I have been pursuing this issue on the federal level. I have tried to seek whatever funds might be available from any of the programs that the federal government might have in the area of health, the environment, heritage and so forth. However, to date I have been unable to secure any meaningful funding from the federal government to assist in this project going ahead. Where does the government put its priorities?

\* \* \*

**GOVERNMENT OF CANADA**

**Mr. Rick Borotsik (Brandon—Souris, PC):** Mr. Speaker, the Liberal government has been in government for six years and it still cannot stop blaming all of its administrative failures on the previous Progressive Conservative government.

Last week in the House the Minister of Finance tried to blame the P.C. government for the current income gap between Canada and the U.S. That would be like blaming a grade six teacher for failing high school.

It is time the Minister of Finance and the federal government took credit for the Liberal accomplishments over the last six years. It is time to take credit for the Pearson airport fiasco, which cost taxpayers \$1 billion. It is time to take credit for the EH-101 cancellation, which cost taxpayers \$1 billion. It is time to take credit for the highest personal income tax levels among the G-7 countries. It is time to take credit for raising taxes 40 times since 1994. It is time to take credit for gutting \$17 billion from the health care budget.

These are Liberal accomplishments over the past six years and it is time they stood and took responsibility.

*Oral Questions*

[Translation]

**SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH**

**Mr. Nick Discepola (Vaudreuil—Soulanges, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, last week the Canadian government announced good news for the Quebec City region, and the scientific world in particular. Laval University will be heading up a Canadian photonics institute and will receive \$13 million in funding over the next three years from the Canadian government.

This institute becomes the 15th centre of excellence to receive funding from the federal government. It will bring together 64 researchers from 22 universities across the country, with Laval University co-ordinating activities as head of the network.

This announcement highlights the region's importance in this sector and is another example of how the Government of Canada is helping Quebec's regions.

\* \* \*

[English]

**SUMMER EMPLOYMENT**

**Mr. Gurbax Singh Malhi (Bramalea—Gore—Malton—Springdale, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, earlier this month I attended the openings of two human resource centres in Brampton and Malton. In my riding the federal government is contributing \$174,572 toward a summer job placement program to help create 101 local summer jobs.

At least 50 local businesses and organizations are involved, including one public sector and 10 non-profit organizations.

Private sector firms offering summer job placements include: Allders International, Davroc Test Labs, Keyes Management, Par Pak, Thomson Terminals, Sommerville Package and West Pro Sales.

I would encourage Canadians to hire some youthful energy this summer by hiring a student.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**STATISTICS CANADA**

**Mr. Pierre de Savoye (Portneuf, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, during a recent appearance before the Standing Committee on Industry, the chief statistician, Ivan Fellegi, said that, when a certain number of people say they are of an ethnic origin not on the agency's list, that ethnic origin is then added.

But by caving in to the "Call me Canadian" political lobby and listing Canadian as an ethnic origin, Statistics Canada has sabotaged the usefulness of the ethnic origin question and wasted taxpayers' money.

Many scientists, including the Association des démographes du Québec, have asked the organization to go back to the 1991 census proposal.

Statistics Canada must put this right. Its reputation as a scientific agency hangs in the balance. Otherwise, by turning the census into a political operation, this federal agency will lose its credibility.

**ORAL QUESTION PERIOD**

• (1415)

[English]

**KOSOVO**

**Mr. Preston Manning (Leader of the Opposition, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, as we all know the tensions in Kosovo are growing every week. Our allies are stepping up their commitments and diplomatic initiatives are at a critical stage. At the same time, the House will be recessing for the summer in a matter of days.

What specific provisions will the Prime Minister make to ensure that parliament is involved in any ongoing discussions or changes to Canada's commitments in the former Yugoslavia?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, we have been discussing that in the House. Every day the opposition has the opportunity to ask questions to the government. We have had many debates on the situation in Kosovo in the last 12 months. When we eventually adjourn, nothing will be different.

The House of Commons has already indicated that it supports the activities of NATO. We want President Milosevic to stop the cleansing, the murdering and the raping. We want to make sure that the Kosovars can go back to their homes in safety and security where they belong.

**Mr. Preston Manning (Leader of the Opposition, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, to date the government has done little or nothing to involve the House in developing Canada's commitments in Yugoslavia.

Most members of the House get more information from television and newspapers than they do from the government on this subject. The government has yet to bring any votable motion at all before the House on this issue.

What more does the government intend to do to involve parliament in a substantive way during the summer recess with respect to this issue?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I can understand that the Leader of the Opposition is not aware of what is going on in his party. We know that very well.

*Oral Questions*

The reality is that twice a week, every week, the members of all parties in the House of Commons receive briefings and everybody is welcome. I do not think that has ever been done before and I am very proud of it.

I understand that the Leader of the Opposition has not been informed by somebody in his own party.

**Mr. Preston Manning (Leader of the Opposition, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, this has gone far beyond the necessity of briefing.

The United States is threatening to send 90,000 troops to the former Yugoslavia in a matter of weeks if no peace settlement is reached. Britain is talking about increasing its commitment to 50,000 troops. It is increasingly likely that NATO will send in ground troops in advance of any peace settlement and Canada is expected to be part of that contingent.

Given that an invasion force could be put together within a few weeks, why is the government not bringing forward a plan and a motion to parliament on that issue now?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, there is no plan to send invasion troops. It has been decided that the troops will be there to maintain security and peace for the Kosovars when there is an agreement. That is why some 800 Canadians are moving there.

We have not received any requests at this time for more troops. At this moment there is no plan for the invasion of Kosovo by anybody.

When the estimates come before the House of Commons on June 9 this question can be raised by the opposition in front of the House.

\* \* \*

**GOVERNMENT GRANTS**

**Mr. Chuck Strahl (Fraser Valley, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, for the last month the Prime Minister has been running from questions about a \$600,000 grant he announced in his own riding just prior to the last election.

He ducked the question about how he could know about this grant before bureaucrats had even seen a business plan for it. He avoided answering questions by getting his human resources minister to pretend that this happens all the time. However, here are the facts: The Prime Minister announced the \$600,000 grant on the eve of an election in his own riding before it had proper governmental approval.

Why did the Prime Minister announce this grant three weeks before the bureaucrats had even seen the business plan?

**Ms. Bonnie Brown (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of Human Resources Development, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the opposition persists in mixing up two proposals from the same proponent

to two different programs HRDC provides. They put forward the proposal for the wage subsidy program which did not require a business plan.

Our officials decided that the proposal being put forward fit better with another program which did require a business plan. Once it was provided that proposal was accepted.

● (1420)

**Mr. Chuck Strahl (Fraser Valley, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, it is nice when they can get money from the government and they do not even have a business plan.

The fact is that this jobs transition fund lends itself to abuse. We have had a Liberal fundraiser indicted for influence peddling under this program. We have had convicted criminals and self-confessed embezzlers receive grant moneys. Now an unregistered lobbyist with close ties to the Prime Minister is being investigated by the RCMP for helping corporations in the Prime Minister's own riding receive additional funds.

The Prime Minister only won his riding by 1,600 votes. Does he think that announcing a grant before it was properly approved helped him or hurt him in the last election campaign?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the people of Saint-Maurice are very happy that the member for Saint-Maurice is doing his job. The member for Saint-Maurice has done exactly the same thing as members of the Reform Party have done with the program in their own ridings. He should ask his own members about it.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**PUBLISHING INDUSTRY**

**Mr. Michel Gauthier (Roberval, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, on Friday, in reply to a question, the Minister of Canadian Heritage said in this House that the Americans had made a written commitment not to react to her subsidy program for Canadian publishers who, as we know, are the big losers in the agreement reached regarding Bill C-55.

My question is for the Minister of Canadian Heritage. How could she make such a statement, considering that a spokesperson from the Canadian Department for International Trade stressed that the promise made by the Americans applies only to Bill C-55, and not to the future subsidy program for Canadian publishers?

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the agreement signed by the Americans was part of the WTO agreement signed ten years ago.

**Mr. Michel Gauthier (Roberval, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, this is a rather obscure reply.

*Oral Questions*

It is clear to everyone that the minister got herself into trouble once again. Contrary to what the minister claimed here on Friday, the Americans did not make any commitment regarding the subsidy program. In the WTO context, there must not be subsidy programs that benefit publishers from one area.

Did the Minister of Canadian Heritage not betray Canadian publishers not once, but twice, by giving the Americans half of the advertising market, in addition to having to share with them the program that she claims to be setting up to help Canadian publishers?

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the hon. member claims there are no WTO rules on subsidy when in fact there is a whole chapter in the WTO documents that were signed by the Americans ten years ago.

**Mrs. Francine Lalonde (Mercier, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, the Minister of Canadian Heritage continues to say that the agreement with the United States is an excellent cultural agreement, which gives the Americans only 18% of the Canadian advertising market.

But we know that 18% of the space in American magazines represents 50% of the market.

By allowing this breach with respect to culture, is Canada not in fact distancing itself from the general position of a number of countries, and of Quebec, which are calling for a broader cultural exemption clause during the next WTO negotiations?

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the cultural policy adopted by the United States following acceptance of Bill C-55 is an admission for the first time in that country's history that we do in fact have the right to treat culture differently.

This must be part of an overall strategy such as we are now implementing with France and other countries, which also think that culture should be accorded special treatment.

**Mrs. Francine Lalonde (Mercier, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, speechifying aside, what credibility will Canada have in Seattle in defending the idea of a general cultural exemption clause, such as Quebec is calling for, when in reality it has just negotiated an important breach in the publishing industry with the United States?

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I think the member has it wrong.

Under WTO rulings, there was no protection for Canadian magazines. Now, with Bill C-55, which I hope will soon be passed in the House, 82% of the Canadian magazine market will be protected.

Why? For one thing, because for the first time in their history, the Americans have agreed that culture is not the same as other

sectors. It is this admission that will set the stage for a good discussion in Seattle at the WTO.

\* \* \*

• (1425)

[English]

**THE ENVIRONMENT**

**Mr. Bill Blaikie (Winnipeg—Transcona, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, my question is for the Prime Minister.

A generation from now Canadians will tell the story of this day in parliament as a time when we had the opportunity to reverse years of wrong-headed thinking on the environment corrupted by industrial self-interest, et cetera.

Will the Prime Minister be the villain or the hero in this story today? Will he make this day a day of new beginnings for the environment, or will it be the same old story? Will the Prime Minister commit his party and his caucus to the idea of a total phase-out of persistent toxins and reject the amendments that have been brought forward that reject the work of the committee which called for phase-out?

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, today is the first day of environment week and the government is very proud of the activities that it will be engaged in to encourage every Canadian across the country to consider how they can contribute to a cleaner environment.

The government, through our renewed CEPA legislation, will be able to act very proactively to assure Canadians cleaner air and cleaner water, something that is very important to our environment and human health.

**Mr. Bill Blaikie (Winnipeg—Transcona, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, all the more shameful that this should happen on the first day of environment week.

I plead with the Prime Minister. The Minister of the Environment has broken every promise the Prime Minister ever made in the red book with respect to the phase-out of persistent toxins. It is up to the Prime Minister to save the day, not just for himself or the government but for future generations, and reinstate the idea of total phase-out of persistent toxins. Will he do that?

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the new Canadian environmental protection legislation is extremely important. It will compel the federal government to analyze 23,000 substances now in use across our country.

The principle of pollution prevention is a very important key to this legislation. For those substances most toxic, the principle of virtual elimination will prevail.

**Mr. John Herron (Fundy—Royal, PC):** Mr. Speaker, the Liberal government's way of celebrating environment week is by

*Oral Questions*

invoking time allocation on report stage of amendments for the Canadian Environmental Protection Act.

This is a government that has very few MPs advocating sound environmental policies, and when they do they are band from taking action. The member for Lac-Saint-Louis, an advocate for strong environmental policies, was denied the right to vote during the committee review of the CEPA by his own government colleagues.

My question is for the Minister of Environment. When can Canadians expect her to end her policy of political doublespeak and demonstrate real leadership on the environmental agenda?

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I am very pleased that we are having this important debate on environmental protection legislation in the House. Canadians have been waiting for over a year of debate in the House to see renewed environmental protection legislation.

The legislation that we will be voting on tonight represents legislation that is a significant improvement over what we have today.

**Mr. John Herron (Fundy—Royal, PC):** Mr. Speaker, my supplementary is for the Prime Minister.

In the words of the Commissioner for the Environment, the government's lack of concern for the environment means "Canadians are paying the price in terms of our health and our legacy to future generations".

What is missing is real leadership and real management. The government has had three environment ministers and six years to pass an environmental bill and Canadians have nothing to show for it.

When will the Prime Minister recognize that when it comes to the environment and human health this is one case where a below par record on the green is not acceptable?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, that is what we are doing. There will be no more talking. We will be voting today on a piece of legislation that has been negotiated with the provinces and debated in committee. It contains 240 amendments.

For those who have said that we have not spent time studying this problem means that they were not in the committees when it was needed.

\* \* \*

**TRANSITIONAL JOBS FUND**

**Mrs. Diane Ablonczy (Calgary—Nose Hill, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, the transitional jobs fund has been quite a windfall for the Liberals.

During the last election it was used to get campaign donations for the Liberal Party. It then allowed the Prime Minister to give megabucks to his former business partner, a self-confessed embezzler of \$1 million. Now we have a Liberal crony, representing the Prime Minister at official functions, who has access to the fund. He can now get even more dollars for projects in the Prime Minister's riding.

Will the Prime Minister explain just how this represents doing a good job in his riding?

• (1430)

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the member stated that a grant was given to a former business associate of mine and it is not true.

There was absolutely not a dollar given to any of my former businesses. The member should withdraw that because it is not true.

**Mrs. Diane Ablonczy (Calgary—Nose Hill, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, is it not interesting that the Prime Minister zeros in on a small point and neglects to mention that this individual bought his money losing hotel and that the Prime Minister's numbered company has its registered office at this business partner's hotel? That is a small point the Prime Minister forgot to mention.

I ask the Prime Minister to explain to the Canadian people, who ante up the money that the Prime Minister is spreading around in such an unusual fashion, how this is justified.

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the riding of Saint-Maurice is entitled to the same programs that benefit the member for Dauphin—Swan River, the member for Kootenay—Columbia, the member for Nanaimo—Alberni, the member for Prince George—Bulkley Valley, and the member for Okanagan—Shuswap.

The member keeps making affirmations that are not factual, but I know she does not have the decency of a normal member of parliament to admit when she is wrong.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**PUBLISHING INDUSTRY**

**Mr. Benoît Sauvageau (Repentigny, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, last week a senior American official stated that the United States could go to the WTO if American publishers were denied access to the Canadian subsidy program. This was confirmed on Friday by a spokesperson for the Department of International Trade.

Does the Minister of International Trade confirm that a subsidy program reserved exclusively for Canadian publishers could in-



*Oral Questions*

fringe upon Canada's international commitments under what is called the national treatment principle?

[English]

**Hon. Sergio Marchi (Minister for International Trade, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, we have always said that Bill C-55 was founded on the services level where we do not have the clause for national treatment to impose on services as opposed to goods.

Also there is a great deal of difference between countries around the world offering assistance or subsidies to domestic industries as long as those products are not for export.

[Translation]

**Mr. Benoît Sauvageau (Repentigny, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, we have no commitment from the American government on the future subsidy program. We know such a program would be likely to infringe upon our international commitments regardless of what the minister says.

Is the cultural agreement of the century, of which the Minister of Canadian Heritage is so proud, not rather the first serious breach in the position of general cultural exemption which the government has always defended in international trade negotiations?

[English]

**Hon. Sergio Marchi (Minister for International Trade, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the Minister of Canadian Heritage said moments ago that there was no cultural exemption at the WTO. That is why we were taken to the panel in the first place.

There was an abdication of rules and that is precisely what the Minister of Canadian Heritage was saying. We got an historic agreement, one that caps their advertising from 100% to 18%, one that for the first time gives us content, and one that encourages additional investment in the publishing industry in Canada. I think by any measure that is a pretty good deal.

\* \* \*

**GOVERNMENT GRANTS**

**Mr. Monte Solberg (Medicine Hat, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, there is no question the Prime Minister is the king of patronage and there is no question that he excels at the art of pork barrel politics. However, when the Prime Minister gave an associate \$600,000 of taxpayers money prior to the last federal election, he took it to a whole new level.

How can the Prime Minister deny that by doing what he did before the last election he made a blatant attempt to buy votes with taxpayers money?

**The Speaker:** We must not impute motive in any way. I see the Prime Minister is on his feet. I would rule the question out of order, but if he wants to answer it he may.

• (1435)

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, they still use the words that are not reality. I have never been associated with anybody and the famous hotel. It was bought for cash. It was a lease that the buyer bought before I became Prime Minister, and he paid cash. The lease was for \$1 and he found the money to pay for it.

**Mr. Monte Solberg (Medicine Hat, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, the facts speak for themselves. The Prime Minister has sullied his office through this dirty deal. There is a huge difference between—

**The Speaker:** Order, please. I want the hon. member to go directly to his question.

**Mr. Monte Solberg:** Mr. Speaker, when will the Prime Minister find the courage to demand that Thibault pay back that money?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, this is a great success. Not only have jobs been created but the person has expanded his project. It was in an area where we have the highest level of unemployment in Canada.

If there is something I should complain about, it is that my own area is among the areas with the highest unemployment in Canada. I will keep fighting and working for them.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**CANADIAN BROADCASTING CORPORATION**

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral (Laval Centre, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, in response to a question in this House on Friday, the Minister of Canadian Heritage confirmed that, as far as she was concerned, quality television had nothing to do with advertising revenues, thus suggesting that the CBC could well do without some of the separate revenues generated through advertising.

Are we to understand from the minister's position that, in her opinion, to have quality programming television must be fully subsidized by the government?

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, what the Bloc Québécois suggested last week was that we ignore the CRTC's policy. We said in this House is that we respect regulatory agencies and that we want the CRTC to do its job.

If we were to act like Quebec did with Télé-Québec, we would no longer have television.

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral (Laval Centre, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, if the Minister of Canadian Heritage suddenly wants a

*Oral Questions*

fully subsidized state television, is it not proof that she is only interested in having full control over the CBC, and that her motto is "Canada my country, the CBC my tool"?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, these are crocodile tears, especially in light of what the Quebec government did to Télé-Québec. There is nothing left at Télé-Québec.

\* \* \*

[English]

**CORRECTIONAL SERVICE CANADA**

**Mr. Randy White (Langley—Abbotsford, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, according to access to information requests, over 1,300 federal prisoners use crack or cocaine while in prison, virtually every day. Another 1,300 while in prison every day use heroin and another 5,400 use marijuana on a daily basis.

The government purports to have a zero tolerance policy for drugs in prison. I ask the solicitor general why it is that drugs are just as easy to get inside prison as they are outside.

**Hon. Lawrence MacAulay (Solicitor General of Canada, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, drugs and addiction are major problems in the country. Seven out of ten people are in our federal penitentiaries as a result of being involved with drugs and alcohol.

I assure my hon. colleague that I make it a major priority to address the drug and alcohol problems in our field institutions.

**Mr. Randy White (Langley—Abbotsford, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, is it the same priority he gave to bus passes, golf, and all the other things he has given?

Of the prisoners in the Pacific region where I live, 46% use drugs while in prison. The Liberals say they have a national drug strategy that works, but it does not work on the streets or in prisons of Canada.

If 46% of prisoners use drugs while in prison, is this zero tolerance policy not a bit of a bad joke over there?

• (1440)

**Hon. Lawrence MacAulay (Solicitor General of Canada, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, as I indicated to my hon. colleague, I am well aware that drugs and alcohol are major problems for our prisoner population. As I indicated I intend to address these problems.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**TAINTED BLOOD**

**Mr. Yvan Loubier (Saint-Hyacinthe—Bagot, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, the Prime Minister's ethics counsellor has been consulted about the conduct of the Minister of Finance with respect to the tainted

blood issue in order to determine whether the minister placed himself in a conflict of interest situation.

My question is for the Prime Minister. Will he agree to release the full text of this report, as soon as his office receives it, so that MPs can examine it?

**Right Hon. Jean Chrétien (Prime Minister, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I see no problem with the counsellor forwarding me his report. In fact, the Minister of Finance himself requested an investigation into whether there had been a conflict of interest. I am certain that there was not, and we will gladly release the counsellor's remarks.

\* \* \*

[English]

**THE ENVIRONMENT**

**Mr. John Harvard (Charleswood St. James—Assiniboia, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, as noted earlier in question period, today is the first day of environment week. We all know that smog and air pollutants are a big problem, especially on hot days like today.

Could the Minister of the Environment tell the House what new measures she is proposing to make sure Canadians breathe clean air?

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, on the first day of environment week I am very pleased to announce that I am instituting gasoline flow rate regulations which will prevent 1,500 tonnes of volatile organic compounds and 15 tonnes of benzene, a known carcinogen and toxic substance, going into the air, at a saving of \$1 million to Canadians.

As well, on Wednesday of this week we will celebrate the first Clean Air Day Canada. I challenge everyone in the Chamber and across Canada to consider how they can contribute to cleaner air not only that day but every day.

\* \* \*

**PUBLISHING INDUSTRY**

**Mr. Inky Mark (Dauphin—Swan River, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, every time the heritage minister opens her mouth, she sucks more tax money from the taxpayers of Canada. Reports estimate that her new magazine deal will cost taxpayers at least \$100 million.

My question for the heritage minister is the same one she refuses to answer. How much will the taxpayers be forking over in subsidies and tax breaks to pay for this new deal?

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the hon. member has to understand one thing I think the Reform Party does not understand. In a country like Canada there is a strong belief that we have two founding peoples, two official languages, and literally hundreds of Canadians of many cultures.

*Oral Questions*

What we want to do is to reinforce those cultures through the federal government, and that is one of the things we have been doing.

They propose that we abolish the Canadian heritage department, which would kill the links that help build this country and make it stronger.

**Mr. Inky Mark (Dauphin—Swan River, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, I understand what culture is about, but I did not ask the minister a question about culture. I asked her a question about money, tax money.

I am sure we in the House all believe Canadians deserve to know how much of their money the heritage minister has blown this time. I ask her again. How much will the magazine deal cost taxpayers of the country?

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the member talks about blowing money. Let us look at one area that has been a growth area for the Canadian people, the Canada television fund. In the last two years the Canada television fund has generated \$1.2 billion worth of television investment in the country, 2,000 hours of new television programming, and at the moment 20,000 jobs and counting.

That is an investment in Canada, in culture, and in getting our message out from coast to coast to coast.

\* \* \*

**THE ENVIRONMENT**

**Ms. Louise Hardy (Yukon, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, while the Arctic contaminants report has highlighted the terrible effects of persistent organic pollutants on people and animals in the north, the government cancelled environmental research projects for the Arctic. At the same time the minister is proposing to amend the Canadian Environmental Protection Act to curtail and in effect limit her own power to act on behalf of the environment and Canadians.

Under these circumstances could the minister please explain how she intends to clean up and protect the northern environment?

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the government took a very important initiative last year in signing and in being the first country in the world to ratify a UN-ECE convention and protocol on the transport and the transboundary transport of toxic substances. This is very important.

• (1445)

On Friday I announced \$62 million to clean up a contaminated site in Sydney. We are committed to cleaning up contaminated sites across this country. There will be further announcements. Today I am bringing in gasoline flow rate regulations which will keep toxics out of the air at every service station across the country.

This government is taking significant steps to—

**The Speaker:** The hon. member for Churchill River.

**Mr. Rick Laliberte (Churchill River, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, my question is for the Prime Minister.

When it comes to the environment, this Liberal government is all talk and no action. The environment commissioner last week agreed by titling his report “The Gap between Talk and Action”.

Bill C-32 is for pollution prevention. Canadians want the phase-out of the worst toxics in the country, but this government is for virtual elimination. This does not stop pollution. Will the Prime Minister stand up and stop pollution before he is considered the virtual Prime Minister?

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the government is very proud of its proposed new CEPA legislation. It is legislation based on a pollution prevention principle. It is legislation that will address the most toxic substances with virtual elimination, the only country in the world that has taken the step of virtual elimination, an internationally recognized principle.

This is legislation that will help the environment and the human health of all Canadians. I hope that we will see very quick passage and promulgation of the legislation.

\* \* \*

**GUN CONTROL**

**Mr. Peter MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough, PC):** Mr. Speaker, according to the government's own figures at the end of May, the total number of firearms registered in the Canadian firearms registry system is now 50,000. The total number of those registered to individuals is only 7,000 for 5,000 people. The laughable Liberal November estimates that the gun registration costs are \$133.9 million means that this public relations exercise to date has cost a whopping \$26,000 per person or \$19,000 per gun. At this rate it will take over 400 years to register all the firearms in Canada.

When will the minister end the madness, display some common sense and cancel this ridiculous registration?

**Hon. Anne McLellan (Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I find it very interesting that there are only a few people, obviously the hon. member is included, who think that our firearms control program is nonsense.

Over 80% of the people who live in Canada support gun control. In addition to that, they support gun registration.

I would hope that these people in light of some of the tragic events that have happened recently in this country and elsewhere would get behind gun control and responsible gun owners.

*Oral Questions*

**Mr. Peter MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough, PC):** Mr. Speaker, some of these people are voters. To date, the government's failure to provide efficient and timely gun legislation has forced over 5,000 businesses to close. This complicated and cumbersome bill discriminates against law-abiding owners and does nothing to stop real criminals. The Law-Abiding Unregistered Firearms Association has stated its members will go to jail rather than comply.

How much money must be spent and how many law-abiding citizens must go to jail before the minister's unworkable, insanely costly registration plan is scrapped?

**Hon. Anne McLellan (Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, let me share with the hon. member some statistics that were provided recently to me by the registration program. In the first six months of operation 275 applicants were refused licences for public safety reasons. We have revoked 191 other licences for public safety reasons. Of 13,000 checks conducted as a result of sales, more than 10% were rejected for failing background checks. That is more than 1,300 potentially dangerous gun sales blocked to date.

That is what safety is about. That is what developing a culture of safety and responsibility is about. I would ask—

**The Speaker:** I remind hon. members not to use papers as props. The hon. member for Lanark—Carleton.

\* \* \*

**SHIPBUILDING INDUSTRY**

**Mr. Ian Murray (Lanark—Carleton, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, my question is for the Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of Industry.

On May 3 the member for Nanaimo—Alberni raised concerns in the House about the shipbuilding industry. He accused the minister of selling taxpayer funded technology to another country and claimed the government was exporting Canadian jobs. Has the parliamentary secretary had the opportunity to look into that allegation and can he inform the House of the results?

• (1450)

**Mr. Walt Lastewka (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of Industry, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the Minister of Industry indicated at that time he would look into the matter for the member for Nanaimo—Alberni. I am pleased to inform the member that Canadian jobs are not being exported and the Department of National Defence, the owner of the technology, has no intention of selling it. The country in question, Australia, was inspecting a shipbuilding site in B.C. and reviewing the DND technology. Hopefully the review will lead to Canadian contracts. The accusations were totally false.

I congratulate the member for Nanaimo—Alberni for the good work the company in question has done. I hope we can work with them to support possible future contracts for our technology and for our country.

\* \* \*

**AGRICULTURE**

**Mr. Roy Bailey (Souris—Moose Mountain, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, my question is for the Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food.

In touring the southeastern portion of my constituency, one will find 50% of the cultivated land under water and another 25% of the land that was prepared for this year's seeding too saturated. The total area is greater than the entire acreage of Prince Edward Island.

Will the minister tour this area and meet with the farmers and the local governments that are facing a huge financial crisis?

**Hon. Lyle Vanclief (Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I am aware of the unfortunate situation for a number of farmers in that area, an area of the country that is usually very dry at this time of year. I have had discussions as have my officials with the officials of both the provinces of Saskatchewan and Alberta. We are suggesting the first thing farmers need to do is participate in the crop insurance program to the fullest extent they possibly can. We will look at ways in which we can use AIDA to assist them as well.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**NATIONAL DEFENCE**

**Mr. Claude Bachand (Saint-Jean, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, my question is for the Minister of National Defence.

There are apparently plans for an enhanced leadership and initial development model program for officers that would provide common training for all Canadian forces officers in the future.

Can the Minister of National Defence tell us whether such a program is indeed in the works and whether the government is getting ready not to renew the lease with the Fort Saint-Jean campus in order to resume full possession of the royal military college facilities in Saint-Jean?

[English]

**Hon. Arthur C. Eggleton (Minister of National Defence, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, we are developing an enhanced leadership model program because we want to make sure that the Canadian forces of the future have the most effective leadership possible. We want to make sure that ethics and Canadian values and all of the

*Oral Questions*

things that are important for Canadians to have in military leadership are part of the development of our future leaders.

As it turns out, one of the facilities that is being looked at is the facility in Saint-Jean-sur-Richelieu. We have made no decision with respect to the final aspects of the program or to the facility that it will be operating.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**NATURAL RESOURCES**

**Mr. Yvon Godin (Acadie—Bathurst, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, in advertising on natural gas in this month's *Atlantic Progress*, the Minister of Natural Resources said, and I quote:

The many investments will mean a good job for the people in the Atlantic provinces, and especially for young people, without having to leave their region.

Will the Minister of Natural Resources include the northeast in the construction of the pipeline in New Brunswick and the environment as well, yes or no?

[English]

**Hon. Ralph E. Goodale (Minister of Natural Resources and Minister responsible for the Canadian Wheat Board, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the development of oil and gas resources off our east coast is a very welcome phenomenon that I think all Canadians celebrate as we see these new resources coming onstream. They provide many new business and job opportunities for Atlantic Canadians.

In terms of the construction of lateral pipelines, that is something that needs to be conducted on a commercial basis. Where the market exists for the gas to service a particular region or a particular commercial enterprise, then obviously the laterals will be constructed on a businesslike basis.

\* \* \*

**AGRICULTURE**

**Mr. Rick Borotsik (Brandon—Souris, PC):** Mr. Speaker, I would like to thank the Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food for taking a proactive approach with respect to the natural disaster that is taking place in Manitoba and Saskatchewan.

I would like to ask the Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food for those people who will not be able to comply with crop insurance, what contingency plan is in place now? What message can we send to those people who will not put a crop in this year?

● (1455)

**Hon. Lyle Vanclief (Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, before I answer the question, I referred a minute ago to the fact that I have had discussions with Alberta and

Saskatchewan. I erred. It is Saskatchewan and Manitoba that are having the problems with wet conditions.

I did have a very good discussion at the end of last week with the minister in the province of Manitoba. As I said last week and again just a minute ago, if crop insurance does not do all that it possibly can for the producers, then we are looking at ways in which we can maybe use the agriculture income disaster assistance program to be of assistance in this situation as well.

\* \* \*

**TRADE AND TOURISM**

**Mr. Carmen Provenzano (Sault Ste. Marie, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the Minister of National Revenue recently met with U.S. cabinet officials and senators to discuss removing barriers to trade and tourism. Will the minister inform the House as to the results of his efforts to expedite the movement of goods and services across our border?

**Hon. Harbance Singh Dhaliwal (Minister of National Revenue, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I am very happy to report to the House that two weeks ago I went to Washington and had the opportunity to meet administrative officials and also talk to the business industry about how we can move the shared border accord forward.

By looking at a new vision for the border, we have decided to get our officials together to see how we can expedite the movement of goods and people across our borders and move the shared border accord, which the President and the Prime Minister signed a few years ago. We have an excellent working relationship and we are certainly going to move this agenda forward.

I want to thank the hon. member for his support on this issue.

\* \* \*

**AGRICULTURE**

**Mr. Roy Bailey (Souris—Moose Mountain, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, I have another question for the Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food.

A Saskatchewan Liberal senator has described this Liberal government's AIDA package as nothing but a disgrace as far as western Canada is concerned.

At this time, would the minister not come out west to see this area and then make the declaration that this is a disaster area and that the funds that go to support the farmers and the local governments for the collateral damage be two separate packages? Will he make that commitment now?

**Hon. Lyle Vanclief (Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, as I commented in the House last week, the manner in which the senator from the other place refers to

*Routine Proceedings*

Saskatchewan farmers is the one way he may want to describe them. I do not. I respect Saskatchewan farmers.

As I said, we will use all the programs we have available at this time to come to the aid of the producers in the unfortunate situation they are in. We will continue to work with them. We will continue to work with my provincial counterparts to work through this unfortunate situation.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**MONEY LAUNDERING**

**Mr. Richard Marceau (Charlesbourg, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, last week, I asked the solicitor general whether he supported my bill to withdraw \$1,000 bills from circulation in the fight against money laundering. By way of response, I got procedural ramblings from the government leader.

We now know that the government will table its own bill to intensify its fight against money laundering.

My question is very simple: Will the bill include the withdrawal of the \$1,000 bill? If not, why not? I hope this time the answer will be more intelligent.

**Hon. Don Boudria (Leader of the Government in the House of Commons, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, to comment on the intelligence of the question, we should look and see whether a member or a minister can comment on a bill that has yet to be tabled in the House.

The member may speak of procedural ramblings all he likes, but I think it is time that he learned a few things.

\* \* \*

[English]

**PAY EQUITY**

**Ms. Bev Desjarlais (Churchill, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, my question is for the Minister of Justice.

Today public servants began a vigil on the steps of the Supreme Court of Canada. Their vigil is for pay equity.

The Liberal government has perverted the Canadian justice system. It has no case against pay equity. It is using the appeal process as a stalling tactic. The whole mess is a waste of taxpayers' money and a travesty of justice. The only people who win are the lawyers.

I want to ask the Minister of Justice, as a lawyer and as a woman, does she agree with the Liberal government's policy of using the courts as a weapon to evade the law and deny equality to Canadians?

**The Speaker:** Of course, we always address hon. members as such, and not as a woman or anything else.

**Hon. Marcel Massé (President of the Treasury Board and Minister responsible for Infrastructure, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, unfortunately I think that the opposition has not yet listened correctly.

This government, the Liberal government, is one that not only supports pay equity, but it is a Liberal government that passed the law. In fact in the implementation of pay equity, we have paid over \$1.1 billion over the last 15 years. I still have an offer on the table to settle the case for \$1.3 billion. Why would the government not give equity to both our employees and the taxpayers?

\* \* \*

• (1500)

**WINDSOR—ST. CLAIR**

**The Speaker:** I have the honour to lay upon the table the report of the Chief Electoral Officer of Canada on the administration of the Windsor—St. Clair byelection held on April 12, 1999.

[Translation]

This document is deemed to have been permanently referred to the Standing Committee on Procedure and House Affairs.

**ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

[Translation]

**GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TO PETITIONS**

**Mr. Peter Adams (Parliamentary Secretary to Leader of the Government in the House of Commons, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, pursuant to Standing Order 36(8), I have the honour to table, in both official languages, the government's response to 8 petitions.

\* \* \*

[English]

**COMMITTEES OF THE HOUSE****INDUSTRY**

**Ms. Susan Whelan (Essex, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, it is through the co-operation of all parties and the depth of the knowledge of all members in understanding both the problem and the different routes for solving the year 2000 computer issues that today I have the honour to present, in both official languages, the 18th report of the Standing Committee on Industry entitled "The Year 2000 Problem—Will Canada be Ready?"

**TRANSPORT**

**Mr. Raymond Bonin (Nickel Belt, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I have the honour to present, in both official languages, the sixth report of

the Standing Committee on Transport with respect to Bill S-23, an act to amend the Carriage by Air Act.

\* \* \*

#### PROCEEDS OF CRIME (MONEY LAUNDERING) ACT

**Hon. Jim Peterson (for the Minister of Finance, Lib.)** moved for leave to introduce Bill C-81, an act to facilitate combatting the laundering of proceeds of crime, to establish the Financial Transactions and Reports Analysis Centre of Canada and to amend or repeal certain acts in consequence.

(Motions deemed adopted, bill read the first time and printed)

\* \* \*

#### PETITIONS

##### FIREARMS

**Mr. Jim Gouk (Kootenay—Boundary—Okanagan, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, I have two petitions to present today. The first petition concerns the Firearms Act.

• (1505)

The petitioners point out that this legislation does not provide any evidence as to how it will save lives and that the money which is being used could be better spent on better law enforcement, health care or any one of a number of other important issues.

These petitioners call upon parliament to repeal the act respecting firearms and other weapons.

##### YOUNG OFFENDERS ACT

**Mr. Jim Gouk (Kootenay—Boundary—Okanagan, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, the second petition is from constituents in my riding who are concerned about violent young offenders.

The petitioners feel that the Young Offenders Act should be amended to hold young people fully accountable for their criminal behaviour and to increase periods of incarceration to deter young people from committing these criminal acts.

The petitioners look for a number of amendments, of which the government is well aware, to strengthen the act and thus reduce the incidence of youth crime for the protection of all Canadians, young and otherwise.

[Translation]

##### HOUSING IN NUNAVIK

**Mr. Guy St-Julien (Abitibi—Baie-James—Nunavik, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I table a petition from the Inuit community of Tasiujaq, in Nunavik.

The petitioners say that in winter from 16 to 20 people may share the same three-bedroom house. They find the housing conditions in Nunavik extremely troubling. The situation is considered intoler-

#### Routine Proceedings

able; it contributes to the high incidence of tuberculosis, infectious diseases and social problems.

The federal government must meet its obligations under the James Bay and Northern Quebec Agreement on housing in Nunavik.

##### ROYAL CANADIAN MOUNTED POLICE

**Ms. Diane St-Jacques (Shefford, PC):** Mr. Speaker, I am pleased to table a petition signed by many of my constituents.

The petitioners urge parliament to keep open the RCMP detachment in Granby, and assign enough staff to protect our homes and our rights.

[English]

##### HEPATITIS

**Mr. Peter Stoffer (Sackville—Musquodoboit Valley—Eastern Shore, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, pursuant to Standing Order 36, it gives me great pleasure, on behalf of Mr. Fred Wornell of Edmonton, Alberta, to present a petition.

The petitioners are from Edmonton, Alberta and Kapuskasing, Ontario. This will be the start of many hundreds of thousands and millions of signatures to come to this parliament concerning this issue.

The petitioners call upon parliament to support Bill C-508, which happens to be my bill, an act to provide for Hepatitis Awareness Month, ensuring that throughout Canada in each and every year the month of May shall be known as Hepatitis Awareness Month.

##### GOVERNMENT GRANTS

**Mr. Leon E. Benoit (Lakeland, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, I am happy to present a petition on behalf of the constituency of Lakeland requesting that public funds being designated as grants to individuals or groups be more carefully scrutinized. The petitioners refer particularly to the \$98,000 granted to the Montreal publisher Edimag for the 500 best dumb blonde jokes. My constituents do not feel that this is an appropriate use of taxpayers' money and they ask that the government withdraw this grant and disallow similar grants in the future.

##### GOVERNMENT REGULATION

**Mr. Paul Steckle (Huron—Bruce, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I have before me this afternoon two petitions.

The first one deals with a matter which is very important to a number of my constituents. These petitioners do not want government nor the drug industry to regulate herbs and teas. They believe that, once regulated, they will become cost prohibitive. They also believe that their freedom of choice will be impeded. They are implicitly asking the government to give back the freedom of choice they believe they are losing through legislative control.

*Routine Proceedings*

## FIREARMS

**Mr. Paul Steckle (Huron—Bruce, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the second petition deals with firearms control.

These petitioners request parliament to repeal Bill C-68 and redirect the hundreds of millions of tax dollars being wasted on the licensing of responsible firearms owners and the registration of legally owned guns by doing something proven to be more cost effective at reducing violent crime and improving public safety, such as more police on the streets, more crime prevention programs, more suicide prevention centres, more women's crisis centres, more anti-smuggling campaigns and more resources for fighting organized crime and street gangs.

## TAXATION

**Mr. Ken Epp (Elk Island, Ref.):** Mr. Speaker, I am pleased on behalf of the members of my Elk Island riding to rise once again to present a petition.

The petitioners are very concerned that families who decide that one of the parents will stay at home to raise their children instead of hiring someone else to do it should have tax discrimination. They are asking that this be rescinded.

This petition will add 87 signatures to the many hundreds I have already presented in this House.

## ABORIGINAL AFFAIRS

**Ms. Bev Desjarlais (Churchill, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, pursuant to Standing Order, 36 I am presenting a number of petitions from urban aboriginals in Ontario who are calling on the government to stop its downloading of aboriginal housing.

• (1510)

The petitioners call upon the Government of Canada to acknowledge and to follow through on its fiduciary responsibility to aboriginal people off reserve, and they state that they should not be suffering the hardship that is being caused by the Liberal government.

\* \* \*

[Translation]

### QUESTIONS ON THE ORDER PAPER

**Mr. Peter Adams (Parliamentary Secretary to Leader of the Government in the House of Commons, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, the following questions will be answered today: Nos. 193 and 232.

[Text]

Question No. 193—**Mr. Jim Jones:**

For the 1997-98 fiscal year what were (i) the eligibility requirements, (ii) the repayment obligations, (iii) the average contribution made in the ridings of Markham, Saint John, Calgary Southwest, Halifax, Laurier—Sainte-Marie, Saint-Maurice, Ottawa South and Lasalle—Émard, (iv) the average contribution made in the provinces of Quebec, Ontario, Alberta, Nova Scotia and New Brunswick; and (v) the average contribution made nationwide, for each of the following business Development Bank of Canada initiatives: (a) techno-net, e-commerce term loans; (b) micro Business program; (c) patient capital; (d) term loans; (e) venture loans; (f) working capital for growth; (g) working capital for exporters; (h) tourism investment fund-development capital for tourism; (i) young entrepreneur financing program; and (j) growth capital for aboriginal business?

**Mr. Walt Lastewka (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of Industry, Lib.):** (i) The Business Development Bank of Canada, BDC, provides commercial financing to small businesses. Requests for financing are examined based on established commercial credit criteria. As a term lender and provider of venture capital the bank assesses not only the project but also the long term viability of the business. The Bank carefully assesses the viability of the project by reviewing the management, the potential profitability, shareholder's investment and available security. The instruments and/or policies used to scrutinize the information submitted by applicants for financial assistance as to its accuracy are described as follows.

The bank has a comprehensive due diligence process in place to assess eligibility, environment, credit worthiness and viability of the project, proposal or business. This includes verification requirements with the applicant's principal chartered bank, any other financial institution and/or government agencies dealing with the applicant, principal suppliers and clients, chartered accountants and various credit associations to verify information. In some cases external industry specialist assistance is obtained.

(1) It is mandatory to obtain credit bureau reports. Dun & Bradstreet reports are requested depending on size and complexity of the operation.

(2) It is mandatory to obtain chartered bank-credit union reports on every applicant at time of initial inquiry. It is also a requirement to contact any other lenders, including leasing, to obtain experience information and confirmation.

(3) It is mandatory to complete a management assessment and market evaluation through a series of questions and outside verifications with commercial lenders, trade suppliers and industry experts.

(4) It is mandatory to undertake a complete financial analysis, both horizontal and vertical, supported by discussions with the applicants accountant-auditor. The bank emphasizes requirements for audited financial data. However review engagements are acceptable for smaller less complex proposals.



*Routine Proceedings*

(5) It is mandatory to assess the environmental conditions of the grounds and facilities.

(6) All pertinent information is entered into a risk grid and compared to industry norms to determine the overall level of risk.

In addition, a second level approval process is in place for larger applications that includes a thorough review of all supporting information gathered by the processing office in the due diligence process. This is similar to processes conducted by other commercial lending institutions in North America.

(ii) BDC does not provide grants or subsidies. It provides debt and equity financing which must be repaid, including both capital and interest. All the money lent by BDC to small business is borrowed from international and domestic financial markets. In order to meet the operating needs of its loan clients, the bank provides flexible repayment terms, including seasonal payments if required.

(iii) For its administrative purposes the BDC maintains activity reports on a branch by branch basis. The BDC does not maintain statistics on the basis of electoral ridings and is therefore unable to provide the listing as requested. BDC is, however, providing statistics relating to loan activity of the BDC on the basis of branch. Branches may service more than one riding. The following are the loans and guarantees authorized for the fiscal year ending March 31, 1998, by branches which include in their territories the requested findings:

The Scarborough branch, which includes the riding of Markham, authorized 53 loans for a total of \$25.1 million; the Saint John, N.B., branch which includes the riding of Saint John, authorized 44 loans for \$7.2 million; the Calgary branch, which includes Calgary Southwest, authorized 198 loans for \$36.5 million; the Halifax Branch, which includes the riding of Halifax, authorized 81 loans for a total of \$22.6 million, the De Maisonneuve branch, which includes the riding of Laurier—Ste-Marie, authorized 74 loans for a total of \$26.3 million; the Trois-Rivières branch, which includes the riding of Saint-Maurice, authorized 68 loans for a total of \$16.1 million; the Ottawa branch, which includes the riding of Ottawa South, authorized 114 loans for a total of \$33.3 million; and Place Ville Marie Montreal branch, which includes the riding of La-salle—Émard authorized 221 loans for \$55.1 million.

(iv) For the provinces requested the following are the loans and guarantees authorized for the year ending March 31, 1998. In the province of Quebec there were 1,807 loans authorized for a total of \$477.4 million. In Ontario there were 1,291 loans authorized for a total of \$388.3 million. In Alberta there were 693 loans authorized for \$98.2 million. In Nova Scotia there were 118 loans authorized for \$29.4 million and in New Brunswick there were 227 loans authorized for \$47.4 million.

(v) (a) The Techno-net loan was recently launched. Therefore it is too early to report activities under this product.

For the fiscal year ending March 31, 1998: (b) 515 loans for \$18 million were authorized under the micro business program; (c) 46 patient capital loans for \$9.4 million were authorized; (d) term loans which include products such as the micro business program, the young entrepreneur financing program and the tourism investment fund consisted of 5,759 loans for a total of \$1.2 billion for the year; (e) 215 venture loans for \$77.6 million were authorized; (f) 231 working capital for growth loans were authorized for a total of \$18.5 million; (g) 16 working capital for exporters loans were authorized for a total of \$3.3 million; (h) 27 loans for \$31.8 million were authorized under the tourism investment fund program; (i) 158 loans for \$4.1 million were authorized under the young entrepreneur financing program; and (j) 59 aboriginal business loans were authorized for \$12.2 million.

**Question No. 232—Mr. John Duncan:**

Could the government provide a complete list of all the regional and local ports of British Columbia as designated under the Transport Canada national marine policy of December 1995 that have not yet been successfully transferred to provincial governments, municipal authorities, community organizations, private interests or other groups, or other federal departments as of March 31, 1999?

**Mr. Stan Dromisky (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of Transport, Lib.):** This is a list of remaining regional and local ports in British Columbia as of March 31, 1999:

Ahousat	Gambier Island	Piers Island	Southbank, François Lake,
Alert Bay	Gold River	Port Clements	Stewart
Alice Arm	Grief Point	Port Graves	Sturdies Bay
Alliford Bay	Halfmoon Bay	Port Hardy	Swartz Bay
Billings Bay	Halkett Bay	Port Renfrew	Takla Landing
Blubber Bay	Harrison Hot Springs	Port Simpson	Telegraph Creek
Brentwood Bay	Hopkins Landing	Port Washington	Thetis Island
Campbell River	Horseshoe Bay	Powell River	Tofino
Chemainus	Keats Island	Saanichton Bay	Ucluelet
Coal Harbour	Kelsey Bay	Savary Island	Vananda Cove
Deep Cove	Kuper Island	Seymour Arm	Vaucroft Beach
Eastbourne	Masset	Sicamous	Victoria and Esquimalt
Esperanza	Miners Bay	Sidney	Whaletown
Fernwood Point	Montague Harbour	Snug Cove	
Friendly Cove	Nanoose Bay	Sointula	

[Translation]

**Mr. Peter Adams:** Mr. Speaker, I would ask that the remaining questions be allowed to stand.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is that agreed?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

*Government Orders***GOVERNMENT ORDERS***[Translation]***CANADIAN ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ACT, 1999**

The House resumed consideration of Bill C-32, an Act respecting pollution prevention and the protection of the environment and human health in order to contribute to sustainable development, as reported (with amendment) from the committee; and of Group No. 6.

**Mr. Benoît Sauvageau (Repentigny, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, I am happy to have the opportunity to speak to Bill C-32, especially to motions in Group No. 6. It is for me a great privilege to be able to discuss the Canadian Environmental Protection Act.

I wish, at the outset, to add my voice to those of my colleagues of the Bloc Québécois in congratulating our critic, the member for Jonquière who has worked so hard on this bill since October. She has listened patiently and attentively to the many witnesses and lobby groups who came before the committee to express their views on the legislation.

Indeed the environmental protection act is constantly undergoing revisions since changes in ways of production, technological progress and the evolution of all that surrounds us warrant a constant review of the legislation.

That is why I wish to pay tribute to the member for Jonquière for the work she has accomplished on this bill.

As my colleagues clearly explained, we cannot support the government's proposals in Bill C-32 because the federal government's approach of environmental issues, which are eminently contentious due to the jurisdiction the federal and the provinces share in this area, and the basic idea of this bill introduced by our friends across the way show that for them provinces are negligible players when it comes to taking decisions about the environment.

I have had the opportunity of sitting on the environment and sustainable development committee. Almost every day during the hearings, the federal government seemed to say: "You know, environment is so important that it transcends boundaries. So, we cannot let the provinces manage environmental issues, because they are too important".

What the government is saying in a roundabout way is: we can let the provinces deal with the unimportant stuff, but it is up to the federal government to take care of important matters.

We find the Liberal government's idea of leaving the less important issues to the provinces and of taking care of the environment itself, since this is important, totally acceptable.

True, the environment is important. However, the provinces—and I will prove it to the House a little later on—are quite capable of promoting environmental standards and sustainable development initiatives involving the use of non-renewable and renewable resources.

If we follow the Liberal government's idea to its logical conclusion, when it says that the environment transcends boundaries, which means that the provinces are unable to assume their duties in their areas of jurisdiction, why would the federal government want to get involved?

• (1515)

If environmental issues transcend boundaries, and we only have to think about acid rain, we should let the Americans set our environmental standards. If the environment transcends boundaries, let us urge some other government or international agency to address them.

Yes, the environment transcends boundaries, but national governments like the provincial government of Quebec must play their role to defend and protect future generations and provide them with a healthy and sustainable environment.

In Bill C-32, Canadians are told that the federal government should legislate more for all jurisdictions because it knows best. It is often said that what goes around comes around. Let us look at the federal government's record, in particular what it did in Kyoto. It came up with a half-baked position at the very last minute. My colleague for Rosemont who was our party's critic for the environment at the time urged the minister to make her position known before she left. We got an answer just the day before she left for Kyoto. That was blatant improvisation.

We should also consider what happened after the Rio de Janeiro summit. We had a PC government then, followed by a Liberal government. For most of the commitments signed in Rio de Janeiro, at the notorious earth summit, neither the timetable nor the agenda have been respected.

The committee reviewed the role of all federal departments as far as the protection of the environment was concerned. It was concluded that the federal government should first clean up its own house. We are being told that the provinces are not up to their task of protecting the environment. However, at the federal level, oftentimes the environment department does not even know what the natural resources department is doing.

If one looks at what goes on in the Department of Industry or even in the Department of Transport, for example what goes on in airports with the use of toxic substances that are then discarded, if one looks at what goes on in the Department of Agriculture where there is virtually no legislation with regard to pesticides, each department has its own string to pull. But these strings are all

entangled, and the Minister of the Environment cannot even find the beginning of a solution to environmental problems.

On one hand, the rhetoric is good, but on the other hand, we see actions that are totally inconsistent. To prove what I just said, I will give the example of an international conference on mercury where the Minister of Natural Resources and the Minister of the Environment publicly contradicted each other on this subject in front of experts and other people who were in attendance.

The Minister of Natural Resources and the Minister of the Environment went to an international conference without developing a common position. Can we think that the idea of giving the federal government exclusive jurisdiction over environmental matters because they are important is justified when we see this kind of behaviour at an international conference?

According to the report from the environment commissioner, Brian Emmett, federal officials have said, after examining the reports submitted by businesses pursuant to the protocol on the reduction and elimination of toxic substances, that they believe more than 75% of reported reductions are false or misleading. Seventy-five per cent of the information contained in the reports on the elimination of toxic substances is false. And the federal government wants us to trust it. It wants us to believe it will pass definitive legislation on the environment.

Now, looking at what this same commissioner of the environment, Mr. Emmett, told the federal government about protection from toxic substances, how he accused it of shirking its responsibilities on toxic substances, we can see how we are entitled to question turning some elements of provincial jurisdiction over the environment over to the federal government.

The Canadian Environmental Protection Act is a huge piece of legislation encompassing everything to do with environmental protection and sustainable development in Canada.

• (1520)

This bill needs intelligent amendment and improvement, so as to respect provincial jurisdictions and not to give the federal government more power, broader jurisdiction.

In order to address some of the inconsistencies in the federal and provincial legislation on the environment, I would like to quote an environmental expert, Pierre Béland, if I recall his name correctly. He sat on the Great Lakes Commission until very recently. He told us this "If a whale gets into problems in the middle of the St. Lawrence, it is under federal jurisdiction. If the same injured whale beaches itself, then it is under provincial jurisdiction, because the shores are provincial. But, if this injured beached whale dies, then

### *Government Orders*

it falls back under federal jurisdiction because it then comes under the federal legislation on endangered species".

How can anyone make informed decisions on the environment when everything depends on the time of day, the wind direction, the temperature, and what not?

I believe that the party in power must do its homework, take into consideration the amendments presented by the opposition parties, the Bloc Québécois included, and improve Bill C-32. Otherwise, as we have said, we are going to have to vote against it.

[English]

**Ms. Paddy Torsney (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I am happy to speak to the motions in Group No. 6.

The NDP Motion No. 41 would require research in relation to pollution and children. Under the existing CEPA, whether it is reducing the amount of benzene, which is a known carcinogen in gasoline, or banning substances that harm the earth's ozone layer, the health and well-being of our children has always been a key consideration. The whole reason for Bill C-32 is to prevent pollution from substances that are harmful to the environment and human health, including our children.

The bill requires that the government look at the 23,000 substances that are currently in Canada. In the 1998 budget our government invested \$40 million in toxic research. Children, as well as the elderly and aboriginal peoples, are most vulnerable to the threat of toxic substances. This research gave us answers on what needs to be done to protect those most vulnerable and all Canadians from the threat of toxic substances.

With these answers in hand, Bill C-32 and the \$42 million earmarked in the 1999 budget for action on toxics will provide the means to better protect the environment and health of all Canadians.

Motions Nos. 36, 37 and 70 seek to link definitions in part 3 to areas that are accessible to pollution. We are not exactly sure what NDP Motion No. 36 is trying to accomplish. It seems to suggest that the definitions in part 3, fish and hormone disrupting substances, should apply in areas that are reasonably accessible to children. The NDP is trying to do the same to certain regulatory powers. This is unnecessary in our view.

Bill C-32 is a law of general application and it applies throughout Canada. It is a bill for all Canadians. The suggestion to add a definition of environmental pollutant is also confusing and we believe would limit the powers in part 3.

The government prefers to have research and information gathering powers to cover the all-inclusive concept of substance rather than the more narrow definition of environmental pollutant. We

*Government Orders*

prefer Bill C-32 as it is rather than the narrowly defined powers suggested by the NDP and the Reform.

The Reform motion seeks to change the definition of hormone disrupting substances. While it was the government's intention to introduce a definition of hormone or endocrine disrupting substances at the committee stage, the government would prefer to let the committee's definition stand in its place. Our research community is actively pursuing research into endocrine disrupting substances and finding solutions to this growing concern.

The federal government is moving quickly to meet the requirements in Bill C-32 to conduct research. Hormone disrupting substances are a priority of the government's \$40 million toxic substance research initiative.

• (1525)

Just last week the Ministers of Health and the Environment announced a series of projects under the first tranche of investment research dollars. Some \$10.94 million was allocated to 81 projects across Canada to conduct research on toxic substances in five priority areas: persistent organic pollutants, specific forms of metals in the environment, endocrine disrupting chemicals, urban air quality and human exposure to airborne pollutants, and the cumulative effective of toxic substances.

Over 360 Canadian researchers will be participating in the various research studies. They will draw upon strong partnerships with government, industry, academia and non-governmental sectors. All provinces were covered in the announcement.

A University of Calgary study will investigate the adverse health effects on babies due to exposure to environmental chemicals in the mother's womb. The science management and technical review committees of the toxic substances research initiative reviewed many applications. They put forth much time and effort to review these applications and to move this process forward.

One of these announcements was the allocation of \$2.16 million to 17 projects relating to endocrine disruption substances. They cover a wide range of issues concerning the effects on human health as well as the environmental impacts on the environment. Seven projects were given to Environment Canada, eight to universities across Canada, one to Health Canada and one to the Department of Fisheries and Oceans.

The following are some of the projects: Michel Fournier, professor at the Institut Armand-Frappier, is investigating fetal organ thynic culture as organ assay for environmental endocrine disrupting substances, a \$70,000 project; Robert Casper at the University of Toronto is looking into the adverse reproductive effect of exposure to dioxin-like endocrine disrupters, an \$80,000 project; Donald Cole at McMaster University in Hamilton is looking into time of pregnancy, in vivo contaminant levels and biological mechanisms in premepps; Poh-Gek Forkhert at Queen's

University in Kingston is looking into the reproductive toxicity induced by trichlorethylene in mice and humans; Scott Brown at Canada's own Environment Canada, National Water Research Institute located in Burlington, Ontario is looking into the effects of endocrine disrupters on seawater adaptability, growth and survival of salmon smolts.

There are other projects at the University of Calgary, at the University of Guelph and at the University of Toronto, all across this country. The government is putting its commitments to making sure that we are looking at preventing pollution, that we are putting together a strong regulatory framework and that we will have a bill that will see Canadians through into the next millennium making sure that we do things differently. We have learned the lessons from the past. The bill is necessary to make sure that we can implement those lessons and have a strong regulatory regime.

I urge all members of the House to support the bill and see its passage in the next couple of days.

**Mr. Gordon Earle (Halifax West, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, today being the first day of environment week, I am very pleased to discuss Bill C-32, the Canadian Environmental Protection Act, and, in particular, Group No. 6 motions.

The bill is a very significant piece of legislation. It consists of 227 pages, 12 parts, 8 divisions and a total of 253 clauses that include regulations on toxic substances, exports and imports of hazardous waste, biotechnology, ocean dumping, vehicle emissions, fuels and fuel additives, international air pollution, enforcement and other environmentally related matters. It has undergone one of the lengthiest reviews in recent parliamentary history and has set several records.

I understand the committee held 59 meetings, 37 of which were on clause by clause review. More than 560 amendments were drafted for consideration. With today's proposed motions, Bill C-32 has now exceeded 800 amendments for consideration. The NDP has submitted over 100 amendments at committee, surpassing all opposition party amendments combined. I am very pleased to speak to the bill, which is perhaps the cornerstone of environmental protection in Canada.

• (1530)

I will turn now to the Group No. 6 motions. I will outline some of the points we would like to bring to the attention of the House concerning this group. It is very unfortunate that the Liberal government has imposed time restrictions to limit debate on this important bill which decides the level of environmental protection for Canadians.

Given the time restrictions I will begin to outline our efforts to provide a safer environment for children, the main theme behind the Group No. 6 motions. Children are especially vulnerable, as we

*Government Orders*

heard earlier today, to environmental contaminants and pollution. A child's environment is affected even before birth.

If we look at such things as fetal alcohol syndrome, we know that what a mother takes into her body can affect the well-being of a child and have permanent and lasting effects throughout that child's life. Environment is very important for children.

People have concerns about lawns being sprayed with chemicals and pesticides. I recall receiving a letter from a person who had visited the town of Bedford. He said he was very impressed with this wonderful town in eastern Canada. He loved the place but he was concerned about the spraying of lawns that was taking place.

Environment is a very important issue. The Canadian Institute of Child Health presented a series of recommendations to the Standing Committee on Environment and Sustainable Development during the review of Bill C-32. The purpose of the motions in Group No. 6 are to acknowledge the special protection that our children expect and deserve.

We have followed the child institute's suggestion to investigate the specific legislation which the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency has in place entitled "A Safer Environment for Children". The President of the United States referred to the specific request of the Environmental Protection Agency to acknowledge the special vulnerability and susceptibility of children to environmental contaminants and pollution. Congress agreed with the president and backed this historic initiative.

The basis of the amendment to the Toxic Substances Control Act recognizes that current public health and environmental standards require specific recommendations as related to children. This requirement should carry into the establishment of regulations which govern the exposure to contaminants children may face.

The EPA instructions are mirrored in our New Democratic Party Motion No. 41. We chose to place this motion in part 3, the information gathering section, to ensure ministers and legislators take children into consideration whenever decisions are being made on environmental matters. This is very important.

Sometimes children are forgotten members of society. We do not consider them when we are making decisions. It is very important that we consider children. This can include toxic substance reviews where the process to quantify or regulate substances are concerned. The specific requirements are to assure that ministers conduct research or studies with respect to the increased susceptibility children face.

The motion requires that alternate substances or products "safer for children" be identified. Information on the potential health effects to children is also addressed. This should be acceptable to

members of the House. It is important to recognize this is a precautionary measure. This is a principle we must look at.

While we are discussing the importance of the environment to children in Canada and while we are looking today at legislation that is outlined to try to protect the Canadian environment, we cannot look at it in isolation. We must recognize environment is an issue that should be of concern to us worldwide.

I find it quite ironic that we can be looking at protecting our environment while at the same time we as Canadians and as partners to NATO are taking part in the destruction of the environment in another part of the world. We are dropping bombs that are polluting water resources. We are destroying chemical factories and so forth, sending pollution adrift into the air. We as partners are condoning the use of weapons by the Americans which involve depleted uranium.

• (1535)

I will tell the House a bit about depleted uranium. We are told that it is a highly toxic substance to humans both chemically as a heavy metal and radiologically as an alpha particle emitter which is very dangerous when taken internally. Upon impact depleted uranium bursts into flames. It produces a toxic and radioactive ceramic aerosol that is much lighter than uranium dust. It can travel in the air tens of kilometres from the point of release and settle, waiting to be stirred up in dust and suspended in the air from human or animal movement. It is very small and can be breathed in by anyone from babies and pregnant women to the elderly and the sick.

This radioactive and toxic ceramic can stay in the lungs for years, irradiating the surrounding tissue with powerful alpha particles. It can affect the lungs, the gastrointestinal system, the liver, the kidneys, bone and other tissue, and the renal system.

We understand that in the current conflict taking place in Kosovo, the A-10 Warthog is capable of firing 4,200 rounds of this abomination every minute. The U.S. government has suggested that almost one million rounds of this radioactive toxin casing were fired in Iraq during the gulf war. Iraq has witnessed explosive rates of stillbirths, children born with defects, childhood leukemia and other cancers, particularly in the region where these shells were fired.

When we talk about protecting the environment we must not take it in isolation. We must not think only about our Canadian environment. The air knows no boundaries. Water knows no boundaries. Certainly, if we are talking about protecting children, we must be cognizant of children across the world and throughout the entire universe.

*Government Orders*

I urge that we consider very strongly this group of motions which strives to take precautionary measures to protect our children and our future.

**Mr. Ian Murray (Lanark—Carleton, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I am pleased to take part in the report stage debate on Bill C-32, legislation that proposes renewal of the Canadian Environmental Protection Act.

The 10 minutes available to me in this part of the debate are not enough to describe fully the many advantages of the legislation. They do provide, however, sufficient time to outline 20 ways in which the bill is a significant improvement over the existing act, 20 ways in which the legislation will mean better protection of the environment and the health of Canadians.

(1) the bill makes pollution prevention the cornerstone of the new act and provides authority to require pollution prevention plans for toxic substances.

(2) under the legislation all 23,000 substances in Canada will be examined to determine if they are toxic.

(3) Bill C-32 puts in place deadlines for taking action to prevent pollution from toxic substances.

(4) the most dangerous toxic substances will be virtually eliminated.

(5) the bill will provide the environment minister with the power to require industry to prepare and implement emergency preparedness plans for toxic substances.

(6) the legislation requires that the government conduct research on hormone disrupting substances, something that the ministers of environment and health already acted on last week with investments under the toxic substances research initiative.

(7) it expands the minister's information gathering powers to support scientific research on environmental problems.

(8) it will promote greater public participation through a new Internet based environmental registry of CEPA information.

(9) citizens will also have a new right to sue if government fails to enforce CEPA and it results in significant harm to the environment.

(10) the bill requires the establishment of the national pollutants release inventory and guarantees that Canadians will be able to get information about pollution in their communities.

(11) in recognition of aboriginal self-government aboriginal governments will have representatives on the national advisory committee alongside provinces and territories.

(12) the bill expands the authority to require cleaner fuels, meaning cleaner air in Canadian cities.

(13) the legislation transfers authority to set engine emission standards for new motor vehicles from the Motor Vehicle Safety Act and expands it to cover other types of engines such as those in off-road vehicles and lawn mowers.

(14) protecting the environment is a global issue. It is therefore essential for Canada to meet its international environmental commitments. The bill provides authority to implement our obligations under the Basel convention on the control of transboundary movement of hazardous wastes and their disposal.

• (1540)

(15) it will allow Canada to put in place a more stringent regime for ocean disposal in accordance with the 1996 protocol to the convention on the prevention of marine pollution by the dumping of wastes and other matter.

(16) Bill C-32 contains authority to implement the convention on prior informed consent for hazardous chemicals and pesticides in international trade.

(17) it also provides new authority to require pollution prevention plans for Canadian sources of international air and water pollution where another Canadian government is unwilling or unable to deal with the pollution source.

(18) to ensure that the law is obeyed, Bill C-32 provides peace officer status for our enforcement officers.

(19) it also gives enforcement officers the power to issue on the spot orders to stop violations and prevent pollution.

(20) the bill contains an innovative alternative dispute resolution mechanism to avoid costly court procedures.

These are 20 good reasons why I support Bill C-32. They are 20 reasons why all members should support the bill. Most important, this list of improvements outlines 20 ways in which the environment and health of Canadians will be better protected under Bill C-32.

[Translation]

**Mr. Bernard Bigras (Rosemont, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, it is with great pleasure that I stand up today to speak about Bill C-32, especially about the motions in Group No. 6.

I am particularly pleased to have accepted the invitation from my colleague from Jonquière today, since this debate falls on the first day of environment week.

First of all, it is important to mention that no matter what changes are made to Bill C-32 we are against it, at this stage at least. However, we never opposed the basic principle linking economic development to environment protection. It is a fundamental principle established many years ago by the United Nations

commission for the environment, which was chaired by Mrs. Brundtland, the former prime minister of Norway. That commission put forth a concept where economic development environmental protection go hand in hand.

This is all the more important because of the population increase of the last few years. With that population explosion and technological advances, economic activity has multiplied by 20 since the beginning of this century. Furthermore economic growth was directly linked to technological development all over the world.

Whether we want it or not, not only did that impact on the environment but it also impacted directly on our life. In this context, it is unavoidable that we will face many environmental crises. It cannot be avoided, it is part of reality. That is why we have to protect ourselves.

Obviously we have to protect ourselves with laws, a fact that has been recognised on several occasions, including at the recent environment ministers' meeting, where the Quebec Minister of the Environment, Paul Bégin, expressed his desire to protect the environment, while making sure that certain clear rules are obeyed. I will come back to this subject later on, but I thought it was important to mention it now.

Earlier, I was listening to the Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of the Environment who enumerated a series of announcements she or her minister made concerning the environment over the last few months. It is important to look carefully at the net results of the government's commitment.

I reread my notes from the time I was the Bloc's environment critic. On April 24, 1998, the Liberal government launched a vast publicity campaign in Canada to sing the praise of the Canadian government for its key role in the protection against climate change at the international level. The publicity said, and I quote: "To play a key role at the international level by contributing to the reduction of the causes of climate change in the world".

• (1545)

When I came to this House and when I became environment critic, I soon realized that there was a lot of rhetoric on the other side, but very few results. A quick look at this government's and this country's record with regard to the reduction of greenhouse gases is enough to see that we do not fare well among OECD countries.

I think it is important to say so because, over the last two years, the government has not had a clear objective with regard to the environment and has not even been able to meet the commitments made by its predecessor at the Rio summit in 1992.

I think it is important to deal with the issue of climate change. For the past two years, the government, through its environment minister, has claimed it would play a leadership role in internation-

### *Government Orders*

al fora, especially at the Kyoto summit. This issue is of the utmost importance since over the past few years we have been releasing billions of tons of carbon dioxide into the atmosphere, causing global warming.

It is important to note that we in North America alone are responsible for a quarter of emissions. In view of this environmental situation, it is important to make international commitments and pass laws taking it into account.

At the Rio summit in 1992 the federal government agreed to the common goal of stabilizing greenhouse gas emissions at the 1990 level by the year 2000. Canada agreed to it and so did Quebec through a motion passed by the national assembly. While the federal government was committed to acting as a responsible government, taking the necessary steps, and respecting the international commitments it signed, more than ever Quebec was true to its word on this issue at the international level. Its record speaks for itself.

I mentioned 1992, but there is also mention 1995, the Berlin international conference where the alarm was sounded to the world to the effect that the mere stabilisation of greenhouse gas emissions by the year 2000 would not be enough because it would not reduce the mortality rate nor the incidence of diseases caused by global warming and gas emissions.

At that time the message from Berlin was loud and clear. Governments that made a commitment in Rio in 1992 must not only stand by it, but if at all possible, go even further.

The Kyoto conference is another important event. Canada who, a year before, was bragging about being an international showcase and leading the way in gas reduction, is not acting upon its commitments although they had some merit. That conference could have allowed Canada to influence the future.

• (1550)

Instead, the federal government has delayed disclosing its commitments and its position with regard to a 3 per cent reduction of gas emissions by the year 2010. That is not enough. Quebec said so over and over again. Quebec was ready to commit to going twice as far as Canada in its initial position.

On the issue of climate changes, Quebec has met its commitments. Quebec was able to do so because it adjusted its objectives. It has undergone a change in its energy use thus enabling it to improve the situation in Canada as well as internationally.

While Western Canada kept investing in fossil fuels, Quebec gave greater place to hydroelectric generation and came up with policies in keeping with our quality of life needs both economic and environmental, which of course includes economic growth.

At this stage, we oppose Bill C-32 because it is conducive to overlapping and duplication and, especially, because the federal

*Government Orders*

government does not respect Quebec's exclusive jurisdiction over environment matters under the Constitution.

[English]

**Mr. Peter Stoffer (Sackville—Musquodoboit Valley—Eastern Shore, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, I wish to honour environment week which we are recognizing this week.

I also mention that the Minister of Canadian Heritage again got it wrong. In a statement on a question earlier today during question period she said "two founding peoples of this nation". I remind the minister and her Liberal Party that there are actually three founding peoples of this nation with the first one being the aboriginal people of this country. The French and English came afterward. As the Minister of Canadian Heritage we would think she would know that more than anyone else.

We are here to talk about something equally important. It is probably the most important act we could do as parliamentarians, CEPA, the Canadian Environmental Protection Act. I sat in on some of the committee hearings which were long and drawn out but very important. The Liberals with their Reform counterparts have completely watered down the bill and now CEPA stands for "can't ever protect anything". That is what this bill amounts to and I will give an example.

When the bill came out of committee one part of the preamble was "Whereas the Government of Canada acknowledges the need to phase out the generation and use of the most persistent and bioaccumulative toxic substances". The part "to phase out" has been removed by the Liberal government. The bill has been severely weakened by that action.

The bill said "achieving virtual elimination" but the word "achieving" is gone when taking steps to achieve the virtual elimination of a substance. The government has completely watered this down to the point where the minister will now prescribe the quantity or concentration of the substance that may be released into the environment. This is not a phase-out of these toxic substances, it is a reduction. It is virtual elimination, not a total phase-out.

When will the government understand that in order to protect Canadians and future generations, we have to totally eliminate these things, not virtually eliminate? There is nothing to tell industry it is mandatory to abide by these rules and legislation.

The Liberal government's and previous governments' actions on the environment are severely weakened to the point that it borders on absolutely terrible.

The MMT decision by this Liberal government cost \$13 million U.S. Nobody in this country wanted a manganese additive in their

gasoline except the Liberal government. We are required to pay \$13 million U.S. to keep it here and nobody else wants it.

At the present time there are also concerns about the bulk transport of water out of this country. Nobody in Canada wants to do that except the Liberal government. If the government wanted to stop it, legislation would have been put forward and passed by now. But no, we are being sued again by the California and U.S. governments to the tune of \$220 million. If the MMT decision is anything similar to that, we will end up losing that as well because the government has no teeth and no guts when it comes to the protection of our environment.

• (1555)

Twenty-five years ago one out of every twenty women in this country was diagnosed with breast cancer; now it is one out of every nine. The facts speak for themselves. Those are women. We are not talking about children yet which this particular clause is about. For the government not to take in the rights and the protection of our children at all costs is absolutely criminal.

We heard the parliamentary secretary talk about money spent on research which is very welcome. The question is what is being done with that information? The environmental commissioner said it is being ignored completely. The government whitewashes it, gets rid of it. The government talks and talks and nothing happens.

In April 1998 I asked the deputy minister of the environment if he had the finances or resources to do the job properly. His answer was no, he did not. In April 1998 it is on the record that the deputy minister of the environment said that he did not have the finances, the resources or the personnel to do the job effectively. I have not seen any changes on that.

A lot of people outside of the House are watching this debate today. They need to be congratulated for their tireless efforts in terms of protecting the environment.

I think of Mr. Brian McHattie and Mr. Don McLean of Red Hill Creek down in South Hamilton. They are trying to protect that urban park from expansion of the expressway.

I would like to thank Mr. Dennis Bicknell, Ms. Marilyn Chalice and Walter Reagan of the Sackville River's Association, and I wear their pin proudly today, for the protection of the river and trail systems of Lower Sackville and Bedford and the protection they offer to children in restoring creeks for salmon habitat and everything else.

I would also like to thank two NDP MLAs from Nova Scotia, Mr. John Holm and Mr. Don Chard for their tireless efforts in getting 660 acres of land protected in Lower Sackville. That is for the protection and use of our children for many generations to come.

I would also like to thank Mr. Paul Falvo and Elizabeth May of the Sierra Club, Mr. Dave Campbell, Mr. Paul Muldoon and of



*Government Orders*

course the greatest environmentalist this country has ever had, Mr. David Suzuki.

These people spend their lives trying to protect the environment and get the message across to the government that it is definitely needed and very important.

I wish to thank Mr. Mark Butler and the Ecology Action Centre of Nova Scotia for over 27 years of environmental activism in terms of protecting the environment of Nova Scotia. Without them I do not know where we would be today.

It is not surprising that the government does not understand what is going on. However, there are three Liberal members whom I wish to congratulate for their tireless efforts in protecting the environment. They are the member for Lac-Saint-Louis, the member for York North and the member for Davenport. At least these three people listen. At least these three Liberals understand environmental concerns. At least these three Liberals know what the hell is going on. Unfortunately, the other 150-odd Liberals do not know. I apologize for using that strong word. At least those three Liberals understand the situation. The rest of them do not and that is a crime.

Members of the Reform Party of Canada support things like virtual elimination. That shows exactly who is buttering their bread, and that is industry. When will they realize that industry only cares about profits and shareholders? It does not care about the environment. If it did, it would put in long term solutions and programs that would benefit the seven generation principle which our aboriginal people have survived on for thousands and thousands of years.

Unfortunately, these Liberal and Reform members can only see the ends of their noses and that is it, usually in four year electoral terms. The record is quite clear.

Recently we heard an announcement on the Sydney tar ponds. Except for Chernobyl, it is probably the world's worst environmental site. It has been decided to put \$62 million in to move some families. Although that is very welcome, what we need from the government is a commitment now. Not tomorrow, now.

The Minister of the Environment and the Prime Minister must stand in the House and say that the tar ponds are going to be cleaned up once and for all. We have not heard them say that. We have heard the government say it is going to put so many millions of dollars into this, it is going to do this, and it is going to consult.

• (1600)

We have been talking about the tar ponds for years and years. My message is quite clear to Liberals: clean it up now. It is simple. I will say it one more time so they will hear it: clear up the Sydney tar ponds now, not tomorrow. People are getting very sick. The

rates of cancer in the Sydney area are exponential to that in the rest of the country.

It is unbelievable that the government just sits here and wastes time after time after time. The sad thing is people are now saying—

**Ms. Paddy Torsney:** You just voted against time allocation.

**Mr. Peter Stoffer:** Time allocation on a watered down CEPA bill, I say to the parliamentary secretary. It was watered down went it left committee.

I have a question for the parliamentary secretary. Why was the bill watered down when it left committee? Why was that done? It is quite simple. I know the parliamentary secretary will not get an opportunity to respond. Perhaps she can do that afterward over coffee.

The Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of the Environment is a decent person, but when it comes to the protection of the environment all she reads is what she is handed by the bureaucrats. I wish for once she would tell us how she really feels about protecting the environment.

I could go on for days on this subject. In the old days we were able to do that; we could filibuster until the cows came home. I wish we still had those days.

On behalf of the New Democratic Party, federally and provincially, it is a real shame that the government watered down the bill when it left committee. Now we will see where the real Liberals stand in terms of the votes tonight at 6.30 p.m. This is where we will separate the Liberals from the true environmental protectors on this side, my colleagues in the Bloc and some of those in the Conservative Party.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Michel Guimond (Beauport—Montmorency—Côte-de-Beaupré—Île-d'Orléans, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, I am delighted to intervene on Bill C-32, which concerns the protection of the environment.

Right off, I would point out that our party is very aware of environmental issues. I take this opportunity to congratulate my colleague, the member for Jonquière, for the work she has done in committee. In mentioning the work done in committee, I am not telling you anything new when I say the birth was a very difficult one. It took more than forceps to get this bill before us.

Just to give you an idea, this bill was tabled at first reading on March 12, 1998. We will recall that it replaced Bill C-74, which died on the order paper because of the election call on June 2, 1997.

The bill was tabled on March 12, 1998, at first reading, and was referred to committee for study in the fall of 1998, which was

*Government Orders*

concluded in April 1999. We might well question the coherence of this bill, since amendments are coming from all sides, presented without any sort of link or relationship. We may well wonder what sort of bill will govern the rules of society, what sort of law we will have if it is passed in its entirety.

It took some 60 sessions to study the bill clause by clause, and 580 amendments were drafted. To those watching us, you heard correctly, 580 amendments. That is incredible, nothing like this is ever seen and it will certainly appear in the Guinness book of records, not to mention the internal records list of the House.

The government would have done better, in my opinion, to withdraw its bill right off, to do its homework, return to the drawing table, start from scratch and say "Just a minute, let us get in tune". When a government introduces 580 amendments to its own bill, we are entitled to question its consistency.

The standing committee on the environment, as I said, broke all records; it passed some 160 amendments. The final result is a bill with considerable inconsistency. In the short time we have, I will try to point out some of the inconsistencies.

• (1605)

First of all, there is the whole question of harmonization with the provinces. Under the original version of Bill C-32, the federal government was going to act in accordance with the intent of intergovernmental agreements. The Liberal majority softened this requirement by adding the word "endeavour" before the verb "to act".

We all know the legal implication of such words as "endeavour", "attempt" or "try". Then they say "We have tried. We attempted to do this or that, but unfortunately it was not possible and we finally did as we pleased". In a democratic system, it is always worrying when the governing party is trying to pull a fast one on us.

Fortunately, the members of the Bloc Quebecois who sat on the standing committee on the environment were very alert. They were very well prepared and they have worked like monks, night and day, to show the amendments tabled by the liberal majority up for what they are. This one looks like a bull in a china shop. Its purpose is to add the word "endeavour" before the verb "to act".

The Bloc Quebecois maintains that the federal government must always keep in mind the prospect of harmonization with the provinces, to avoid duplication and overlap in the legislation and regulations.

Contrary to what certain persons may think, when the House adjourns for the summer, the MPs will not be on holiday until September 19. We will continue our work in our riding offices, we

will keep on meeting people. When we meet people at the convenience store, the cleaner, the shopping mall or elsewhere, they tell us "There is way too much overlap and duplication".

In the end, who pays for such overlap and duplication? It is the same person. Whether we are talking about federal, provincial or municipal taxes, we always have the same common denominator, namely the taxpayer. Taxpayers are tired of paying. They want us to avoid overlap and duplication.

Unfortunately, this bill perpetuates overlap and duplication. We Bloc Quebecois members cannot accept that. We believe that the people whom we represent are paying enough taxes. They are fed up with their level of taxation.

By trivializing federal-provincial harmonization agreements, the Liberal government clearly shows that it lacks the will to respect the jurisdiction of the provinces with regard to the environment.

In one of its amendments, the Bloc Quebecois proposes that the word "endeavour" be deleted. We are saying "You must reach an agreement, you must act, instead of merely endeavour to act".

I will try to hurry to say all that I have to say. Clause 9 of the bill reads as follows:

9.(1) The Minister may negotiate an agreement with a government. . .with respect to the administration of this Act.

However, the Liberal majority on the committee decided to subject this agreement to a new clause 9.(9), which would trivialize any potential equivalency agreement with the provinces. With this clause, the federal government is giving itself the authority to go over the heads of the provinces, even if the federal government has concluded an agreement with a province.

This is entirely incomprehensible and unacceptable coming from a federal government that says it wishes to work in partnership with the provinces. Clearly, this government's left hand does not know what its right hand is doing.

We have the Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs constantly telling us he is looking for harmony, co-operation and partnership with the provinces, while the Prime Minister drones on about how there has been more co-operation with the provinces since he has been in office. I respectfully beg to differ. All this government is looking for is confrontation with the provinces, not just with Quebec.

• (1610)

We could talk about the relations between Quebec and Ottawa since the Liberals took office in 1993, but also about the relations with all the provinces. Quebec is not alone in its concerns about the dominating and centralizing tendencies of this government, which is trying to turn the provinces into branch plants. The federal

*Government Orders*

government is lord and master. The provinces are valets and branch plants. We and our constituents cannot accept this.

The Bloc Québécois suggested a number of amendments at report stage, including some to the preamble itself. We are moving that the paragraph in the preamble decreeing that there be national environmental standards and national ecosystem and environmental quality codes of practice be dropped.

We feel that the federal government does not have exclusive jurisdiction over the environment. This paragraph is therefore unacceptable to us.

I have only one minute left and will therefore have to skip over important parts of my speech, but I will try to summarize them.

The Liberal members on the Standing Committee on the Environment and Sustainable Development have often put a knife to the throats of opposition members, using their numerical majority to pass amendments. We feel that these amendments, particularly those passed by the majority Liberal members in committee, are unacceptable.

In conclusion, the Bloc Québécois will be voting against this bill at report stage and at third reading, unless the government decides to listen to reason and moves amendments acceptable to our party.

[*English*]

**Ms. Bev Desjarlais (Churchill, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, I congratulate and thank my hon. colleague from Churchill River, our environmental critic, for all the work he has done in this area and for ensuring that our caucus was constantly kept up to date on the changes that were happening. He made an absolute point of letting us know his grave concern over the watering down process that was happening with the bill at committee because of the Liberal majority there.

There is no question that amendments thereafter were an attempt to offset the watering down process. I thank him for his principled position and for continually trying to improve the bill before us. Should by some horrible chance the government's amendments all go through and we have a watered down approach, I am sure he will continue to pursue better legislation for all the time he is here.

Group No. 6 is key to the legislation in that it addresses the issue of children's health as much as, if not more than others. It recognizes that children are different and respond differently to the environmental hazards around them.

I notice the hon. member for Burlington said that we do not need separate motions to protect different groups, that the bill is there to protect everyone. However the bottom line is that the bill is not following through. It is not doing the job it needs to do. We are

saying that we should give kids a fighting chance as they are more vulnerable.

We all know it takes less of something to damage a child than it does others. There are numerous indications of problems which result while children are in utero. We are constantly told in the first trimester of pregnancy to be careful so that there are not problems. That is just in taking medications, let alone toxic substances which affect Canadians. Specifically children are the most vulnerable.

I have a hard time accepting that there should not be some absolute phase out of certain toxins in areas where children are most vulnerable. We do not let pedophiles hang around schoolyards. However, toxins are knocking children off left, right and centre. If the government cannot see the need to treat children with added care, then something is seriously wrong.

• (1615)

We need to ensure that there will be future research and studies by the health and environment ministries to specifically look at the damage children will feel.

I also want to comment on the relationship between the federal and provincial governments. The reason we have federal and provincial governments is that Canadians recognize that there are different levels in which they want to see governments involved. Canadians see the federal government, I am sure much to the dissatisfaction of the Bloc, as a tie that binds us together. We want to see all Canadians protected equally.

I do not get caught up in the provincial and federal issue because I believe that whatever we do to ensure safety and benefits and to improve things for all Canadians is the route we want to go. The federal-provincial issue has been an ongoing problem and it is an argument that both levels of government end up using. They cannot do this because it is federal. They cannot do this because it is provincial. The bottom line is that they both end up passing the buck and nothing gets done. It is time we ensure that things are accomplished while we are here.

The proposed series of amendments from our caucus and from our environmental critic to provide a safer environment for our children will ensure that consideration will be given to the specific vulnerability and susceptibility of children's experiences toward environmental contaminants and pollutants during future regulatory initiatives. There are warnings on pesticide residues on produce in the United States, including warnings for parents to take care, wash apples and peel them. We do not do that in Canada.

This series of motions will require the ministers to compile a list of substances that are specific hazards to children through the development stages and early years when they are most at risk. What that is saying is that, given the chance to know what is there, I

*Government Orders*

believe parents will make decisions on what their children should have and what they should not have. They will take whatever precautionary methods they need. Not giving them information on the risks is much like the tobacco companies have been doing for years. They increase the amount of nicotine to make it addictive. It was not until years and years of constant pressure that we saw some honesty. We realized that the industry was not out there only to make a buck at the expense of the lives of Canadians, it also preyed upon children. The industry wanted to make sure that children would become addicted to the deadly toxins in tobacco products.

The New Democratic Party called attention to phthalates, softeners for plastic materials, a year before Health Canada acted. The health minister said there was not enough proof. Why act with precaution when other countries in Europe were banning these materials? I want to tell members that I was sitting across from the minister in the House when he said that there was absolutely no need at all. The lives of Canadian children were put at risk for another year. The minister said a year later "We have to ban them. They are not good".

One of those phthalates I had wrapped up in a little shower gift to give to a friend's baby. When I phoned to find out about which products were okay and which were not, the Health Canada line did not tell me which products were bad, it told me all the ones which were good. I just had to find that toy and try to track it down because I could not find out from Health Canada. It did not want to upset industry by saying that a product was bad. Luckily, as a member of parliament, enough organizations had sent information to say that the gift was bad. Those wonderful soft fingers and toes that I was going to give that baby to chew on are now sitting in the closet. Maybe I can send them as a gift to the health minister.

The bottom line is that for a year longer children were put at risk because of the government's failure to do what was absolutely necessary. Why not have a legislated requirement to investigate any potential risk to children?

Once again let us talk about the issue of tainted blood and the arguments we heard that it was not a problem and the government was doing everything it could. We knew that in some countries other things were being done. Why take the chance? Why on earth would we take the chance of jeopardizing someone's life, except for the arrogance of thinking that we are right, like the government did? It just went ahead and did whatever. It was not going to ensure the protection of Canadians. That is the problem.

• (1620)

Returning to the issue of toys, the member for Acadie—Bathurst introduced a private member's motion to protect children from chemicals in toys, but Liberal members voted against our motion. It is not only the health minister who should take the credit for having to wait one year longer. Every Liberal member who voted

should take the credit for jeopardizing the health of Canadian children for an extra year.

A listing process, such as the one described in our Motions Nos. 41, 70 and 73, would have avoided the Liberal government's embarrassment and inaction.

These Group No. 6 motions will assist the government in reducing the potential adverse impacts on children from a variety of substances, including pesticides. The requirement could be there for ministers to address children's vulnerability to toxic substances while gathering information for research. No one would be put at risk. We would be ensuring that one extra step toward protection.

I know there are other members who want to talk on this subject because it is very serious and there has been a time allocation ordered. Because of all the serious issues with health care, the environment for a while has been on the back burner.

It is extremely important that we ensure this is good, decent and strong legislation. We must not allow this skirting around of the issue. I encourage everyone to support our amendments. Let us put a piece of environmental legislation through that will protect Canadians.

[Translation]

**Mr. Claude Bachand (Saint-Jean, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, first I want to join my colleagues in commending the hon. member for Jonquière for her excellent work. The member is known for her relentless work and the emphasis she puts on team work.

Several times, she has asked her colleagues from the Bloc to help her deal with some issues that were raised in committee and with which they were more familiar. Since I am the critic for Indian affairs for my party, I have met a few times with native groups. The Assembly of First Nations made a presentation that attracted a lot of attention, and I think the Inuit Tapirisat also came before the committee.

Since several native groups did participate in the process, I feel I can speak on this issue.

First, let me read a quote from the report of the royal commission that I find very significant. It deals with the events that occurred in the Yukon during the gold rush. "When Skookum Jim found some gold, everything changed. The first white men came to our country. They took everything the Indians had. Now, they want this country, this land. I have 64 grandchildren in the Yukon. I worry about them. What will happen? Where are the grandparents of the white kids? The native people should have their own land". For the record, this is a quote from Annie Ned, an excerpt from a book by Julie Cruikshank, *Life lived like a story*, published by the University of British Columbia Press.

*Government Orders*

I think this excerpt helps put things in perspective. Considering the way things have evolved regarding the environmental issue, we have nothing to brag about. Again, I can read excerpts of the royal commission which says that many descriptions of the environment were made back then, when the Europeans arrived, namely by the Jesuits.

They described flocks of ducks and Canada geese so dense that they were like a cloud obscuring the sun. Or miraculous fishing trips where Europeans only had to stick their hands in the river to catch fish.

Of course, there is something symbolic in all this. Maybe some facts are not absolutely exact. But this goes to show that before the Europeans came, native people were living in an environment that was untouched and perfect. They always had the greatest respect for the environment. What happened after white people came to this country? Well things began to deteriorate.

• (1625)

With the recent developments of the 60's, 70's and 80's, things are far from getting better. Instead, they are getting worse. Natives in the North have often told me they were very concerned about mining projects, among other things.

A while ago I mentioned the Yukon. I went there when I was first elected here in 1993. I saw the disaster caused by the gold rush which totally changed nature and the environment. Consequently, the aboriginals are stuck with lands for which they have made claims but on which they must sacrifice part of their environmental standards and of their great respect for nature. It is somewhat distressing for them, and it is some of the things they often mention.

There is also, in the far north, mercury pollution left behind on Canadian and American bases. Canada and the U.S. ran these bases, but left everything behind. There is so much pollution that the Inuit are deeply concerned about the food chain, which is deteriorating. Traces of mercury have even been found in breast milk. That is something we often hear, and the situation is far from improving.

We have nothing to be proud of. Some will say "Quebec is no better because it also caused some deterioration to the environment". People often refer to the James Bay Agreement, to which I say "What about hydro in Manitoba? The Cree were the victims of hydro projects ten times worse than what was done in a civil way in Quebec".

I am sure that we have had our disagreements with the aboriginals, but we settled our difficulties and we are continuing to settle problems, for that matter. There are demands for the reopening of the James Bay agreement, and there are important environmental components that the Government of Quebec is ready to look at.

I join with my colleagues in saying that this bill will, once again, create duplication and overlap. As per usual, Ottawa is acting like a big brother who wants to manage the whole environmental issue and go over the provinces' heads. This is utterly deplorable.

Under the James Bay agreement, Quebec can say to aboriginal peoples "We are ready to re-examine some provisions in order to update them; if you have concerns about the environment, we are ready to work with you in order to correct them".

In Quebec, there is a tradition of negotiating with the aboriginal peoples that is quite unlike what occurred in Manitoba. When I say ten times worse, I refer to the fact that rivers in Manitoba have been diverted and that the lands of some aboriginal peoples have been completely flooded.

Today, several decades later, those peoples are still demanding compensation and those issues have yet to be settled. In fact, some bills dealing with aboriginal peoples and in particular with the terrible hydro situation in Manitoba will soon be introduced in the House of Commons.

I also travelled to British Columbia on several occasions and it is a true scandal to see the clear-cutting that is going on there. I raised the issue with the federal Minister of Natural Resources and his counterpart in British Columbia. The government's strategy is quite simple: when lands are claimed by aboriginal peoples, that sets off a rush on natural resources. In other words, the idea is to get out as much of the resources as possible then, once clear-cutting is completed, the government announces to the aboriginal peoples that it is ready to transfer lands.

This strategy is rather crooked. On the road, hundreds of trucks go by. Loggers practice clear-cutting, load trucks and then race to get as much of the natural resources as possible from lands claimed by aboriginal peoples.

• (1630)

I saw that with the Nisga'a. Fortunately, this fall we are probably going ahead with the passage of a bill which will confirm the final signing with the Nisga'a.

There are other aboriginal communities, such as the Chilkotin and the Carrier-Sekani, who are making land claims and are having to watch powerless while their forests are systematically being cut down. When the cutting is over, then the aboriginal peoples will be told "Now we are ready to sit down with you and negotiate land claims". They are going to find they have very little left.

I also wish to congratulate my colleague from Jonquière for having succeeded in getting the concept of traditional aboriginal knowledge included in the preamble. This is very important in today's context.

*Government Orders*

The aboriginal peoples' environmental expertise must be acknowledged. The environment is very important, not only as part of their culture, but also because of its link to their traditions of hunting, fishing and gathering. The oral nature of their traditions must be addressed. The Delgamuukw decision in the supreme court now recognizes that increasing importance will be attached to the oral tradition. I would like to congratulate my colleague for getting this included, at least in the preamble.

As for the overlap in general, as for the matter of big brother in Ottawa assuming the right to go over the provinces' heads, if the government does not heed the amendments submitted by my party, then of course the Bloc Québécois will be forced to vote against Bill C-32.

In closing, I wish to thank the hon. member for Jonquière for her excellent work.

[*English*]

**Mrs. Michelle Dockrill (Bras d'Or—Cape Breton, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, the auditor general and the Commissioner for the Environment have identified contaminated and polluted sites as a major liability that is hurting Canadians and our children on a daily basis.

It is not only the health liability that is a concern, it is also the financial liability that drains millions from the government's coffers in the form of cleanup costs and increased medical bills for families and their children living in a contaminated zone.

In my home, Cape Breton Island, we know all about costs. The Sydney tar ponds, the largest toxic waste site in Canada, are endangering the health of our families and our children and putting a brake on attempts to energize the economy. Who wants to open up shop on contaminated land?

The New Democratic Party believes in green initiatives, that cleaning up industrial waste and other toxic sites presents not only a challenge that needs to be addressed but an economic opportunity to be grasped.

For people in Cape Breton the remediation of the thousands of acres contaminated by centuries of coal mining and heavy industry offers the prospect of stable work and the opportunity for Cape Breton to become a centre of excellence in the environmental cleanup industry. Excellence is an important word to focus on because it is essential that any of these projects that are undertaken from coast to coast be done to the highest standards.

Although I have just emphasized the economic benefits that can come from a sensitivity to environmental concerns, it is crucial that the quest to create jobs not obscure the main objective which is to make sure that the toxic sites are properly cleaned once and for all.

Too often contaminated sites have been cleaned up with a layer of topsoil and some daisies leaving the contaminants in the ground

to endanger our future generations. Cleanups need to begin with a proper assessment of the situation at each site and the cleanup needs to follow a clear and transparent process from start to finish.

Many of the problems experienced during site cleaning are caused by a lack of communication with the public and with affected populations. For example, the recent and commendable decision by the Nova Scotia government to relocate residents living on two streets adjacent to the Sydney tar ponds has simply created more tension because the relocation appears to have been executed as a reaction to public pressure not as part of an overall strategy.

In Cape Breton a clear plan is essential as any errors made in a region with fractured bedrock could result in long term recontamination of the groundwater.

Just as we have fought the financial deficit, we have to address the environmental deficit. We cannot leave this debt for our grandchildren to pay, especially as the price will be paid in birth defects, disease and premature death.

Government after government has ignored the recommendations of the environment commissioner, covering their lack of action with warm words. I hope the government will have the courage to break that cycle and that we on the NDP benches will have the opportunity to work with the government and all Canadians of goodwill on this crucial issue.

● (1635)

Children are at special risk from the effects of pollution. To once again speak of my home, we have recently learned from a study released in Cape Breton that the rate of birth defects is much higher than the national average. Independent sources confirm that the true picture is much worse.

We have to make a commitment to our children that we will provide them with what the United States Environmental Protection Act defines "as areas that are reasonably accessible to children". That means clean streets, clean soil and clean water.

As the mother of a 10 year old daughter and an 8 month old son, I owe it to my children and we as a government owe it to Canadian children.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Jean-Guy Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, in the context of Bill C-32, the motions in Group No. 6 contain major amendments to the original version of bill.

I do not want to reiterate all that my colleagues have said before me, especially my colleagues in the Bloc Québécois, inspired here by our environment critic, the member for Jonquière.

*Government Orders*

I would like to take a closer look at this government's lack of environmental responsibility since 1993 and discuss waste.

In 1993, when the Prime Minister, the member for Saint-Maurice, formed his cabinet, he appointed the member for Hamilton, at the time, the Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of the Environment. We agree that the environment is the most important department, especially in an election. Non-living and living elements must be respected.

A few months later, she was obliged to leave her post for failing to honour an election promise on the GST. We lost our Minister of the Environment, because she resigned. The Prime Minister appointed another Minister of the Environment, and, according to our evaluation and that of the public at large, quality continued to drop. Following the 1997 election, we were given a third Minister of the Environment. Clearly there is a lack of responsibility.

The good member for Davenport, an environmentalist and an ecologist of renown, served as Minister of the Environment under John Turner. He was, with Lucien Bouchard, one of the best Ministers of the Environment. I would like to salute him in this House. The member for Davenport, chairman of the standing committee on the environment, is surely not proud of his government.

First of all, as the member for Beauport—Montmorency—Côte-de-Beaupré—Île-d'Orléans put it so well, there was a record number of amendments. A total of 580 amendments have been introduced. It took 60 sessions to study Bill C-32 clause by clause. Finally, the committee managed to pass some 160 amendments.

This morning in *Le Devoir*, there is an article by Manon Cornellier, under the heading "A Little Breathing Space". She supports the rebellion among the Liberal Party backbenchers, in particular the six who dared to vote against their party line last week. The government, with its 156 members, does not enjoy a huge majority. So when six members form a separate group, it puts the good Liberal government we have before us at some risk.

• (1640)

I would like to quote a short paragraph about the dissident members:

Liberal members have also targeted a number of bills. The first one, Bill C-32, deals with the prevention of pollution by toxic substances. The Standing Committee on the Environment, including the Liberal members, has decided to provide real means of action. The ministers that are more responsive—

Listen to that. This is really not serious, and we do not have a very capable environment minister.

The ministers that are more responsive to the concerns of industry did not appreciate that. They have forced the environment minister to block the committee through a series of amendments. As a result, 233 amendments of all kinds have been introduced.

They have twisted the arm of the hon. member for Davenport, a former environment minister.

We cannot help but conclude that the environment is not a priority for the government of the hon. member for Saint-Maurice. Our environment has four non-living elements: air, water, soil, and light. When we speak about our children and their future, we should at least pass on to them clean water, uncontaminated soil, air that will not cause cancer to 5 or 6-year old children, something that does occur in certain areas of this country.

The soil is under provincial jurisdiction. With respect to the environment, Quebec is well ahead of even the federal government, and of course all the other provinces. Quebec is a leader on environmental matters.

In this regard the member for Lac-Saint-Louis, who headed the environment ministry under Robert Bourassa in the 70s did a pretty good job, I must admit, with the resources and the budget he was allocated. He did a good job, and it must be said that in Quebec we look after our land, not only septic tanks. We look after our environment.

When we talk about the air and the water, we know we all breathe the same air. We drink water. We also know water flows downhill, not uphill.

If we could have a responsible world government that would deal with water and air pollution, things might be better. Light comes from the sun. We will deal with smog later on.

With regard to water, let us take the most visible example, the St. Lawrence River. It is shared not only by two provinces, but by two countries. The United States are largely contributing to the pollution of the St. Lawrence River. It flows through Montreal and the Gaspé. The effects of pollution on the food chain are increasing visible as the member for Saint-Jean mentioned. The fish we eat might make us very sick because of the heavy metals, especially mercury, it contains.

We doubt the government is very serious about the environment. The federal government is trampling over this field as it did with the millennium scholarships. It was outside its jurisdiction, but it got in through its spending power. They even wanted to force our education minister to negotiate with Jean Monty.

We told Jean Monty "Look after your employees instead". Look after you company, Bell Canada. If you have some spare time left, go play golf, engage in PR activities, but do not get involved in things in which you have no business, such as the scholarships". As members know, this is a provincial jurisdiction.

Now, the government is duplicating structures in the environmental sector. When the Canadian Constitution was signed in 1867, the environment was not a priority. The 1867 Constitution is

*Government Orders*

totally silent on jurisdictions, on the sharing of powers regarding the environment. An agreement was reached over the years.

Under that agreement, when specific issues concern more than one province, the federal government is in charge, such as in the case of hunting permits.

• (1645)

If a person wants to go duck hunting, he or she will need to get a permit from the post office. I know members are well aware of that since migrating birds come under federal jurisdiction. However, if a person wants to go partridge hunting, he or she will need a provincial permit, because partridges stick to a very small area.

Once again, the federal government is about to duplicate existing structures, and the taxpayer always ends up paying double. It is like the example I gave last week in the House, with two agriculture ministers being responsible for the same milk cow. If the milk is processed or consumed locally, there are two jurisdictions, but it is the same cow and the same producer. The situation is similar here.

**The Deputy Speaker:** It is my duty, pursuant to Standing Order 38, to inform the House that the question to be raised tonight at the time of adjournment is as follows: the hon. member for Halifax West, Kosovo.

[*English*]

**Ms. Louise Hardy (Yukon, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, this protection legislation is absolutely critical. Oftentimes in committee we deal with immediate matters, but the environment committee took on the responsibility for producing or refining legislation that would truly protect our environment not just for now but for the future.

The future is embodied in our children and their children, our progeny for generations to come. We cannot fool ourselves into thinking that as things stand they are just fine, and if we carry on as we are there will be no repercussions. Every decision we make should be in regard to how we want to protect our children and their ability to live their lives to the fullest.

In 1997 there was an Arctic contaminants report which dealt with persistent organic pollutants and the disproportionate effects of these pollutants in the north. As they evaporate out of the south in warmer climates where they are produced in more industrial areas and move farther and farther north, they do not evaporate. They sink into the environment in very high numbers, causing extremely insidious and serious problems for the animals and the people who live there.

After a six year study it was found that the level of contaminants, and these include DDT, were extremely high in the breast milk of indigenous peoples and other women who have lived their lives in the north. There will be unusual infections; exhaustion; tumours; a

very high level of thyroid malfunction, which does not sound like much until one has been someone who has suffered from that; depression; and miscarriages.

What has come to light is not necessarily that there has to be a particularly high level of the toxin, but it can be a level at the time of exposure during a window of opportunity or a window of exposure for contamination at a low level that can disrupt the whole endocrine system and interfere with the development of the thyroid.

As it happens, the level of children with attention deficit disorders who also have thyroid problems is around 80%. They can be hyperthyroid, which is overactive, and have all the problems that come with it, or they can be hypothyroid, which can make them very lethargic, apathetic and suffer from depression and the ability to concentrate. Those are just different sides of the same coin. Their bodies will actually resist the absorption of any kind of thyroid hormone which regulates their whole metabolic system, from their temperature to their thinking to their ability to put a sentence together.

We are talking about the mental development of children who are affected by low levels of toxins and low levels of toxins in combination. These are not unusual toxins that are only found in laboratories or in very rare places. These are such things as nitrates, things that are used to wash our clothes. A small and low level dose at a certain time can be devastating on the life of a child who is developing or a fetus that is developing.

• (1650)

There is much we do not know and are responsible for. It is our responsibility as legislators, as members of parliament, to make sure we gather the information we need to make decisions which will protect our environment. Over the last years the Liberal government has withdrawn funding from study in the Arctic.

At present no universities have cold rooms. The University of Alberta is actually reactivating its cold room. The rest of universities have turned their cold rooms, which were places to study the effects of colder areas, into storage areas.

Other circumpolar countries have scooped up our scientists just because we would not fund the kind of research we need into the effects of toxins and pollutants in the Arctic. Finland has taken some of our premier scientists in the area of studying our cold climate. The north forms a huge part of Canada and the rest of Canada is a cold place as well. We need that research. We need that knowledge which we have abandoned.

Our children are exposed to toxins through the wind and the air, toxins that we have not produced in our country. The north is disproportionately affected by them. Children are affected by toxins in toys, gasoline fumes, food and the air we breathe. They do not have the capacity to deal with them. Their bodies have not



developed enough strength to withstand the assault of toxins from many different sources.

All of us can probably withstand some toxic exposure in small amounts at certain times, but no one can withstand a constant exposure from various areas when their immune systems have not developed enough to deal with them.

The north is particularly vulnerable to toxins, but politically it is particularly vulnerable because it is not well represented. For the huge area of the north there are three members of parliament and two senators. As it stands, neither of those senators has lived in the north for over 20 years. It is kind of tenuous to think of their connection with life in the north.

The biggest issue we need to deal with is hormone disrupting toxins which are now rampant in our environment. On a personal level, I do not let my sons drink milk out of plastic cartons any more. I do not want to take the chance of what that could do to their future or their ability to father children as they get older.

As legislators we cannot let this pass by and think that someone will take care of it. I find shocking that we would lessen the health of our children and would not do everything we could as legislators to make sure our environment is safe for our children.

In closing, it is an incredible shame that closure was invoked on this legislation because it is critical for our future and for our children. The legislation was gutted shamelessly and we are expected to applaud ineffectual legislation that is nothing more than a whitewash when what Canadian citizens want is true, enforceable environmental protection for our future and for our children.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Pierre Brien (Témiscamingue, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, I rise to speak to Bill C-32 at report stage.

Given the number of amendments, one might well wonder why, in the face of so much criticism, the government is bent on getting the bill through before the House rises for the summer, something which is scheduled for mid-June.

• (1655)

There is something improvised about all this, despite the drawn-out process, because the federal government has long wanted to extend its jurisdiction over the environment.

On the face of it, no one will contest the fact that we must take an interest in matters affecting the environment. Climatic conditions that are changing quickly and the number of devastating events related to different environmental conditions raise questions about the causes of these phenomena and particularly about what we

### *Government Orders*

must do to make up for all the damage we have caused in recent years.

I am well placed to speak about this. In my riding, in Rouyn-Noranda, we have made a signal change, and a good thing, because living conditions were deteriorating very rapidly until one day people decided to fight to improve their environmental quality of life.

At the time, many stakeholders said that Noranda would shut down but, today, on the contrary, it is alive and very well, and the quality of life in Rouyn-Noranda has changed dramatically in 10 or 15 years.

We can therefore meet this environmental challenge if we roll up our sleeves. Our businesses are also capable of adapting and developing environmental technology before others do.

In areas where some employers now have a tendency to take undue advantage of easy operating conditions, with very low environmental standards, people will also, sooner or later, take matters in their hands and demand better living conditions. Obviously, there will be upward pressure on environmental standards.

Since people's concern about this debate is increasing, the federal government, which is suddenly acting more like a business, sees in this some sort of opportunity to extend its action into people's lives, ignoring the other actors that are already there. In this case, the provinces have an important and crucial role to play in the environment, which the federal government seems to be ignoring increasingly, and very likely with the consent of many provinces.

This is not the case for all the provinces, particularly Quebec, which has greater aspirations than to remain a mere province. Several provinces are abdicating their responsibility, but this is not the case with Quebec, which aspires to much more.

In this bill, as in many other intrusions, the federal government is extending its jurisdiction little by little. It had the opportunity and has already done so many times in the Criminal Code with respect to the environment, but it wants to carry this even a little further with standards, objectives and mostly, the need to honour international agreements or international commitments made by Canada.

This illustrates a problem that was in the media in the last few months for the provinces, and particularly for Quebec. It is extremely frustrating to have someone speak and make commitments on our behalf at the international level and then ask us to fulfil them, when in many cases, Quebec and other provinces were not allowed to take part as much as they would have liked in the setting of the goals Canada has been promoting at the world level.

The provinces were unable to directly take part in the discussions or the negotiations, but in practice they are the ones that have

*Government Orders*

to manage the new initiatives without having had the opportunity to set the parameters and the goals and to develop an environmental strategy.

A lot of my constituents work in the pulp and paper and the mining industries, two areas where environmental regulation is extremely important. Meeting goals is not the main problem these people have. They are faced with two kinds of problems. They often have two sets of goals to meet. It is not always easy to determine which set of regulations, the federal or the provincial, takes precedence.

On the one hand, these people have to adjust to an environmental context or to environmental standards that vary from one level of government to the other, because there is always some kind of overlap, whatever the substances involved.

• (1700)

On the other hand, when we tell them how they can meet those standards, it annoys them tremendously. We can tell them not to go over so many parts per million of a given chemical, but they should have sufficient latitude and flexibility to be able to adapt approaches in the most competitive way possible.

We often see now Environment Canada or other departments go in the field to tell people how to go about it, showing how one way is better than the other, and all that slows the process down a lot.

There is yet another greater danger to not taking care of the environment. There is a danger of over bureaucratizing our actions in that sector, making them slow and ineffective most of the time.

The danger is often greater because in most of the provinces, there will be two levels of bureaucracy that will try and expand their role in the environment sector. We will eventually have to face many rules, standards, and ways to meet them, a great deal of confusion and difficulty for the businesses in meeting them, and all sorts of legal challenges.

All this does not seem to bother the federal government too much. The federal government no longer cares about respecting jurisdictions. All that matters is that the commitments and goals it will make and negotiate on the international scene be met.

By the way, Canada has not taken a strong leadership on environmental issues in recent years. It has not acted as a leader in that area. Though it has taken an active part in negotiations, this government cannot be considered as having acted as a true leader in respect of environmental standards. The same holds true for human rights.

Commercial interests took precedence over numerous concerns of this government, which had taken the opposite stand when it was on this side of the House, when the Progressive Conservatives were in power. Ironically, there is a remarkable continuity on some

aspects of international trade: the positions held by one party were adopted by the other as soon as it was elected.

What concerns me is the issue for which I am responsible, federal-provincial relations. We see here what we have seen on several other issues. The recent framework agreement on social union was in the same vein: provinces, in exchange for money that would allow them to administer programs—which have nothing to do with the environment in that case, but deal with health and other areas—accepted to let the federal government play a greater part as a planner for the whole of Canada.

It is also true for the environment, as we can see. Several provinces are being very discrete, they say nothing, often because their respective populations consider the federal government as the true national government and wish to see it fulfil that role. In Quebec, we have a completely different view.

For Quebecers, be they federalists or sovereignists, the most important government is the provincial one. It is the one closest to them. It is the one they monitor the most; this has its advantages and disadvantages, but it is good for democracy that people keep a close eye on their government, and the people of Quebec do exactly that.

This habit, this capacity to influence decisions are probably greater there than they are here. It is a framework that stakeholders know better. That government is much closer to the people and can better satisfy its environmental needs and expectations.

This trend will bring the federal government to play a greater role. And this is only the beginning. The federal government has one great quality, it is very patient. Whenever it invades another jurisdiction, it does so very progressively, but irreversibly. In the end, we see there is not much provincial jurisdiction left.

In the environmental area, there is a great risk of the federal government becoming the sole player because it is the one acting on the international scene; it will implement international agreements and commitments, it will define the regulations developed by cabinet. These will not necessarily be passed by the members, but rather by cabinet.

For all those reasons, we must oppose this bill, unless it is substantially amended as my colleague proposed. Otherwise, we will have to vote against this bill.

• (1705)

**Mrs. Francine Lalonde (Mercier, BQ):** Madam Speaker, I am happy to speak on this important legislation. Like my colleagues, I want to commend the hon. member for Jonquière for her work and the way she got many members involved in this important process.

It is not a surprise for the members of this House to see the members of the Bloc Québécois attack the jurisdictional intrusion

this legislation constitutes. Is it because we are constantly concerned by the constitutional issue? No. If we feel it is important for Quebec to keep the powers and the flexibility it has as a government, it is for reasons of efficiency.

It is too often forgotten here in Ottawa that it is not enough to draft legislation or to speak on the environment to get something concrete done. On the contrary, we have every reason to fear the effects of this bill on the environment.

Let us recognize that an act whose enforcement and regulations is left solely to the cabinet offers no guarantee to Quebecers and Canadians, and for a very good reason. I remind members that in a previous life I was the vice-president of a central labour body and responsible for occupational safety and health. It is not too far-fetched to compare both these domains.

In the case of occupational health and safety, which has been associated with labour, had the privy council in London not confirmed the provinces' jurisdiction in 1925, the federal government would have had jurisdiction in this area. I do not even dare imagine what it would have been like. Working in that area made me understand that changes dealing with the environment, both within and outside businesses, are made only if businesses want to make such changes or if they are forced to do so by a union.

Of course, inspectors will visit the workplace, which is important, but the enforcement of such a law cannot depend solely on inspectors. Since we are talking here about the whole environment of businesses, what is needed is social involvement. It is just an illusion to vote here in favour of a text, as strong as it may be, thinking that we will change things simply by giving this responsibility to the federal cabinet. To a certain extent, it is like thinking that words, as strong as they may be, are equivalent to real changes.

Making real changes in the environment requires clear objectives. It requires co-operation from businesses and pressure from the people. Without the latter, clear objectives will not be set and things will not change within businesses. It also requires co-operation from unions, from community groups and from non-profit organizations. There is a whole social context involved.

Where can this group, composed of those who can apply pressure, best exert its influence? It is not at the federal government level. Protesting in front of a building here will not change what is going on at Alcan, in Chicoutimi. Important changes have been made.

• (1710)

But if we look at history, it is the stakeholders, that is the organizations, unions and journalists, who bring about change. Quebec stakeholders are the most active and relentless, not only when a bill is passed, but at all times. I have never seen anything like it anywhere else in Canada.

### *Government Orders*

The best proof of this is that this government was able to cut 42% of the environment's budget. Did we hear loud protests because of the dangers of such cuts? No, because the greater the distance between the legislation and those it may affect, the greater the leeway available to those who will be able to exert pressure and lobby.

The best way to effect change in the environment is by having people take charge and exert pressure on the government that is closest to them. I am proud of what the Government of Quebec has done in many fields. There are other fields where much remains to be done, but the Government of Quebec cannot change the way the BAPE works without causing a general outcry. There is a vigilance that could not be ensured otherwise.

We are deluding ourselves if we are thinking that by passing a law, as strong as it may be, we can guarantee results and change. This is why I regret so much that this bill is not putting more emphasis on harmonization between governments and is not allowing those who are more likely to push for change to have their say. Instead of this, the federal government goes as far as saying that, following negotiations with a provincial government, and I quote clause 9(9):

No agreement made under this section shall limit or restrict the carrying out of any action the Minister

—the federal minister, of course—

deems necessary for the administration and enforcement of this act, including the conduct of inspections or investigations.

We can see what a lovely thing we have here. The minister goes into a company and finds the levels too high. Come now.

It is most regrettable that this reform of the environment legislation has given rise to what my colleague from Jonquière will not feel it is an exaggeration to call a circus. The environment is an extremely serious matter. Canada is far from being a leader in this area, as we know. We saw that in Kyoto, where it backtracked instead of advancing. No one is sure that the new objectives set will be attained. This bill is not a guarantee in any way whatsoever. The real guarantee lies once again with the social, and to a certain degree, the economic relationships that will develop.

This is a Quebec matter, unfortunately, but that is how it is. It is totally illogical to believe that taking power from Quebec will step up any pressure whatsoever to make the businesses, groups and individuals responsible for the deterioration in the environment change their ways.

I will close with a general remark. In this parliament, people often have the impression that merely talking about something and passing some legislative text will have a concrete effect on reality. However, we must ask ourselves how indeed we will be in a position to bring about real change. The way to do it is not by

*Government Orders*

taking power from where it can be best exercised, under the watchful eye of the people.

**Mr. Yves Rocheleau (Trois-Rivières, BQ):** Madam Speaker, I am very pleased to take part in today's debate on Bill C-32, an act respecting pollution prevention and the protection of the environment and human health in order to contribute to sustainable development. It could not have come at a better time, and this is one of the reasons I am interested in the debate.

• (1715)

There is an important problem in my riding of Trois-Rivières with regard to the National Defence Proof and Experimental Test Establishment at Lake Saint-Pierre, where testing is conducted in co-operation with SNC Industrial Technologies Inc. This proof and experimental test establishment has been in existence for over 50 years, since 1947.

In this context, I would like to pay tribute to the people who have been the engine and the soul of the movement known as the lakeside residents' action group, set up in Pointe-du-Lac, namely Messrs. Philippe Giroulet and Jacques Brouillard, for their tenacity and perseverance. They have been fighting for eight years to expose the activities of the National Defence Department in the Lake Saint-Pierre area, which activities of course entail pollution and an attack on the lake's extraordinary ecosystem.

I would just like to pay tribute to these people who have shown great tenacity. They have lobbied diligently over the last eight years to make both the federal and Quebec governments aware of the problem.

Just as an indication, over eight years, they have had to deal with five national defence ministers and five environment ministers in the Government of Canada. This goes to show how persevering they have been.

Personally, I had to get involved. On June 12, 1996, I proudly presented a petition signed by 3,000 people who were condemning the activities of the Department of National Defence regarding this issue. I can say that the situation is changing.

As the name of that centre suggests, experiments and tests are conducted on shells, both inside and outside the facility. It is the activities taking place outside that pose a problem. They literally shell Lake Saint-Pierre. A large number of these shells are live. The shelling takes place in winter and summer. In the summer, shells fall directly into the water and sink to the bottom. In the winter, they stay on the ice. They either remain there until the spring, when they sink to the bottom of the lake or, and this is more worrisome in a way, the current can move these shells hundreds of kilometres downstream. This makes the whole issue even more problematic, because there is increasing awareness regarding the cleaning and the safety measures that are required.

A tragedy occurred in 1982. One person was killed and nine were injured, when someone mistook a shell for a log to be used in a bonfire, on Saint-Jean-Baptiste Day. The person tossed the shell into the fire. The shell then exploded with the tragic consequences I just mentioned. Other similar incidents could occur. It is urgent that the government take action.

I want to pay tribute to the hon. member for Jonquière, who dealt with this issue with great skill, along with the hon. member for Joliette, who sits on the Standing Committee on National Defence, to ensure that the federal government be formally made aware of the situation. This was done through the Standing Committee on the Environment.

The committee passed a resolution recommending to the government that a moratorium be put in place effective January 1, 2000. We personally would have preferred it be put in effect immediately. It will be interesting to see whether this government has the political will to put a stop to these activities.

It will be interesting to see how politics deal with this resolution, which appears very positive and would be in public interest.

The Department of National Defence must stop considering Lake Saint-Pierre a garbage can. Lake Saint-Pierre is in fact an extraordinary ecosystem. It has been recognized by the United Nations, through UNESCO. It is from this perspective it must be seen and not from that of the Department of National Defence, as has been the case up to now.

• (1720)

I would also like to look at the very important question of Bill C-32 from a constitutional perspective.

I, who consider myself an old and longstanding sovereignist, consider Bill C-32 part of a new initiative and a new tack taken by the federal government, which is weaving a canvas in which the Canada of tomorrow, the Canada of the years 2000, the Canada of the next century, will be a centralized and unitarian Canada in which the provincial governments will become branch offices, and, to use the term of my colleague opposite, the minister responsible for regional development, partners that are no doubt given better treatment than the hospitals, school boards and the chambers of commerce, but partners all the same.

This is what the future holds for the Canadian provinces. As my colleague from Témiscamingue said earlier, the federal government acts very efficiently and slowly. Slowly but surely, the federal government is spinning its web in order to make sure that the decisions are made here and no longer in Nova Scotia, Vancouver, or Toronto, and certainly not in Quebec City, so that this country can be effective internationally. It has no choice.

*Government Orders*

This is what Canada must do. It is what provincial governments will probably have to recognize in provincial back rooms, but it is a disaster for Quebec, which is a nation, to see the Canadian government spinning its web to ensure that the decisions are made here.

In the case of Bill C-32, it is not complicated, because the federal government is forced to play its hand. We find this political hand clearly set out in paragraph 9(1):

The Minister may negotiate an agreement with a government or with an aboriginal people with respect to the administration of this Act.

The reservation that will ensure that Canada will be administered the way the federal government wants it to be administered is to be found in paragraph 9(9), which reads as follows:

No agreement made under this section shall limit or restrict the carrying out of any action the Minister—

The federal minister, of course.

—deems necessary for the administration and enforcement of this Act, including the conduct of inspections or investigations.

This is being done systematically, with the complicity, the collaboration and the blessing of Canadian institutions, the Canadian administrative structure, particularly the supreme court, which handed down a ruling overturning decisions by Quebec's courts, which recognized the supremacy of the Government of Quebec with respect to the environment.

Historically, this was a shared jurisdiction, as recognized by the Quebec courts and the courts of appeal. We now have the supreme court telling us that, from now on, the federal government will have ultimate jurisdiction in this area.

There was also the environment commissioner, who ruled, in connection with pulp and paper, that, in the event of negligence on the part of a province, the federal government had the last word. The federal government is free to interfere in provincial matters. The other provinces may feel this is a good thing. It is a Canadian issue and concerns them. In fact, if I were federalist, I would be as fond as centralizing as Trudeau was. But this is quite upsetting to Quebec as a nation.

This is not the first time that such an attempt is made. We have to realize that. This is where the government machinery is really efficient.

It happened recently in education, with the millennium scholarship program, in a recognized area of provincial jurisdiction.

It has also happened recently in the area of justice, with the Young Offenders Act, a field where the province of Quebec is doing exceptionally well and where it is now being told by the federal government to move aside and implement the federal

policy, a more punitive policy than that of Quebec, where there is a coalition in this area.

It has happened in the revenue area, where a Canada Customs and Revenue Agency will soon offer to collect taxes on behalf of the various levels of government, not only the federal government, but also the provinces, the municipalities, and even to act on behalf of private corporations that would want to use its services.

This only goes to prove that here, in Ottawa, centralization is still the main focus.

We regularly see the intrusion in the area of health care, where the government of Quebec has taken some very innovative measures that the federal government is now implementing by setting national standards from coast to coast, without respecting Quebec's precedence in this area of jurisdiction.

• (1725)

**Mr. Pierre de Savoye (Portneuf, BQ):** Madam Speaker, I am pleased to rise this afternoon to speak to this bill entitled Canadian Environmental Protection Act, 1999.

I had the privilege—and I say privilege because it was quite an experience, as you will soon understand—to be associated with the standing committee on the environment, through my colleague, the member for Jonquière. Since she was snowed under with work, she asked me on a few occasions if I could replace her.

Being a member of the standing committee on natural resources, you will understand that there is a certain relationship between the work of these two committees with regard to the environment. It is with pleasure that I took part in the work of the standing committee on the environment.

I will say from the outset that I see two kinds of problems with this bill. The first problem is excessive centralization on the part of the federal government in an area of shared jurisdiction between the federal state, the provinces and the state of Quebec. The second problem concerns the intrinsic quality of the bill.

We can ask ourselves a couple of questions. Is this a good, solid and reliable bill with predictable consequences on the environment, businesses and society? Have the various measures been properly harmonized?

I will first talk about this issue regarding the quality of the bill. As you know and as several of my colleagues mentioned, it was an awesome task for the committee. Indeed hundreds of amendments were introduced in committee.

My background is computer science. I am used to studying issues in a structured and orderly manner, carefully analysing all the consequences. I must say that to my amazement we went from

*Government Orders*

one amendment to the next in a helter-skelter way. It was crazy, not stark crazy, but crazy enough.

I am smiling now, but there was nothing funny in all that. The two and a half to three hours we spent skipping from one amendment to the next was the most foolish experience I have ever had. Either the officials, the experts who should or could have explained things to us, were not prepared to give us the necessary information or someone somewhere was not really willing to discuss these amendments. So for two and a half or three hours, we merely went through all the amendments without really studying them because we were not prepared.

At the end of these three hours, nothing had been accomplished. Worse yet, we managed to strike down an amendment we had agreed on at a previous meeting. We were going backward.

I realize these issues are complex. The bill touches on a great many areas. It touches on land, water and air. It deals with all kinds of pollutants, gaseous, liquid, solid, radioactive, living or inert pollutants. It touches on energy issues. It touches on shipping, road transportation. It touches on everything.

In this respect one can admire the scope and the extent of concerns this bill is trying to answer. Believe me, I cannot say the bill does not raise the important environmental protection issues we must deal with.

• (1730)

This is not where the problem lies. The problem is that they are being badly addressed. I am going to say something now that may be a bit heavy-handed, but I feel it is very much to the point.

I do not believe there is anyone in this House, in any department, or in any of the specialized consulting firms, who is in a position to tell us straight out all the ins and outs of this bill, what the consequences will be, and what the good and bad effects.

According to my perceptions, this is a highly complex bill, and one which has not, unfortunately, received all the careful attention it ought to have had in committee. Not because my fellow MPs were not prepared to put the effort into it, but simply because the work was carried out, directed, supervised and disturbed in such a way that it was not possible to do a proper, reliable job.

I believe I said this in committee, and I will repeat it here: if a plane had been designed the way this bill was, no member of this House and no public servant would dare set foot in it. It would be too risky.

This is my perception of the situation we find ourselves in with this bill I repeat, the environment is something precious. This bill addresses areas that must be of great concern to us, without resolving them. This is where the danger lies in passing it.

The second important issue is the overcentralizing done by the federal government through this legislation.

The minister, the cabinet, the government and the public servants here in Ottawa will enjoy tremendous powers. They will be the sole masters of a ship whose operating capability we do not know. The problem is that they are taking us on board with them. It would not be so bad if we could get off.

When two levels of government, that is a federal and a provincial government, in this case Quebec, since this is where I live, share responsibilities regarding the environment, it is a good thing for them to co-ordinate their efforts. Bill C-32 could have the same effect as a steamroller.

Everything is provided in this bill so that the federal government can have the upper hand regarding the environment. In the context of globalization, Canada must, as a country, ratify a number of international agreements and must therefore have the powers to implement such agreements on its own territory. However, the federal government does it against the will of all those involved, by passing a bill that will give it such powers.

In Canada as we know it, there are big and small provinces, rich and not so rich provinces, provinces that would like Ottawa to take responsibilities on their behalf and others that prefer to assume these responsibilities themselves.

The bill does not respect that principle. This is why the Bloc Québécois cannot support it. The environment would be much better served and protected by those directly concerned. Then, arrangements could be made with our neighbours.

In short, the bill must be rejected for two reasons. First, it is bad legislation. Second, it does not respect the way the federation should work under the Constitution.

• (1735)

**Mrs. Pauline Picard (Drummond, BQ):** Madam Speaker, I would, right off, like to thank my colleague from Jonquière, who has worked so hard and with such determination to do her job as legislator on this committee. She has given us a very enlightened version of the events surrounding this bill. I would like to thank her for having shown us the negative effects of this bill.

I would like to speak of the elements of Bill C-32 that relate to health, more specifically toxic substances.

On May 27, the federal government announced with great pomp funding of \$10.9 million for research on toxic substances, as part of the toxic substance research initiative. This organization has a budget of \$40 million. It is a program that is intended to consolidate the means the federal government has at its disposal in health sciences and the environment. This has to last three years. During fiscal year 1999-2000, the Liberal government will fund 81

research projects in areas of research that are a priority for the toxic substance research initiative.

It was high time. I think the government has to be consistent when it looks out for the national welfare of its citizens. This government has been dragging its feet on environmental research, toxic substances found in water, in the air and in soil.

It asks no questions as to what is happening, why new diseases are developing and why more and more people have problems with asthma and younger people increasingly have allergies. There is an increase in breast cancer. It used to be that breast cancer occurred primarily among post-menopausal women over fifty. Now it is occurring even in young women. Some questions are in order.

I know that there is private research into these questions going on in certain laboratories. Is it the air we breathe, the food we eat, or toxic substances on our planet?

Finally, with much ceremony, the government announces that grants will be handed out. Of course, I am in favour of grants so that scientists can conduct research into toxic substances, but people will agree it is perhaps a bit late. Better late than never, but this government, which calls itself responsible, should have given these grants sooner.

We have been hearing about this kind of research and grants since 1993 and suddenly, on May 27, when they are about to introduce Bill C-32, they tell us they are going to increase grants and give the Centre de recherche sur les substances toxiques \$10 million. That is why we are saying it was high time.

While introducing Bill C-32, they announce grants. Might this not be an attempt to help the medicine go down, or silence certain growing criticisms of the federal government in this area?

• (1740)

The federal government is apportioning this \$40 million out over three years in order to make several announcements. As I was saying, with the good old federal government, national research and the support of clinical research for our scientists that might help us and thus prevent these increases in diseases is not free.

I am sure, Madam Speaker, that you and other members of the House know people who have friends or family members suffering from breast cancer. We have such people among our colleagues. The scientists are more and more convinced that the source is the air we breathe or the food we eat.

My colleague from Saint-Jean has just referred to some studies of the Inuit in the far north where mercury was found in breast milk. What effect will this have on a child's health? Where does this mercury come from? It seems to me one does not have to be a rocket scientist to figure it out.

### *Government Orders*

That is why we are saying it is high time. Why turn this into something political, protecting their backsides because they were incapable of presenting any sensible kind of bill? This bill is inconsistent. Why did they not present us with a proper policy to address the harmful effects of toxic substances? This bill has been under study for months and now there are in excess of 500 amendments.

If it had been some other party that came up with such a bill, the Liberals would have been as scandalised as we. Why not start again from scratch? There is nothing wrong with that.

As a number of my colleagues have concluded, one may conclude from this that the government is trying to get its hands on more power. In the context of globalization, we know it needs powers that it does not have at the present time. In order to be sure it gets them, it will present us with bills regardless of what amendments we have proposed. That is what they always do, and it is scandalous, with the pretext that it is good governance and in the interests of national safety.

We on this side of the House are nobody's fools. When one sees the highly centralist nature of this bill, one may well ask some questions.

Let me provide a little background on Bill C-32. It was introduced at first reading on March 12, 1998, to replace the Canadian Environmental Protection Act. This tactic by the Liberal government is another move towards excessive centralization.

The Liberals' approach is to do what they said they would in the September 1997 throne speech. They are relentlessly interfering in areas of provincial jurisdiction. In so doing, they are showing their contempt for provincial jurisdictions when it comes to the environment.

This is unacceptable when the health of people is at stake. We needed a bill that would have finally put a stop to the arrival of new diseases from everywhere. As I said earlier, we are constantly confronted with new health problems. It is our children who must grow up in that environment.

The Bloc Québécois, understandably, cannot support this bill, which should be immediately withdrawn.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is the House ready for the question?

**Some hon. members:** Question.

• (1745)

[*English*]

**The Deputy Speaker:** Pursuant to order made on Thursday, May 27, the questions on the motions in Group No. 6 are deemed put and the recorded divisions are deemed requested and deemed deferred.

*Government Orders*

The House will now proceed to the debate on the motions in Group No. 7.

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.)** moved:

Motion No. 53

That Bill C-32, in Clause 56, be amended by replacing line 10 on page 35 with the following:

“176.1(1) applies, provided the Minister has been authorized by the Governor in Council by virtue of paragraph 166(3)(a) or 176(3)(a) to publish that notice.”

**Mr. Rick Laliberte (Churchill River, NDP)** moved:

Motion No. 151

That Bill C-32, in Clause 116, be amended by adding after line 26 on page 87 the following:

«substance à effet de perturbation du système hormonal» ““hormone disrupting substance” means a substance having the ability to disrupt the synthesis, secretion, transport, binding, action or elimination of natural hormones in an organism, or its progeny, that are responsible for the maintenance of homeostasis, reproduction, development or behaviour of the organism.”

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.)** moved:

Motion No. 153

That Bill C-32, in Clause 118, be amended

(a) by replacing line 1 on page 88 with the following:

“118. (1) The Governor in Council may, on the”

(b) by adding after line 32 on page 88 the following:

“(2) The Governor in Council shall not make a regulation under this Division in respect of nutrients if, in the opinion of the Governor in Council, the regulation regulates an aspect of nutrients that is regulated by or under any other Act of Parliament in a manner that provides, in the opinion of the Governor in Council, sufficient protection to the environment and human health.”

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.)** moved:

Motion No. 154

That Bill C-32, in Clause 118, be amended

(a) by replacing line 1 on page 88 with the following:

“118. (1) The Governor in Council may, on the”

(b) by replacing, in the English version, line 8 on page 88 with the following:

“of a process of degrading or altering, an”

(c) by adding after line 32 on page 88 the following:

“(2) The Governor in Council shall not make a regulation under subsection (1) in respect of a nutrient to the extent that the nutrient, or a product in which the nutrient is contained, is, in the opinion of the Governor in Council, regulated by or under any other Act of Parliament in a manner that provides, in the opinion of the Governor in Council, sufficient protection to the environment.”

Motion No. 185

That Bill C-32, in Clause 166, be amended by replacing line 24 on page 121 with the following:

“(a) on approval by the Governor in Council, publish a notice under subsection 56(1);”

**Mr. John Herron (Fundy—Royal, PC)** moved:

Motion No. 186

That Bill C-32, in Clause 166, be amended by replacing line 24 on page 121 with the following:

“(a) with the approval of the Governor in Council, publish a notice under subsection 56(1);”

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.)** moved:

Motion No. 187

That Bill C-32, in Clause 166, be amended by replacing line 24 on page 121 with the following:

“(a) recommend to the Governor in Council that the Minister be given authority to publish a notice under subsection 56(1)”

Motion No. 191

That Bill C-32, in Clause 176, be amended by replacing lines 16 to 20 on page 128 with the following:

“laws or does not do so, the Minister shall recommend regulations to the Governor”

**Mr. John Herron (Fundy—Royal, PC)** moved:

Motion No. 192

That Bill C-32, in Clause 176, be amended by replacing line 18 on page 128 with the following:

“(a) with the approval of the Governor in Council, publish a notice under subsection 56(1);”

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.)** moved:

Motion No. 193

That Bill C-32, in Clause 176, be amended by replacing line 18 on page 128 with the following:

“(a) on approval by the Governor in Council, publish a notice under subsection 56(1);”

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.)** moved:

Motion No. 194

That Bill C-32, in Clause 176, be amended by replacing line 18 on page 128 with the following:

“(a) recommend to the Governor in Council that the Minister be given authority to publish a notice under subsection 56(1);”

**Ms. Jocelyne Girard-Bujold (Jonquière, BQ)** moved:

Motion No. 198

That Bill C-32, in Clause 185, be amended by adding after line 35 on page 134 the following:

“(1.1) The Governor in Council shall, by order, exempt from the application of subsection (1) any person who imports into, exports to or conveys in transit to a province substances described in subsection (1) where an Act of the legislature of the province is in force that governs the movement of such substances.”

**Mr. John Herron (Fundy—Royal, PC)** moved:



*Government Orders*

Motion No. 200

That Bill C-32, in Clause 188, be amended by replacing line 2 on page 136 with the following:

“phasing out the export, to a destination other than the United States, of hazardous waste or”

**Mr. Bill Gilmour (Nanaimo—Alberni, Ref.)** moved:

Motion No. 201

That Bill C-32, in Clause 188, be amended by replacing lines 2 and 3 on page 136 with the following:

“phasing out the export of hazardous waste for final”

Motion No. 202

That Bill C-32, in Clause 188, be amended by replacing line 4 on page 136 with the following:

“disposal to a destination other than the United States, the Minister may require an export-”

**Hon. Charles Caccia (Davenport, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I will address very briefly Motions Nos. 185 and 193, and then the motion on nutrients, and put these reservations forward for your attention.

The amendments regarding international air and water pollution again would require the Minister of the Environment to go to cabinet before making a decision on the subject of international air and water pollution or pollution that may result in another country because of activities in Canada.

These motions require the environment minister to go to cabinet before requiring a person to prepare and implement a pollution prevention plan, yet pollution prevention is in the title of this legislation. Therefore, one would expect that powers would be included in the bill for the health and environment ministers to request plans in serious cases of possible pollution.

International pollution is clearly a role for the federal Minister of the Environment, which one would expect industry to support considering industry's claims in favour of pollution prevention planning. Why then does industry lobby for a further obstacle and delay? Why does industry lobby for imposing a further delay on this rather important step?

The official government explanation for this last minute change to remove this power from the minister and give it to the cabinet is that these changes are there because they are normal, given the international dimension of these issues. The government explanation goes on to say that the involvement of the governor in council, namely cabinet, is normal.

Who raised this concern? It was the lobby groups representing chemical production, petroleum, steel and other industries. We have several letters from these groups asking for this amendment, almost word for word.

Second, putting this power squarely in the hands of the federal environment minister should not be described as unilateral, as some have done. Rather, it is a necessary ministerial power.

Third, the involvement of cabinet in a new measure in Bill C-32, namely, the power of the environment minister to require a person to prepare and implement a pollution prevention plan under certain circumstances, cannot be explained as normal. It is clearly the role of the Minister of the Environment to take preventive actions. Where there is a case of a potential Canadian source polluting United States air or water, citizens of the other country would expect prompt action to be taken to prevent that pollution. Motions Nos. 185 and 193 will eliminate the possibility of prompt preventive action by the Minister of the Environment and send the decision to cabinet where other ministers hold diverging views. It is difficult to see why such discussions are necessary unless the objective is to create delays and possibly bring considerations other than the protection of the environment and human health to the table.

It is important to note in the context of Motions Nos. 185 and 193 that these proposals were not made during the long and detailed study in committee. It should also be noted that these motions were requested by industry lobby groups in the weeks following our committee study and deliberations. Finally, it should be noted that the Reform Party has proposed amendments similar to Motions Nos. 185 and 193.

● (1750)

For all of these reasons, regretfully, I will have to vote against these two motions.

On the question of nutrients, Motion No. 154 comes like a bolt from the blue. It is brand new. It was not mentioned. It was not proposed in committee. It was not proposed by any witness before the committee nor in the clause by clause deliberations. Yet it has appeared in the name of the Minister of the Environment. A very similar amendment miraculously appeared in the name of the Reform Party as well.

The effect of the amendment, if passed, would be this. As an example, the Minister of the Environment could no longer prevent the pollution of water by certain nutrients. The Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food could say “I have the power to prevent pollution by nutrients in water”. Cabinet would then decide if the power of the Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food was sufficient. The Minister of the Environment would no longer have a role to play. The public would have no knowledge of how this decision came about because, as we all know, cabinet discussions and decisions are secret.

Who would decide whether the regulations which fall under the purview of the Minister of Agriculture and Agri-Food provide sufficient protection? In the case of the Minister of Agriculture and

*Government Orders*

Agri-Food, for example, his mandate is at best a mixed mandate, namely, promoting food production, farmers' interests, the protection of soil and, at the same time, promoting the industries that produce pesticides, fertilizers and nutrients. On whose side will the minister be?

To put it in other terms, in this case and in other parts of Bill C-32 that the committee did not succeed in amending, there is pattern. The pattern is that ministers, who do not have as their chief mandate the protection of the environment and human health, have sufficient powers to decide: one, what is sufficient protection of the environment and human health and what it means, and two, whether a certain standard provided in the regulations of a minister, other than the Minister of the Environment, is the determining and final factor.

Unfortunately, this amendment will have the net effect of giving powers to a minister, other than the Minister of the Environment or the Minister of Health, to make a decision as to what is sufficient protection.

That is an example of how this bill is being weakened at report stage. It is a very regrettable development because in the end it will be at the expense of public health and the quality of water and air. I hope it is not proceeded with at report stage tonight.

[*Translation*]

**Ms. Jocelyne Girard-Bujold (Jonquière, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, I am pleased to rise following the member for Davenport. Group No. 7 contains 15 motions.

I will summarize the position of the Bloc Québécois with respect to these motions. We oppose Motion No. 53 by the member for Nanaimo—Alberni, which concerns clause 56 and deals with the requirement for pollution prevention plans.

With Motion No. 53, and Motion No. 153 to amend clause 118, the Reform Party is transferring to the governor in council the responsibilities of the Minister of the Environment in the publication of notices to implement a prevention plan for a substance or a group of substances.

● (1755)

Once again, with these amendments, the Reform Party is attempting to limit the action of the Minister of the Environment in matters concerning the environment.

I will now address Motion No. 187, which also originates with the Reform Party and seeks to amend clause 166 of the current bill, dealing with international air pollution. We oppose this motion. We also oppose Motion No. 191, which concerns clause 176 on international water pollution.

With these motions, the Reform Party is once again trying to put the responsibility of the Minister of the Environment in the hands

of the governor in council. I share the view of the member for Davenport, who opposes this practice, since we know that Cabinet proceedings are kept secret.

When we ask this government, or other governments that will succeed it, I hope, in the future, "Why", they will say "We cannot answer you. This is a matter for Cabinet and it is confidential and secret".

I am surprised to see the Reform Party doing this. I would have never thought that it would go so far in order to fight the powers that a minister responsible for a matter must have with respect to pollution, which affects such vital areas.

There is also Motions Nos. 201, 202 and 203 with respect to clause 188, also moved by a member of the Reform Party, which would remove the words "non-hazardous waste" from the plan for reducing imports and which excludes waste exported from the United States. Yet, we know that the vast majority of our export trade is with the United States.

It is essential that there be a plan for compliance with the regulations and that it be enforced. What is going on? Are people going to be allowed to do as they please with hazardous waste? Are they going to import and export such waste freely, because nobody will be required to have plans and regulations any more? It will be anarchy. Is that what the Reform Party member wants? I object and I hope that all members of the House will object.

I turn now to Motion No. 151 moved by the NDP member for Churchill River to amend clause 116 with respect to nutrients by adding "hormone disrupting substance". Clause 43 already defines hormone disrupting substance. Why have redundancy within the bill? There is enough confusion as it is. I can understand why this would be interesting for people in the legal profession. This bill will no doubt lead to lawsuits.

I am going to speak about Motion No. 154, with respect to clause 118, and Motion No. 185 with respect to clause 116, moved by the Minister of the Environment. They are along the same lines as the motions moved by the Reform Party member. I cannot understand why the Minister of the Environment is bringing in amendments that will limit her powers. This one will take away her own power to act under the legislation.

● (1800)

She is limiting her actions and, on top of that, she is asking for the agreement of the governor in council and recommending that he give her permission. My goodness, this motion is more than just nebulous, it is unacceptable.

Let us also look at Motion No. 186 with respect to clause 166. We are also opposed to this motion, because it goes along the same lines as the one I have just addressed. It puts the responsibility of the Minister of the Environment onto the governor in council.

*Government Orders*

Then there is Motion No. 192 to amend clause 176. This amendment would have the minister report to governor in council. It being along the same lines, we also object to it.

We presented Motion No. 198 to amend clause 185 as an addition to the section on import, export and movement of hazardous waste and other substances. We want a sub-clause (1.1) to be added, which would read as follows:

—exempt from the application of subsection (1) any person who imports into, exports to or conveys in transit to a province substances described in subsection (1) where an act of the legislature of the province is in force that governs the movement of such substances.

This motion would do away with the duplication in the application of this provision and would do away with all the confusion for people, who do not know whether the federal or the provincial legislation applies. We have plenty of duplication already. Enough, now some very positive action must be taken.

[*English*]

**Ms. Paddy Torsney (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of the Environment, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, this afternoon a number of points have been raised in speaking to this group of motions and comments earlier.

I want to draw members' attention to the fact that the Commissioner of the Environment and Sustainable Development was a position created by the government in 1995. It was mentioned by one of the NDP members that government after government has been ignoring the recommendations of the Commissioner of the Environment and Sustainable Development. That position was created by the government.

Criticisms of the commissioner laid against the government for its actions are addressed in this bill. If that is the concern, members should support Bill C-32. Twenty three thousand substances must be examined. There are strict time lines in the CEPA legislation. Pollution prevention is enshrined in the legislation. This is what the commissioner told us; this is what the bill is doing.

Let us talk about some other motions before us at the present time. The BQ want to exempt waste provisions from Bill C-32 from applying to the provinces that have legislation governing the movement of waste. Once again the Bloc Quebecois is attempting to rewrite the Constitution by stripping the federal government's jurisdiction over Canada's international borders and interprovincial trade. Canada has international commitments under the Basel convention relating to the transboundary movement of hazardous waste. Bill C-32 is necessary to ensure that Canada meets those obligations.

PC and Reform motions have been proposed to exclude shipments of waste destined for disposal, including hazardous waste, to the United States from requirements for export reduction plans. Let us be clear. Bill C-32 provides the authority to require

exporters of waste that is being shipped for disposal to prepare and implement export reduction plans. The PC and Reform parties want to exempt any shipments to the United States from these requirements. The fact is that Canada since 1985 has not shipped hazardous waste for disposal to any country other than the United States. The PC and Reform Party motions therefore would nullify this authority.

This means that Canada would not be able to meet its obligations under the Basel convention. It also contradicts the pollution prevention principle, the thrust of this bill. We do want to prevent pollution and the generation of waste so it does not have to be shipped to the United States.

One of the motions before us today is a regulation rollover motion, Motion No. 233. There are 24 regulations under the existing CEPA. These regulations cover a wide variety of toxic substances and pollutants. They have eliminated the use of lead in gasoline. They have banned substances from the earth's ozone layer such as CFCs. They have reduced by 99% the amount of harmful dioxins and furans in pulp and paper effluent. These are good things.

• (1805 )

To proclaim the new act into force all these regulations would have to conform to the provisions of Bill C-32. The government is working on this task to ensure early proclamation following royal assent of this legislation.

To address unforeseen circumstances that might delay the rollover of the regulations or that would create a regulatory gap, government Motion No. 233 proposes the addition of a clause that would allow any provisions of the regulations inconsistent with Bill C-32 to continue in force for two years from the date of royal assent.

Let us talk about PC Motion No. 214 to alter the residual clause in part 9. Let us be clear. Provincial government environmental regulations do not apply to the federal government. Because of this situation CEPA provides authority to regulate federal operations and lands. One of the shortcomings of the existing CEPA identified by the Standing Committee on Environment and Sustainable Development in its 1995 report "It's About Our Health!" is that environmental protection regulations that apply to the federal House require the concurrence of the affected minister.

As a result of this requirement for concurrence, the amount of activity under this part of CEPA has been limited. Bill C-32 removes this requirement for concurrence. The effect of this PC motion would be to reinsert a requirement for concurrence since there may be instances where the affected minister might not agree that CEPA is the best vehicle for action. Based on past experience this could result in delay and deadlock, something the members opposite have said they do not want. Since part 9 covers all federal departments and operations this decision making is appropriate in

*Government Orders*

the hands of the governor in council and not just a small group of ministers.

This will probably be the last speech from this side on this piece of legislation on the report stage motions before us. I urge all hon. members, if they want this bill passed, if they want this bill to do the right thing for the environment, if they want to give the federal government the tools to make a difference for today and for future generations, support the changes being proposed by the government. CEPA can do the job to prevent pollution from occurring in the first place. It will enable us to deal with regulating toxic substances in our country and to virtually eliminate those deadly substances that none of us want.

Nine out of ten are already eliminated in Canada, things like DDT, but we are still seeing the effect in breast milk, in the arctic and in other places. We will have to do better. This bill will allow us to do better.

**Mr. Clifford Lincoln (Lac-Saint-Louis, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, we have a few minutes before the bells ring for a vote.

I rise on a point of order regarding Motions Nos. 230 and 231 which have been twinned for the purposes of voting. Mr. Speaker, I submit to you for consideration that the twinning of these two motions is completely out of order and should be reviewed. The vote should be split on the two motions. On looking at clauses 342 and 343 of the bill you will see that Motions Nos. 230 and 231 have two completely different purposes and have nothing to do with each other.

Motion No. 230, which refers to clause 342 of the bill, brings in a technical change. The clause says "the minister shall as soon as possible after the end of the fiscal year prepare and cause to be laid before parliament a report" et cetera. All the motion does is to say "before each House of Parliament" instead of "parliament". It is purely a technical change.

Motion No. 231 brings in a very important substantive change which I suggest might even be a precedent before parliament. I cannot be 100% sure. It adds the notion that the review to be conducted by the House can be by the committee of the House of Commons or both houses of parliament. It has introduced a new notion under Motion No. 231 that it could be the committee of the House of Commons, or of the Senate. The review could be carried out either by the committee of the House of Commons or the committee of the Senate. It would be a great irony that a law of the Parliament of Canada could be sent for review to the committee of the Senate without being sent to the committee of the House of Commons.

• (1810)

Therefore I suggest that the two motions have nothing to do one with the other. We should not twin the vote because voting in the

affirmative on Motion No. 230 which many members agree with 100%, and I would say the whole House would probably agree with it, there is nothing wrong with it, then negates the vote on Motion No. 231 which refers to a very substantive change in the clause as it is written in the bill.

Mr. Speaker, I would like you to take this into consideration. Please split the two votes and take them separately.

**Hon. Charles Caccia (Davenport, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, I rise on the same point of order. I wish to express full support for the argument just advanced by the member for Lac-Saint-Louis and to indicate to you, Mr. Speaker, that his advocacy for the splitting of the vote on these two motions would be in the best interests of the House and of the parliamentary process.

**Mr. Rick Laliberte (Churchill River, NDP):** On the same point of order, Mr. Speaker, I believe the integrity of the Standing Committee on Environment and Sustainable Development and the thorough work it did on Bill C-32 would be jeopardized on a five year cycle review. All this could be left to the other place. I believe the House of Commons should keep its integrity and keep the standing committee's integrity for this is truly the work of elected parliamentarians.

**The Deputy Speaker:** I will take the matter under advisement. The voting will begin shortly. Just before the voting begins I will notify the House of the decision in this regard. I thank hon. members for their intervention. The hon. member for Churchill River has the floor.

**Mr. Rick Laliberte (Churchill River, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, I would like to speak in the remaining moments of the debate. As we all know, debate is limited. This is environment week. It would have been nice to debate Bill C-32 for the whole week but we are restricted to just two more minutes.

I want to get the attention of the government and the parliamentary secretary who boldly stated that the commissioner of environment was created by the Liberal government and in essence that the actions will be taken.

Ontario is number one at importing toxic waste. We can take that as a fact. Ontario is a large industrial province. It is also number one in North America. It is not just number one in Canada, it is in North America on importing of toxic waste. The Americans have worked hard under the EPA system to strengthen and enforce their regulatory system under the environment and waste rules. All these industries have found a safe haven in Ontario. It is the fault of the Ontario government and the federal government. They have not taken care of a gaping responsibility in terms of toxic waste in this province and the country.

We have talked about harmonization of provincial and federal responsibilities. There are great gaps as opposed to overlaps, as the minister has addressed.

*Government Orders*

I want to highlight in retrospect all these amendments that come into play. Cost effectiveness and the phase-out of toxins in the country are now being eliminated in the preamble. Phase-out is a major component of pollution prevention.

Bill C-32 should be renamed as an act allowing the pollution of the environment and risking human health to ensure unsustainable development so the finance minister can balance his budget and the polluters can poison our bodies, our children, our future and our fortunes.

**The Deputy Speaker:** I am sorry to interrupt the hon. member but it being 6.15 p.m. it is my duty pursuant to order made earlier this day to interrupt the proceedings and pursuant to order made on Thursday, May 27, 1999 to deem the outstanding motions to have been duly moved and seconded and the divisions deemed demanded and deferred.

**Mr. John Herron (Fundy—Royal, PC)** moved:

Motion No. 214

That Bill C-32, in Clause 210, be amended

(a) by replacing line 13 on page 152 with the following:

“210. Where the Ministers and, where appropriate, the minister responsible for the other Act of Parliament in question, are of”

(b) by replacing line 23 on page 152 with the following:

“the Ministers and that other minister may make an order”

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.)** moved:

Motion No. 230

That Bill C-32, in Clause 342, be amended by replacing line 35 on page 216 with the following:

“prepare and cause to be laid before each House of Parliament”

Motion No. 231

That Bill C-32, in Clause 343, be amended by replacing lines 44 to 47 on page 216 and lines 1 to 8 on page 217 with the following:

“force of this Act, stand referred to such committee of the House of Commons, of the Senate or of both Houses of Parliament as may be designated or established for that purpose.

(2) The committee designated or established for the purpose of subsection (1) shall, as soon as practicable, undertake a comprehensive review of the provisions and operation of this Act and shall, within one year after the review is undertaken or within such further time as the House of Commons, the Senate or both Houses of Parliament, as the case may be, may authorize, submit a report to Parliament thereon.”

Motion No. 233

That Bill C-32 be amended by adding after line 29 on page 219 the following new clause: 355.1 (1) Subject to subsection (2), any regulation that was (a) made under the Act mentioned in section 355, and (b) in force immediately before the day on which this Act is assented to is deemed to have been made under this Act, and continues in force, subject to being amended or repealed under this Act.

(2) If a regulation continued in force by subsection (1) is not consistent with this Act at the end of the two-year period that starts on the day on which this Act is assented to, that regulation ceases to be in force at the end of that period.”

**The Deputy Speaker:** Call in the members.

• (1835)

*And the bells having rung:*

**The Deputy Speaker:** Order, please. The Chair would like to respond to a point of order raised by the hon. member for Lac-Saint-Louis.

The voting pattern distributed earlier today indicated that the that the vote on Motion No. 230 would apply to Motion No. 231.

After hearing the representations of the hon. members for Lac-Saint-Louis, Churchill River and Davenport, the Chair is satisfied that Motions Nos. 230 and 231 are sufficiently different that a separate vote on each would be in order.

Therefore after the vote on Motion No. 230, a recorded division shall be taken on Motion No. 231.

The question is on Motion No. 1. A negative vote on Motion No. 1 requires the question to be put on Motions Nos. 2 and 3.

• (1845)

(The House divided on Motion No. 1, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 456)

**YEAS**

Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Cummins	Epp
Forseth	Gilmour
Goldring	Gouk
Grewal	Harris
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Jaffer	Johnston
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Konrad	Lunn
Mark	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
McNally	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Morrison
Obhrai	Penson
Ramsay	Reynolds
Ritz	Schmidt
Scott (Skeena)	Solberg
Stinson	Strahl
Vellacott	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)—45	

**NAYS**

Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)

*Government Orders*

Baker	Beaumier
Bélaire	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Brien
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromiskiy	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jennings
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McTeague
McWhinney	Mifflin
Mitchell	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nyström	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada
Sauvageau	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Venne

Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

Wappel  
Wilfert

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 1 defeated.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to the following: Motions Nos. 13, 71, 87, 130, 132, 206, 6, 137, 10, 18, 38, 53, 153, 191 and 201.

**Mr. John Duncan:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I was not present for the last vote. I would like to vote in the affirmative to this motion.

**The Deputy Speaker:** So ordered. Is there agreement to proceed in the fashion outlined by the chief government whip?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Howard Hilstrom:** Mr. Speaker, on this series of motions I would like to have my vote recorded as no.

**The Deputy Speaker:** So ordered. Subject to that exception and to the other addition, is it agreed that we proceed as indicated by the chief government whip?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 13, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 458)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Cummins	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Obhrai
Penson	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
Strahl	Vellacott
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—46

*Government Orders***NAYS**

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberté  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Itody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muisé  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)

Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopoulos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 71, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 467)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

**NAYS**

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais

*Government Orders*

DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Gallaway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jennings
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McTeague
McWhinney	Mifflin
Mitchell	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada
Sauvageau	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Venne
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	Wilfert
Wood—191	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 87, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 471)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Cummins	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Obhrai
Penson	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
Strahl	Vellacott
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—46

**NAYS**

## Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaïr	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Brien
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Gallaway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jennings
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier



## Government Orders

MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)

## NAYS

## Members

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjardis  
Dhalliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Haid  
Harvey Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakapanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 130, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 481)*

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forsyth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

*Government Orders*

St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Discepolo  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 132, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 482)*

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copps  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 206, which was negated on the following division:)

*Government Orders**(Division No. 483)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

**NAYS**

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier

MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nyström  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopoulos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 6, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 500)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

## Government Orders

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)

Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 137, which was negatived on the following division:)

(Division No. 502)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Cummins	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Ohrai
Penson	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
Strahl	Vellacott
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—46

## NAYS

## Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaire	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Brien
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Coppes
Crête	Cullen
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies

*Government Orders*

(The House divided on Motion No. 10, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 506)

**YEAS**

## Members

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
sKilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel

de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desroschers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

*Government Orders*

Lee	Leung	Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Hilstrom	Jaffer
Lincoln	Longfield	Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Loubier	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Kerpan	Konrad
Mahoney	Malhi	Lunn	Mark
Maloney	Mancini	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	McNally
Marceau	Marchand	Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Marleau	Martin (LaSalle—Énard)	Morrison	Obhrai
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé	Penson	Ramsay
Matthews	McCormick	Reynolds	Ritz
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)	Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
McTeague	McWhinney	Solberg	Stinson
Mifflin	Mitchell	Strahl	Vellacott
Muise	Murray	White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—46
Myers	Nault		
Normand	Nystrom		
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)		
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan		
Paradis	Patry		
Peric	Peterson	Adams	Alarie
Pettigrew	Phinney	Alcock	Anderson
Picard (Drummond)	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Assad	Augustine
Pillitteri	Power	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Pratt	Proctor	Baker	Beaumier
Provenzano	Redman	Bélair	Bélangier
Reed	Robillard	Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Rocheleau	Rock	Bennett	Bertrand
Saada	Sauvageau	Bevilacqua	Bigras
Scott (Fredericton)	Sekora	Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Serré	Shepherd	Bonin	Bonwick
Solomon	Speller	Borotsik	Boudria
St. Denis	Steckle	Bradshaw	Brien
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)	Brisson	Brown
St-Hilaire	St-Jacques	Bryden	Bulte
St-Julien	Stoffer	Byrne	Caccia
Szabo	Telegdi	Calder	Cannis
Thibeault	Torsney	Caplan	Casey
Ur	Valeri	Catterall	Chamberlain
Vanclief	Vautour	Chan	Charbonneau
Venne	Volpe	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Wappel	Whelan	Coderre	Collette
Wilfert	Wood—191	Comuzzi	Copps
		Crête	Cullen
		Dalphon-DuGiral	Davies
		de Savoye	Desjarlais
		DeVillers	Dhaliwal
		Dion	Discepola
		Dockrill	Doyle
		Dromisky	Drouin
		Duhamel	Earle
		Easter	Eggleton
		Finestone	Finlay
		Folco	Fontana
		Fry	Gagliano
		Gagnon	Galloway
		Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
		Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
		Goodale	Graham
		Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
		Guarnieri	Guimond
		Harb	Hardy
		Harvard	Harvey
		Herron	Hubbard
		Ianno	Iftody
		Jackson	Jennings
		Jones	Jordan
		Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
		Keddy (South Shore)	Keyes
		Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
		Knutson	Kraft Sloan
		Laliberte	Lalonde
		Lastewka	Lavigne
		Lebel	Lee
		Leung	Lill
		Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
		Longfield	Loubier
		MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
		Malhi	Maloney
		Mancini	Marceau
		Marchand	Marleau
		Martin (LaSalle—Énard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
		Massé	Matthews
		McCormick	McGuire
		McKay (Scarborough East)	McTeague
		McWhinney	Mifflin
		Mitchell	Muise
		Murray	Myers
		Nault	Normand
		Nystrom	O'Brien (Labrador)
		O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly

**NAYS****Members****PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 18, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 507)***YEAS****Members**

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Cummins	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal

*Government Orders*

Pagtakhan  
 Patry  
 Peterson  
 Phinney  
 Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
 Power  
 Proctor  
 Redman  
 Robillard  
 Rock  
 Sauvageau  
 Sekora  
 Shepherd  
 Speller  
 Steckle  
 Stewart (Northumberland)  
 St-Jacques  
 Stoffer  
 Telegdi  
 Torsney  
 Valeri  
 Vautour  
 Volpe  
 Whelan  
 Wood—191

Paradis  
 Peric  
 Pettigrew  
 Picard (Drummond)  
 Pillitteri  
 Pratt  
 Provenzano  
 Reed  
 Rocheleau  
 Saada  
 Scott (Fredericton)  
 Serré  
 Solomon  
 St. Denis  
 Stewart (Brant)  
 St-Hilaire  
 St-Julien  
 Szabo  
 Thibeault  
 Ur  
 Vanclief  
 Venne  
 Wappel  
 Wilfert

Borotsik  
 Bradshaw  
 Brison  
 Bryden  
 Byrne  
 Calder  
 Caplan  
 Catterall  
 Chan  
 Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
 Coderre  
 Comuzzi  
 Crête  
 Dalphond-Guiral  
 de Savoye  
 DeVillers  
 Dion  
 Dockrill  
 Dromisky  
 Duhamel  
 Easter  
 Finestone  
 Folco  
 Fry  
 Gagnon  
 Gauthier  
 Godfrey  
 Goodale  
 Gray (Windsor West)  
 Guarnieri  
 Harb  
 Harvard  
 Herron  
 Ianno  
 Jackson  
 Jones  
 Karetak-Lindell  
 Keddy (South Shore)  
 Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
 Knutson  
 Laliberte  
 Lastewka  
 Lebel  
 Leung  
 Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
 Longfield  
 MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
 Malhi  
 Mancini  
 Marchand  
 Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
 Massé  
 McCormick  
 McKay (Scarborough East)  
 McWhinney  
 Mitchell  
 Murray  
 Nault  
 Nystrom  
 O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
 Pagtakhan  
 Patry  
 Peterson  
 Phinney  
 Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
 Power  
 Proctor  
 Redman  
 Robillard  
 Rock  
 Sauvageau  
 Sekora  
 Shepherd  
 Speller  
 Steckle  
 Stewart (Northumberland)  
 St-Jacques  
 Stoffer  
 Telegdi  
 Torsney  
 Valeri  
 Vautour  
 Volpe  
 Whelan  
 Wood—191

Boudria  
 Brien  
 Brown  
 Bulte  
 Caccia  
 Cannis  
 Casey  
 Chamberlain  
 Charbonneau  
 Clouthier  
 Collette  
 Coppes  
 Cullen  
 Davies  
 Desjarlais  
 Dhaliwal  
 Discepolo  
 Doyle  
 Drouin  
 Earle  
 Eggleton  
 Finlay  
 Fontana  
 Gagliano  
 Gallaway  
 Girard-Bujold  
 Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
 Graham  
 Grose  
 Guimond  
 Hardy  
 Harvey  
 Hubbard  
 Ifody  
 Jennings  
 Jordan  
 Karygiannis  
 Keyes  
 Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
 Kraft Sloan  
 Lalonde  
 Lavigne  
 Lee  
 Lill  
 Lincoln  
 Loubier  
 Mahoney  
 Maloney  
 Marceau  
 Marleau  
 Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
 Matthews  
 McGuire  
 McTeague  
 Miffin  
 Muise  
 Myers  
 Normand  
 O'Brien (Labrador)  
 O'Reilly  
 Paradis  
 Peric  
 Pettigrew  
 Picard (Drummond)  
 Pillitteri  
 Pratt  
 Provenzano  
 Reed  
 Rocheleau  
 Saada  
 Scott (Fredericton)  
 Serré  
 Solomon  
 St. Denis  
 Stewart (Brant)  
 St-Hilaire  
 St-Julien  
 Szabo  
 Thibeault  
 Ur  
 Vanclief  
 Venne  
 Wappel  
 Wilfert

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
 Bakopanos  
 Bergeron  
 Carroll  
 Desrochers  
 Dumas  
 MacAulay  
 McLellan (Edmonton West)  
 Mercier  
 Minna  
 Proud  
 Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Barnes  
 Cardin  
 Debien  
 Duceppe  
 Laurin  
 Marchi  
 Ménard  
 Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
 Plamondon  
 Richardson  
 Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 38, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 515)*

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
 Anders  
 Benoit  
 Breitreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
 Casson  
 Cummins  
 Epp  
 Gilmour  
 Gouk  
 Harris  
 Hilstrom  
 Johnston  
 Kerpan  
 Lunn  
 Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
 Meredith  
 Morrison  
 Penson  
 Reynolds  
 Schmidt  
 Solberg  
 Strahl  
 White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
 Bailey  
 Breitreuz (Yellowhead)  
 Cadman  
 Chatters  
 Duncan  
 Forseth  
 Goldring  
 Grewal  
 Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
 Jaffer  
 Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
 Konrad  
 Mark  
 McNally  
 Mills (Red Deer)  
 Obhrai  
 Ramsay  
 Ritz  
 Scott (Skeena)  
 Stinson  
 Vellacott  
 White (North Vancouver)—46

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
 Alcock  
 Assad  
 Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Baker  
 Bélaïr  
 Bellehumeur  
 Bennett  
 Bevilacqua  
 Blaikie  
 Bonin

Alarie  
 Anderson  
 Augustine  
 Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
 Beaumier  
 Bélanger  
 Bellemare  
 Bertrand  
 Bigras  
 Blondin-Andrew  
 Bonwick

*Government Orders*

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 53, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 516)*

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Cummins	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Obhrai
Penson	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
Strahl	Vellacott
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—46

## NAYS

## Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaire	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Brien
Brisson	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Gallaway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold

Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jennings
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McTeague
McWhinney	Mifflin
Mitchell	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Petic
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada
Sauvageau	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Venne
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	Wilfert
Wood—191	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 153, which was negated on the following division:)



*Government Orders**(Division No. 519)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

**NAYS**

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellemeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copps  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier

MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nyström  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muisé  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopoulos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Mimna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
McNard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 191, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 521)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Casson  
Cummins  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Penson  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Mark  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Obhrai  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—46

## Government Orders

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberté  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Itody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)

Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—191

St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopoulos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 201, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 526)*

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Cummins	Duncan
Epp	Forsth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Obhrai
Penson	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
Strahl	Vellacott
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—46

## NAYS

## Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaire	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Brien
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copp
Crête	Cullen
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais

*Government Orders*

DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jennings
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McTeague
McWhinney	Mifflin
Mitchell	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada
Sauvageau	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Venne
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	Wilfert
Wood—191	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desroschers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 13, 71, 87, 130, 132, 206, 6, 137, 10, 18, 38, 53, 153, 191 and 201 defeated. As a result Motions Nos. 135, 16, 47 and 187 are also defeated.

The next question is on Motion No. 2. A negative vote on Motion No. 2 requires the question to be put on Motion No. 3.

• (1850)

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. If the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea, with the exception of the members for Davenport, Lac-Saint-Louis and York North who wish to vote nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes, unless instructed otherwise by their constituents.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members will vote against the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members in the House this evening vote no to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote no to the motion.

[*English*]

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** Mr. Speaker, just to register with you for certainty, my vote is in the negative.

**The Deputy Speaker:** There were three votes registered in the negative: the hon. member for Davenport, the hon. member for Lac-Saint-Louis and the hon. member for York North from the government list. I believe that clarifies the position.

(The House divided on Motion No. 2, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(*Division No. 457*)

## YEAS

Members	
Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand

*Government Orders*

Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Julien
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —182

## NAYS

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Borotsik
Brien	Brison
Caccia	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Guimond
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Lincoln	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
Muise	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Power
Proctor	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Solomon
St-Hilaire	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne —55	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 2 carried. The next question is on Motion No. 14.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I think you will find unanimous consent that those members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House. Liberal members will vote yes, with the exception of the hon. members for Davenport, Lac-Saint-Louis and York North, who will vote no.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[*English*]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Quebecois members will vote against the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote no to the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 14, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 459)

### YEAS

#### Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaïr	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Coppes	Cullen
Cummins	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepolo	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Miffin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis

Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Julien
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood—182

### Government Orders

### NAYS

#### Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Borotsik
Brien	Brisson
Caccia	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Guimond
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Lincoln	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
Muise	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Power
Proctor	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Solomon
St-Hilaire	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne—55	

### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopoulos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 14 agreed to.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to Motions Nos. 7 and 8.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

*Government Orders*

● (1855)

(The House divided on Motion No. 7, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 501)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds

Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Julien
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —182

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Borotsik
Brien	Brison
Caccia	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Guimond
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Lincoln	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
Muise	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Power
Proctor	Rochelleau
Fry	Solomon
Sauvageau	St-Jacques
St-Hilaire	Vautour
Stoffer	
Venne —55	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 8, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 505)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew

Bonin  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cummins  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Harb  
Harvard  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Lunn  
Malhi  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Obrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Willfert

Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Galloway  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Harris  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Karetak-Lindell  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —182

### Government Orders

#### NAYS

##### Members

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Borotsik  
Brisson  
Casey  
Crête  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Doyle  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Guimond  
Harvey  
Jones  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lill  
Loubier  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Matthews  
Nystrom  
Power  
Rocheleau  
Solomon  
St-Jacques  
Vautour

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Blaikie  
Brien  
Caccia  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
Dockrill  
Earle  
Gauthier  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Hardy  
Herron  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Laliberte  
Lebel  
Lincoln  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Marceau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Muise  
Picard (Drummond)  
Proctor  
Sauvageau  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Venne —55

#### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 7 and 8 carried.

[Translation]

The question is on Motion No. 26. The question on this motion also applies to Motion No. 83.

[English]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. If the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting nay, with the exception of the member for York North who would like to vote yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent of the House to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members vote yes to the motion.

*Government Orders*

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present in the House this evening vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I would like to register a vote in the affirmative to the motion.

**Mr. Clifford Lincoln:** Mr. Speaker, I vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

(The House divided on Motion No. 26, which was negated on the following division: )

*(Division No. 460)***YEAS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Borotsik
Brien	Brisson
Caccia	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Guimond
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Lincoln	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
Muise	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Power
Proctor	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Solomon
St-Hilaire	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne —55	

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepolo	Dromisky

Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Julien
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —182

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 26 negated. Therefore Motion No. 83 is also negated.

[English]

The next question is on Motion No. 61.



*Government Orders*

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. If the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who vote on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral (Laval Centre, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Bloc Québécois will vote against the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, members of the New Democratic Party present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Progressive Conservative Party will vote yes to the motion.

[*English*]

(The House divided on Motion No. 61, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 461)***YEAS***Members*

Blaikie	Borotsik
Brisson	Casey
Davies	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Laliberte
Lill	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mancini	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Matthews	Muise
Nystrom	Power
Proctor	Solomon
St-Jacques	Stoffer
Vautour—29	

**NAYS***Members*

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Benoit
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Bigras	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan

Charbonneau	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Gagnon
Galloway	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Loubier	Lunn
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rocheleau	Rock
Saada	Sauvageau
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	Stinson
St-Julien	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Véllacott
Venne	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Willfert	Wood—208

*Government Orders*

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 61 defeated.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to the following: Motions Nos. 22, 23, 24, 36, 37 and 151.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent of the House to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 22, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 509)*

## YEAS

## Members

Blaikie	Borotsik
Brison	Casey
Davies	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Laliberte
Lill	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mancini	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Matthews	Muise
Nystrom	Power
Proctor	Solomon
St-Jacques	Stoffer
Vautour—29	

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaïr	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Benoit
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Bigras	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	DeVillers

Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Gagnon
Galloway	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Loubier	Lunn
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Ohrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rocheleau	Rock
Saada	Sauvageau
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	Stinson
St-Julien	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vellacott
Venne	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood—208

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi

*Government Orders*

McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Konrad  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Malhi  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Véllacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—208

(The House divided on Motion No. 23, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 510)***YEAS**

## Members

Blaikie  
Brison  
Davies  
Dockrill  
Earle  
Hardy  
Herron  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Lill  
Mancini  
Matthews  
Nystrom  
Proctor  
St-Jacques  
Vautour—29

Borotsik  
Casey  
Desjarlais  
Doyle  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Harvey  
Jones  
Laliberte  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Muise  
Power  
Solomon  
Stoffer

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélaïr  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
de Savoye  
Dhaltwal  
Discepola  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forsyth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copps  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Harris  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Karetak-Lindell  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 24, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 511)***YEAS**

## Members

Blaikie  
Brison  
Davies  
Dockrill  
Earle  
Hardy  
Herron  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Lill

Borotsik  
Casey  
Desjarlais  
Doyle  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Harvey  
Jones  
Laliberte  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)

*Government Orders*

Mancini  
Matthews  
Nystrom  
Proctor  
St-Jacques  
Vautour—29

Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Muisé  
Power  
Solomon  
Stoffer

**NAYS****Members**

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
de Savoye  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarmieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélaire  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copps  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Harris  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Karetak-Lindell  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Malhi  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Obhráin  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric

Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—208

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 36, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 513)

**YEAS****Members**

Blaikie  
Brisson  
Davies  
Dockrill  
Earle  
Hardy  
Herron  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Lill  
Mancini  
Matthews  
Nystrom  
Proctor  
St-Jacques  
Vautour—29

Borotsik  
Casey  
Desjarlais  
Doyle  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Harvey  
Jones  
Laliberte  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Muisé  
Power  
Solomon  
Stoffer

**NAYS****Members**

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélaire  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia

Cadman  
Cannis  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
de Savoye  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wiltfert

Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Harris  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Karetak-Lindell  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Malhi  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steele  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—208

## Government Orders

### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 37, which was negated on the following division:)

### (Division No. 514)

#### YEAS

##### Members

Blaikie	Borotsik
Brison	Casey
Davies	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Laliberte
Lill	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mancini	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Matthews	Muise
Nystrom	Power
Proctor	Solomon
St-Jacques	Stoffer
Vautour—29	

#### NAYS

##### Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Benoit
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Bigras	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copp
Crête	Cullen
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	De Villers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Gagnon
Galloway	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk

*Government Orders*

Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Loubier	Lunn
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rocheleau	Rock
Saada	Sauvageau
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	Stinson
St-Julien	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vellacott
Venne	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood—208

(The House divided on Motion No. 151, which was negated on the following division:)

(*Division No. 518*)

**YEAS**

## Members

Blaikie	Borotsik
Brison	Casey
Davies	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Laliberte
Lill	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mancini	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Mathews	Muise
Nystrom	Power
Proctor	Solomon
St-Jacques	Stoffer
Vautour—29	

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Benoit
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Bigras	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	De Villers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepolo	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Gagnon
Galloway	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

*Government Orders*

Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Lunn  
Malhi  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—208

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[English]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, the government is wrong on this one. The Reform Party members present are voting yes.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Bloc Québécois will vote yes.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, members of the New Democratic Party present this evening vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Progressive Conservative Party will vote yes to the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 62, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 462)

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

• (1900)

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 22, 23, 24, 36, 37 and 151 defeated. Consequently I declare Motions Nos. 41, 70 and 73 defeated.

The next question is on Motion No. 62. A vote on this motion also applies to Motions Nos. 63 and 68. An affirmative vote on Motion No. 62 obviates the necessity of putting the question on Motions Nos. 64 to 67. A negative vote on Motion No. 62 necessitates the question being put on Motions Nos. 64 to 67.

[Translation]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, you will find unanimous consent that those members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion currently before the House, with the Liberal members voting no.

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Alarie  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bellehumeur  
Bigras  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Cadman  
Casson  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Cummins  
de Savoye  
Duncan  
Forsyth  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Gouk  
Guimond  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Jones  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Lebel  
Lunn  
Marceau  
Mark  
Matthews  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Obhrai  
Picard (Drummond)  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Skeena)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Jacques  
Vellacott  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Anders  
Bailey  
Benoit  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brisson  
Casey  
Chatters  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Doyle  
Epp  
Gagnon  
Gilmour  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Harris  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Marchand  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Muisse  
Penson  
Power  
Reynolds  
Rocheleau  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Venne  
White (North Vancouver)—82

## Government Orders

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Catterall  
Chan  
Cloutier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Davies  
De Villers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rock  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—155

Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Galloway  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Harb  
Harvard  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Saada  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Wappel  
Wilfert

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 62 defeated. I therefore declare Motions Nos. 63 and 68 defeated.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to Motion No. 115.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 115, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 477)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Alarie  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bellehumeur  
Bigras  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Cadman  
Casson  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Cummins  
de Savoye  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Gouk  
Guimond  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Jones  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Lebel  
Lunn  
Marceau  
Mark  
Matthews  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Obhrai  
Picard (Drummond)  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Skeena)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Jacques  
Vellacott  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

Ablonczy  
Anders  
Bailey  
Benoit  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brison  
Casey  
Chatters  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Doyle  
Epp  
Gagnon  
Gilmour  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Harris  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Marchand  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Muise  
Penson  
Power  
Reynolds  
Rocheleau  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Venne  
White (North Vancouver)—82



## Government Orders

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Catterall  
Chan  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Davies  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Hubbard  
Ifody  
Jennings  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rock  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—155

Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Galloway  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Harb  
Harvard  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Saada  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Wappel  
Wilfert

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 115 defeated.

The next question is on Motion No. 64.

[Translation]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, you will find unanimous consent that those members who voted on the preceding motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with the Liberal members voting yes.

[English]

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Bloc Québécois will vote yes.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, the New Democratic Party members present this evening in the spirit of co-operation vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Progressive Conservative Party will vote for the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 64, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 463)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anders  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik

*Government Orders*

Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Brison
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Gilmour
Girard-Bujold	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harris	Harvard
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keys	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Nystrom
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Picard (Drummond)	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Proctor
Provenzano	Ramsay
Redman	Reed
Reynolds	Ritz
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada

Sauvageau	Schmidt
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solberg
Solomon	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	Stinson
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vautour
Vellacott	Venne
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood—237	

## NAYS

Members

\*Nil/aucun

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 64 agreed to.

[Translation]

The question is on Motion No. 65. If Motion No. 65 is defeated, Motions Nos. 66 and 67 will have to be voted on.

● (1905 )

[English]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, members of the Bloc Québécois will be voting against the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members will be voting in favour of the motion.

*Government Orders*

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 65, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 464)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Borotsik
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Cadman
Casey	Casson
Chatters	Cummins
Doyle	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mark	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Matthews	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Muise
Obhrai	Penson
Power	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
St-Jacques	Strahl
Vellacott	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver) —59	

**NAYS**

## Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélar	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Coppes	Crête
Cullen	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jennings
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell

Karygiannis	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Marleau	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McTeague
McWhinney	Mifflin
Mitchell	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Nyström
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Picard (Drummond)	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada
Sauvageau	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant) Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	St-Julien
Stoffer	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Venne
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	Wilfert
Wood—178	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 65 defeated.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to the following: Motions Nos. 66, 84, 85, 89, 90, 117, 192 and 202.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed as outlined by the chief government whip?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 66, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 465)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Borotsik

*Government Orders*

Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
 Brison  
 Casey  
 Chatters  
 Doyle  
 Epp  
 Gilmour  
 Gouk  
 Harris  
 Herron  
 Hilstrom  
 Johnston  
 Keddy (South Shore)  
 Kerpan  
 Lunn  
 Mark  
 Matthews  
 Meredith  
 Morrison  
 Obhrai  
 Power  
 Reynolds  
 Schmidt  
 Solberg  
 St-Jacques  
 Vellacott  
 White (North Vancouver) —59

Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
 Cadman  
 Casson  
 Cummins  
 Duncan  
 Forseth  
 Goldring  
 Grewal  
 Harvey  
 Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
 Jaffer  
 Jones  
 Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
 Konrad  
 MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
 Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
 McNally  
 Mills (Red Deer)  
 Muise  
 Penson  
 Ramsay  
 Ritz  
 Scott (Skeena)  
 Stinson  
 Strahl  
 White (Langley—Abbotsford)

McCormick  
 McKay (Scarborough East)  
 McWhinney  
 Mitchell  
 Myers  
 Normand  
 O'Brien (Labrador)  
 O'Reilly  
 Paradis  
 Peric  
 Pettigrew  
 Picard (Drummond)  
 Pillitteri  
 Proctor  
 Redman  
 Robillard  
 Rock  
 Sauvageau  
 Sekora  
 Shepherd  
 Speller  
 Steckle  
 Stewart (Northumberland)  
 St-Julien  
 Szabo  
 Thibeault  
 Ur  
 Vanclief  
 Venne  
 Wappel  
 Wilfert

McGuire  
 McTeague  
 Mifflin  
 Murray  
 Nault  
 Nystrom  
 O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
 Pagtakhan  
 Patry  
 Peterson  
 Phinney  
 Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
 Pratt  
 Provenzano  
 Reed  
 Rocheleau  
 Sada  
 Scott (Fredericton)  
 Serré  
 Solomon  
 St. Denis  
 Stewart (Brant)  
 St-Hilaire  
 Stoffer  
 Telegdi  
 Torsney  
 Valeri  
 Vautour  
 Volpe  
 Whelan  
 Wood—178

**NAYS**

## Members

Adams  
 Alcock  
 Assad  
 Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Baker  
 Bélair  
 Bellehumeur  
 Bennett  
 Bevilacqua  
 Blaikie  
 Bonin  
 Boudria  
 Brien  
 Bryden  
 Byrne  
 Calder  
 Caplan  
 Chamberlain  
 Charbonneau  
 Clouthier  
 Collenette  
 Copps  
 Cullen  
 Davies  
 Desjarlais  
 Dhaliwal  
 Discepola  
 Dromisky  
 Duhamel  
 Easter  
 Finestone  
 Folco  
 Fry  
 Gagnon  
 Gauthier  
 Godfrey  
 Goodale  
 Gray (Windsor West)  
 Guarnieri  
 Harb  
 Harvard  
 Ianno  
 Jackson  
 Jordan  
 Karygiannis  
 Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
 Knutson  
 Laliberte  
 Lastewka  
 Lebel  
 Leung  
 Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
 Longfield  
 Mahoney  
 Maloney  
 Marceau  
 Marleau  
 Martin (Winnipeg Centre)

Alarie  
 Anderson  
 Augustine  
 Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
 Beaumier  
 Bélanger  
 Bellemare  
 Bertrand  
 Bigras  
 Blondin-Andrew  
 Bonwick  
 Bradshaw  
 Brown  
 Bulte  
 Caccia  
 Cannis  
 Catterall  
 Chan  
 Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
 Coderre  
 Comuzzi  
 Crête  
 Dalphond-Guiral  
 de Savoye  
 De Villers  
 Dion  
 Dockrill  
 Drouin  
 Earle  
 Eggleton  
 Finlay  
 Fontana  
 Gagliano  
 Gallaway  
 Girard-Bujold  
 Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
 Graham  
 Grose  
 Guimond  
 Hardy  
 Hubbard  
 Iftody  
 Jennings  
 Karetak-Lindell  
 Keyes  
 Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
 Kraft Sloan  
 Lalonde  
 Lavigne  
 Lee  
 Lill  
 Lincoln  
 Loubier  
 Malhi  
 Mancini  
 Marchand  
 Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
 Massé

Assadourian  
 Bakopanos  
 Bergeron  
 Carroll  
 Desrochers  
 Dumas  
 MacAulay  
 McLellan (Edmonton West)  
 Mercier  
 Minna  
 Proud  
 Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Barnes  
 Cardin  
 Debien  
 Duceppe  
 Laurin  
 Marchi  
 Ménard  
 Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
 Plamondon  
 Richardson  
 Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 84, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 468)

**YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
 Anders  
 Benoit  
 Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
 Brison  
 Casey  
 Chatters  
 Doyle  
 Epp  
 Gilmour  
 Gouk  
 Harris  
 Herron  
 Hilstrom  
 Johnston  
 Keddy (South Shore)  
 Kerpan  
 Lunn  
 Mark  
 Matthews  
 Meredith  
 Morrison  
 Obhrai  
 Power  
 Reynolds  
 Schmidt  
 Solberg  
 St-Jacques  
 Vellacott  
 White (North Vancouver) —59

Ablonczy  
 Bailey  
 Borotsik  
 Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
 Cadman  
 Casson  
 Cummins  
 Duncan  
 Forseth  
 Goldring  
 Grewal  
 Harvey  
 Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
 Jaffer  
 Jones  
 Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
 Konrad  
 MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
 Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
 McNally  
 Mills (Red Deer)  
 Muise  
 Penson  
 Ramsay  
 Ritz  
 Scott (Skeena)  
 Stinson  
 Strahl  
 White (Langley—Abbotsford)

## Government Orders

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélaire  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Cloutier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepolo  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steele  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélaire  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour

Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—178

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 85, which was negated on the following division:)

## (Division No. 469)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Borotsik
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brisson	Cadman
Casey	Casson
Chatters	Cummins
Doyle	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mark	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Matthews	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Muise
Obhrai	Penson
Power	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
St-Jacques	Strahl
Vellacott	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver) —59	

## NAYS

## Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaire	Bélaire
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Cloutier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Coppes	Crête
Cullen	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion

*Government Orders*

Discepola	Dockrill
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jennings
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Marleau	Martin (LaSalle—Énard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McTeague
McWhinney	Mifflin
Mitchell	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Nystrom
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Picard (Drummond)	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada
Sauvageau	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	St-Hilaire
St-Julien	Stoffer
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vautour
Venne	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
Wilfert	Wood—178

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 89, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 473)

**YEAS****Members**

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Borotsik
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Cadman
Casey	Casson
Chatters	Cummins
Doyle	Duncan
Epp	Forseth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mark	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Matthews	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Muise
Obhrai	Penson
Power	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
St-Jacques	Strahl
Vellacott	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver) —59	

**NAYS****Members**

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaïr	Bélanger
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Crête
Cullen	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harvard	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jennings
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)

*Government Orders*

Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—178

Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Mark  
Matthews  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Obhrai  
Power  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
St-Jacques  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver)—59

Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Muise  
Penson  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

**NAYS****Members**

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélaïr  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guamieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumont  
Bélanger  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
De Villers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast) Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 90, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 474)***YEAS****Members**

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brisson  
Casey  
Chatters  
Doyle  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Johnston

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Cadman  
Casson  
Cummins  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Jones

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Cadman  
Casson  
Cummins  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Jones

*Government Orders*

Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—178

Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Bonin  
Boudria  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copps  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—178

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 117, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 478)*

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brisson  
Casey  
Chatters  
Doyle  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Mark  
Matthews  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Obhrai  
Power  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
St-Jacques  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver) —59

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Cadman  
Casson  
Cummins  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Jones  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Muise  
Penson  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew



*Government Orders*

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 192, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 522)*

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Anders	Bailey
Benoit	Borotsik
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brisson	Cadman
Casey	Casson
Chatters	Cummins
Doyle	Duncan
Epp	Forsyth
Gilmour	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Harris	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mark	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Matthews	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Muise
Obhrai	Penson
Power	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Stinson
St-Jacques	Strahl
Vellacott	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver) —59	

## NAYS

## Members

Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Brien	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis Caplan
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Finestone

Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Fry
Gagliano	Gagnon
Galloway	Gauthier
Girard-Bujold	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goodale
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grose	Guarnieri
Guimond	Harb
Hardy	Harvard
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jennings	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keys	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knudson
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lalonde	Lastewka
Lavigne	Lebel
Lee	Leung
Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Loubier	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McTeague	McWhinney
Mifflin	Mitchell
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Proctor
Provenzano	Redman
Reed	Robillard
Rocheleau	Rock
Saada	Sauvageau
Scott (Fredericton)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solomon	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	St-Julien
Stoffer	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Venne
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	Wilfert
Wood—178	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 202, which was negated on the following division:)

## Government Orders

(Division No. 527)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Anders  
Benoit  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brisson  
Casey  
Chatters  
Doyle  
Epp  
Gilmour  
Gouk  
Harris  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Lunn  
Mark  
Matthews  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Obhrai  
Power  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
St-Jacques  
Vellacott  
White (North Vancouver) — 59

Ablonczy  
Bailey  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Cadman  
Casson  
Cummins  
Duncan  
Forseth  
Goldring  
Grewal  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Jones  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Muise  
Penson  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cullen  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel

Alarie  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Graham  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee

Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Marleau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Redman  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—178

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

## [Translation]

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 66, 84, 85, 89, 90, 117, 192 and 202 lost. Motions Nos. 93, 96, 108, 11, 94, 97, 109 and 112 are therefore also lost.

## [English]

The next question is on Motion No. 67.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea, with the exceptions of the members for Davenport, Lac-Saint-Louis and York North who wish to vote nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, members of the Bloc Québécois will be voting in favour of the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening will vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members will be voting in favour of the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 67, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 466)

YEAS

Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
de Savoye  
Dhaliwal  
Discepolo  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Épp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Cloutier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Lalonde

Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Government Orders

Lavigne  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Loubier  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Jacques  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Véllacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—218

NAYS

Members

Blaikie  
Davies  
Dockrill  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lill  
Mancini  
Nyström  
Solomon  
Vautour—19

Caccia  
Desjarlais  
Earle  
Hardy  
Laliberte  
Lincoln  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Proctor  
Stoffer

PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 67 carried.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to the following, with the hon. member for Oxford voting nay: Motions Nos. 86 and 91.

*Government Orders*

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to apply the vote just taken as outlined by the chief government whip?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**The Deputy Speaker:** With the change of the hon. member for Oxford who will be counted as a nay.

(The House divided on Motion No. 86, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 470)

**YEAS****Members**

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
de Savoye  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarmieri  
Harb  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Loubier  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Brown  
Bulte  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews

McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Petry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Jacques  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—217

McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

**NAYS****Members**

Blaikie  
Davies  
Dockrill  
Finlay  
Hardy  
Laliberte  
Lincoln  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Proctor  
Stoffer

Caccia  
Desjarlais  
Earle  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lill  
Mancini  
Nystrom  
Solomon  
Vautour—20

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 91, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 475)

**YEAS****Members**

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Benoit

Bertrand  
 Bigras  
 Bonin  
 Borotsik  
 Bradshaw  
 Breikreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
 Brison  
 Bryden  
 Byrne  
 Calder  
 Caplan  
 Casson  
 Chamberlain  
 Charbonneau  
 Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
 Coderre  
 Comuzzi  
 Crête  
 Cummins  
 de Savoye  
 Dhaliwal  
 Discepola  
 Dromisky  
 Duhamel  
 Easter  
 Epp  
 Folco  
 Forseth  
 Gagliano  
 Gallaway  
 Gilmour  
 Godfrey  
 Goodale  
 Graham  
 Grewal  
 Guarnieri  
 Harb  
 Harvard  
 Herron  
 Hilstrom  
 Ianno  
 Jackson  
 Jennings  
 Jones  
 Karetak-Lindell  
 Keddy (South Shore)  
 Kerpan  
 Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
 Knutson  
 Lalonde  
 Lavigne  
 Lee  
 Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
 Loubier  
 MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
 Malhi  
 Marceau  
 Mark  
 Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
 Massé  
 McCormick  
 McKay (Scarborough East)  
 McTeague  
 Meredith  
 Mills (Red Deer)  
 Morrison  
 Murray  
 Nault  
 Obhrai  
 O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
 Pagtakhan  
 Patry  
 Peric  
 Pettigrew  
 Picard (Drummond)  
 Pillitteri  
 Pratt  
 Ramsay  
 Reed  
 Ritz  
 Rocheleau  
 Saada  
 Schmidt  
 Scott (Skeena)  
 Serré  
 Solberg  
 St. Denis  
 Stewart (Brant)  
 St-Hilaire

Bevilacqua  
 Blondin-Andrew  
 Bonwick  
 Boudria  
 Breikreuz (Yellowhead)  
 Brien  
 Brown  
 Bulte  
 Cadman  
 Cannis  
 Casey  
 Catterall  
 Chan  
 Chatters  
 Clouthier  
 Collenette  
 Copps  
 Cullen  
 Dalphond-Guiral  
 De Villers  
 Dion  
 Doyle  
 Drouin  
 Duncan  
 Eggleton  
 Finestone  
 Fontana  
 Fry  
 Gagnon  
 Gauthier  
 Girard-Bujold  
 Goldring  
 Gouk  
 Gray (Windsor West)  
 Grose  
 Guimond  
 Harris  
 Harvey  
 Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
 Hubbard  
 Ifody  
 Jaffer  
 Johnston  
 Jordan  
 Karygiannis  
 Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
 Keyes  
 Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
 Konrad  
 Lastewka  
 Lebel  
 Leung  
 Longfield  
 Lunn  
 Mahoney  
 Maloney  
 Marchand  
 Marleau  
 Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
 Matthews  
 McGuire  
 McNally  
 McWhinney  
 Mifflin  
 Mitchell  
 Muise  
 Myers  
 Normand  
 O'Brien (Labrador)  
 O'Reilly  
 Paradis  
 Penson  
 Peterson  
 Phinney  
 Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
 Power  
 Provenzano  
 Redman  
 Reynolds  
 Robillard  
 Rock  
 Sauvageau  
 Scott (Fredericton)  
 Sekora  
 Shepherd  
 Speller  
 Steckle  
 Stewart (Northumberland)  
 Stinson

St-Jacques  
 Strahl  
 Telegdi  
 Torsney  
 Valeri  
 Vellacott  
 Volpe  
 Whelan  
 White (North Vancouver)  
 Wood—217

St-Julien  
 Szabo  
 Thibeault  
 Ur  
 Vanclief  
 Venne  
 Wappel  
 White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
 Wilfert

### Government Orders

### NAYS

#### Members

Caccia  
 Desjarlais  
 Earle  
 Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
 Kraft Sloan  
 Lill  
 Mancini  
 Nystrom  
 Solomon  
 Vautour—20

### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
 Bakopanos  
 Bergeron  
 Carroll  
 Desrochers  
 Dumas  
 MacAulay  
 McLellan (Edmonton West)  
 Mercier  
 Minna  
 Proud  
 Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Barnes  
 Cardin  
 Debien  
 Duceppe  
 Laurin  
 Marchi  
 Ménard  
 Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
 Plamondon  
 Richardson  
 Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 86 and 91 carried.

• (1910 )

The next question is on Motion No. 88.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea, with the exception of the members for Davenport, Lac-Saint-Louis, York North and Oxford who wish to vote nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**The Deputy Speaker:** I will hear the subsequent points of order.

**Mr. John Godfrey:** Mr. Speaker, I wish to add my vote to the no list.

**Ms. Bonnie Brown:** Mr. Speaker, I wish to add my name to the no list.

**Ms. Jean Augustine:** Mr. Speaker, I would like to add my name to the no list.

**Ms. Carolyn Bennett:** Mr. Speaker, I wish to abstain on this one.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, somebody has to support the government. The Reform Party will vote yes.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, members of the Bloc Québécois will be voting in favour.

## Government Orders

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, members of the Progressive Conservative party will be voting against the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 88, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 472)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Bigras
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brien
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Crête
Cullen	Cummins
Dalphond-Guiral	de Savoye
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Gagliano
Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Gilmour
Girard-Bujold	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lalonde	Lastewka
Lavigne	Lebel
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Loubier	Lunn
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney

Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rocheleau	Rock
Saada	Sauvageau
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	Stinson
St-Julien	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vellacott
Venne	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood—200

## NAYS

## Members

Blaikie	Borotsik
Brison	Brown
Caccia	Casey
Davies	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Finlay
Fry	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Hardy
Harvey	Herron
Jones	Keddy (South Shore)
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lill	Lincoln
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
Muise	Nystrom
Power	Proctor
Solomon	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Vautour—36

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 88 carried.

The next question is on Motion No. 101.

[Translation]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find unanimous consent that those members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting nay.

*Government Orders*

[English]

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members will be voting against.

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members vote no.

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote in favour of the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 101, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 476)***YEAS**

## Members

Borotsik	Brison
Casey	Doyle
Harvey	Herron
Jones	Keddy (South Shore)
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Matthews
Muise	Power
St-Jacques—13	

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaïr	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Benoit
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Bigras	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brien
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Crête
Cullen	Cummins
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano

Gagnon	Galloway
Gauthier	Gilmour
Girard-Bujold	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Golding
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Guimond
Harb	Hardy
Harris	Harvard
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lebel	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Loubier
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Picard (Drummond)
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Proctor
Provenzano	Ramsay
Redman	Reed
Reynolds	Ritz
Robillard	Rocheleau
Rock	Saada
Sauvageau	Schmidt
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solberg
Solomon	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Hilaire	Stinson
St-Julien	Stoffer
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Venne	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —224

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin

*Government Orders*

MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 101 defeated.

• (1915)

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to Motions Nos. 200 and 214.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in such a fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 200, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 525)

**YEAS**

## Members

Borotsik  
Casey  
Harvey  
Jones  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Muisse  
St-Jacques—13

Brisson  
Doyle  
Herron  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Matthews  
Power

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélaïr  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose

Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harris  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Karetak-Lindell  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Petry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —224

Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 214, which was negated on the following division:)



*(Division No. 528)***YEAS**

## Members

Borotsik  
Casey  
Harvey  
Jones  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Muisse  
St-Jacques—13

Brisson  
Doyle  
Herron  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Matthews  
Power

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellehumeur  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Bigras  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harris  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Karetak-Lindell  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)

Ablonczy  
Alarie  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)

*Government Orders*

Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nyström  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —24

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 200 and 214 negated.

The next question is on Motion No. 122. A negative vote on Motion No. 122 requires the question to be put on Motion No. 123.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral (Laval Centre, BQ):** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Bloc Québécois vote no.

*Government Orders*

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the New Democratic Party vote no.

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the Progressive Conservatives vote no to the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 122, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 479)

**YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
De Villers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepolo
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Gilmour
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Harris	Harvard
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keys	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Lunn
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric

Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —185

Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigas
Blaikie	Borotsik
Brien	Brison
Casey	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	Dockrill
Doyle	Earle
Gagnon	Gauthier
Girard-Bujold	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Guimond	Hardy
Harvey	Herron
Jones	Keddy (South Shore)
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Loubier	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Matthews	Moise
Nystrom	Picard (Drummond) Power
Proctor	Rochelleau
Sauvageau	Solomon
St-Hilaire	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne —52	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 122 carried.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to Motions Nos. 138 and 148.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent of the House to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I may not have heard you call three very important motions and I would seek confirmation that you have done so, in which case I would like to register my vote in opposition; namely, Motions Nos. 110, 113 and 95.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Before I deal with that point of order, I am going to deal with the two motions on which we are applying votes, which are Motions Nos. 138 and 148. It has been agreed to apply the votes to those two motions.

(The House divided on Motion No. 138, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 503)*

**YEAS**

Members

Abbott  
 Adams  
 Anders  
 Assad  
 Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Baker  
 Bélair  
 Bellemare  
 Benoit  
 Bevilacqua  
 Bonin  
 Boudria  
 Breitreuz (Yellowhead)  
 Brown  
 Bulte  
 Caccia  
 Calder  
 Caplan  
 Catterall  
 Chan  
 Chatters  
 Coderre  
 Comuzzi  
 Cullen  
 De Villers  
 Dion  
 Dromisky  
 Duhamel  
 Easter  
 Epp  
 Finlay  
 Fontana  
 Fry  
 Gallaway  
 Godfrey  
 Goodale  
 Graham  
 Grewal  
 Guarmieri  
 Harris  
 Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
 Hubbard  
 Iftody  
 Jaffer  
 Johnston  
 Karetak-Lindell  
 Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
 Keys  
 Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
 Konrad  
 Lastewka  
 Lee  
 Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
 Longfield  
 Mahoney  
 Maloney  
 Marleau  
 Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
 McCormick  
 McKay (Scarborough East)  
 McTeague  
 Meredith  
 Mills (Red Deer)  
 Morrison  
 Myers  
 Normand  
 O'Brien (Labrador)  
 O'Reilly  
 Paradis  
 Penson  
 Peterson  
 Phinney  
 Pillitteri

Ablonczy  
 Alcock  
 Anderson  
 Augustine  
 Bailey  
 Beaumier  
 Bélanger  
 Bennett  
 Bertrand  
 Blondin-Andrew  
 Bonwick  
 Bradshaw  
 Breitreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
 Bryden  
 Byrne  
 Cadman  
 Cannis  
 Casson  
 Chamberlain  
 Charbonneau  
 Clouthier  
 Collette  
 Copps  
 Cummins  
 Dhaliwal  
 Discepola  
 Drouin  
 Duncan  
 Eggleton  
 Finestone  
 Folco  
 Forseth  
 Gagliano  
 Gilmour  
 Goldring  
 Gouk  
 Gray (Windsor West)  
 Grose  
 Harb  
 Harvard  
 Hilstrom  
 Ianno  
 Jackson  
 Jennings  
 Jordan  
 Karygiannis  
 Kerpan  
 Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
 Knutson  
 Kraft Sloan  
 Lavigne  
 Leung  
 Lincoln  
 Lunn  
 Malhi  
 Mark  
 Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
 Massé  
 McGuire  
 McNally  
 McWhinney  
 Mifflin  
 Mitchell  
 Murray  
 Nault  
 Obhrai  
 O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
 Pagtakhan  
 Patry  
 Peric  
 Pettigrew  
 Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
 Pratt

Provenzano  
 Redman  
 Reynolds  
 Robillard  
 Saada  
 Scott (Fredericton)  
 Sekora  
 Shepherd  
 Speller  
 Steckle  
 Stewart (Northumberland)  
 St-Julien  
 Szabo  
 Thibeault  
 Ur  
 Vanclief  
 Volpe  
 Whelan  
 White (North Vancouver)  
 Wood —185

*Government Orders*

Ramsay  
 Reed  
 Ritz  
 Rock  
 Schmidt  
 Scott (Skeena)  
 Serré  
 Solberg  
 St. Denis  
 Stewart (Brant)  
 Stinson  
 Strahl  
 Telegdi  
 Torsney  
 Valeri  
 Vellacott  
 Wappel  
 White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
 Wilfert

**NAYS**

Members

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
 Bigras  
 Borotsik  
 Brison  
 Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
 Dalphond-Guiral  
 de Savoye  
 Dockrill  
 Earle  
 Gauthier  
 Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
 Hardy  
 Herron  
 Keddy (South Shore)  
 Lalonde  
 Lill  
 MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
 Marceau  
 Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
 Muise  
 Picard (Drummond)  
 Proctor  
 Sauvageau  
 St-Hilaire  
 Stoffer  
 Venne —52

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
 Bakopanos  
 Bergeron  
 Carroll  
 Desrochers  
 Dumas  
 MacAulay  
 McLellan (Edmonton West)  
 Mercier  
 Minna  
 Proud  
 Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Barnes  
 Cardin  
 Debieen  
 Duceppe  
 Laurin  
 Marchi  
 Ménard  
 Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
 Plamondon  
 Richardson  
 Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 148, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 504)*

**YEAS**

Members

Abbott  
 Adams  
 Anders  
 Assad  
 Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
 Baker  
 Bélair  
 Bellemare  
 Benoit  
 Bevilacqua  
 Bonin  
 Boudria  
 Breitreuz (Yellowhead)

Ablonczy  
 Alcock  
 Anderson  
 Augustine  
 Bailey  
 Beaumier  
 Bélanger  
 Bennett  
 Bertrand  
 Blondin-Andrew  
 Bonwick  
 Bradshaw  
 Breitreuz (Yorkton—Melville)

*Government Orders*

Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps Cullen
Cummins	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepolo	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Lastewka
Lavigne	Lee
Leung	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Julien
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Véllacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —185

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Borotsik
Brien	Brisson

Casey	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	Dockrill
Doyle	Earle
Gagnon	Gauthier
Girard-Bujold	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Guimond	Hardy
Harvey	Herron
Jones	Keddy (South Shore)
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Loubier	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Matthews	Muise
Nystrom	Picard (Drummond)
Power	Proctor
Rocheleau	Sauvageau
Solomon	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	Stoffer
Vautour	Venne —52

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 138 and 148 carried.

• (1920)

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order concerning Motions Nos. 95, 110 and 113. These are three important amendments. I do not think they were called for a specific vote.

**The Deputy Speaker:** I can advise the hon. member for Davenport that the vote taken on Motion No. 67 was applied, with consent, to Motions Nos. 95, 110 and 113. I understand from the information I have gleaned from the Clerk that the hon. member for Davenport voted nay to each one of them.

The next question is on Motion No. 128.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I think you will find consent in the House to record the members who have just voted as voting on the motion now before the House, with Liberals voting yes.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there agreement to proceed in such a fashion?

[*English*]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, after the exchange that went back and forth, could I have clarification as to which motion we are actually on right now?

*Government Orders*

**The Deputy Speaker:** Motion No. 128. Is there unanimous consent to proceed as outlined by the chief government whip on Motion No. 128?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, the Bloc Québécois members are voting no to the motion.

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the NDP present vote no to the motion.

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[*English*]

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** Mr. Speaker, I wish to have my vote registered in the negative.

**Mrs. Karen Kraft Sloan:** Mr. Speaker, I would like to vote in the negative.

**Mr. Clifford Lincoln:** Mr. Speaker, I vote no to the motion.

**Ms. Bonnie Brown:** Mr. Speaker, I vote no to the motion.

(The House divided on Motion No. 128, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(*Division No. 480*)

**YEAS**

Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brisson
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
De Villiers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Doyle	

Dromisky  
 Duhamel  
 Easter  
 Epp  
 Finlay  
 Fontana  
 Fry  
 Gallaway  
 Godfrey  
 Goodale  
 Graham  
 Grewal  
 Guarnieri  
 Harris  
 Harvey  
 Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
 Hubbard  
 Iftody  
 Jaffer  
 Johnston  
 Jordan  
 Karygiannis  
 Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
 Keys  
 Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
 Konrad  
 Lavigne  
 Leung  
 Longfield  
 MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
 Malhi  
 Mark  
 Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
 Massé  
 McCormick  
 McKay (Scarborough East)  
 McTeague  
 Meredith  
 Mills (Red Deer)  
 Morrison  
 Murray  
 Nault  
 Obhrai  
 O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
 Pagtakhan  
 Patry  
 Peric  
 Pettigrew  
 Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
 Power  
 Provenzano  
 Redman  
 Reynolds  
 Robillard  
 Saada  
 Scott (Fredericton)  
 Sekora  
 Shepherd  
 Speller  
 Steckle  
 Stewart (Northumberland)  
 St-Jacques  
 Strahl  
 Telegdi  
 Torsney  
 Valeri  
 Vellacott  
 Wappel  
 White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
 Wilfert

Drouin  
 Duncan  
 Eggleton  
 Finestone  
 Folco  
 Forseth  
 Gagliano  
 Gilmour  
 Goldring  
 Gouk  
 Gray (Windsor West)  
 Grose  
 Harb  
 Harvard  
 Herron  
 Hilstrom  
 Ianno  
 Jackson  
 Jennings  
 Jones  
 Karetak-Lindell  
 Keddy (South Shore)  
 Kerpan  
 Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
 Knutson  
 Lastewka  
 Lee  
 Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
 Lunn  
 Mahoney  
 Maloney  
 Marleau  
 Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
 Matthews  
 McGuire  
 McNally  
 McWhinney  
 Mifflin  
 Mitchell  
 Muise  
 Myers  
 Normand  
 O'Brien (Labrador)  
 O'Reilly  
 Paradis  
 Penson  
 Peterson  
 Phinney  
 Pillitteri  
 Pratt  
 Ramsay  
 Reed  
 Ritz  
 Rock  
 Schmidt  
 Scott (Skeena)  
 Serré  
 Solberg  
 St. Denis  
 Stewart (Brant)  
 Stinson  
 St-Julien  
 Szabo  
 Thibeault  
 Ur  
 Vanclief  
 Volpe  
 Whelan  
 White (North Vancouver)  
 Wood —194

**NAYS**

Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Brien
Brown	Caccia
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Earle

*Government Orders*

Gagnon	Gauthier
Girard-Bujold	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Guimond	Hardy
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lalonde	Lebel
Lill	Lincoln
Loubier	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Proctor
Rocheleau	Sauvageau
Solomon	St-Hilaire
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne—43	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 128 carried.

The next question is on Motion No. 4.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I think you will find consent in the House to record the members who have just voted as voting on the motion now before the House, with Liberals voting no.

[*English*]

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, the Bloc Québécois members are voting yes to the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening vote no to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the Progressive Conservative members vote no to the motion.

● (1925)

(The House divided on Motion No. 4, which was negated on the following division:)

(*Division No. 484*)

## YEAS

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
Marceau	Marchand
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
Venne—23	

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brisson	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
Davies	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West) Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Hardy
Harris	Harvard
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lastewka
Lavigne	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Lunn

*Government Orders*

(Division No. 485)

MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Proctor
Provenzano	Ramsay
Redman	Reed
Reynolds	Ritz
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Schmidt
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solberg
Solomon	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Jacques
St-Julien	Stoffer
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —214	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 4 defeated.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to Motions Nos. 5, 11, 12, 25, 30, 33, 39 and 216.

[English]

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in the fashion suggested by the chief government whip?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 5, which was negated on the following division:)

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Brien  
Crête  
de Savoye  
Gauthier  
Guimond  
Lebel  
Marceau  
Picard (Drummond)  
Sauvageau  
Venne—23

**YEAS**

**Members**

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
Marchand  
Rocheleau  
St-Hilaire

**NAYS**

**Members**

Abbott  
Adams  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Davies  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill

Ablonczy  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Bronsisik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cummins  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gallaway  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Harb  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Itody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)

*Government Orders*

Lincoln	Longfield
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mancini
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Énard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Nystrom
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vautour
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —214

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 11, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 486)***YEAS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
Marceau	Marchand
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
Venne—23	

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brisson	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
Davies	Deshjais
DeVillers	Djalilwal
Dion	Discepolo
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Hardy	Harris
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mancini
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Énard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Nystrom
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano



*Government Orders*

Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —214

Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Davies  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cummins  
Desjarlais  
Dhallwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Galloway  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Harb  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —214

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakapanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 12, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 487)*

## YEAS

## Members

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Brien  
Crête  
de Savoye  
Gauthier  
Guimond  
Lebel  
Marceau  
Picard (Drummond)  
Sauvageau  
Venne—23

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
Marchand  
Rocheleau  
St-Hilaire

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan

Ablonczy  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau

*Government Orders*

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 25, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 489)*

## YEAS

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
Marceau	Marchand
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
Venne—23	

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	Davies
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Épp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Gilmour
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Hardy
Harris	Harvard
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno

Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lastewka
Lavigne	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Lunn
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Ohrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Proctor
Provenzano	Ramsay
Redman	Reed
Reynolds	Ritz
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Schmidt
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solberg
Solomon	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Jacques
St-Julien	Stoffer
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —214	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 30, which was negated on the following division:)

*Government Orders*

*(Division No. 490)*

**YEAS**

Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
Marceau	Marchand
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
Venne—23	

**NAYS**

Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brisson	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
Davies	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Hardy	Harris
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mancini
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé

Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Nystrom
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vatour
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —214

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 33, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 492)*

**YEAS**

Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
Marceau	Marchand
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
Venne—23	

**NAYS**

Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier

*Government Orders*

Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps Cullen
Cummins	Davies
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Earle
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Gilmour
Godfrey	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Hardy
Harris	Harvard
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keys	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lastewka
Lavigne	Lee
Leung	Lill
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Lunn
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Proctor
Provenzano	Ramsay
Redman	Reed
Reynolds	Ritz
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Schmidt
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solberg
Solomon	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)

Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —214

St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 39, which was negated on the following division:)

*(Division No. 493)*

## YEAS

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
Marceau	Marchand
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
Venne—23	

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
Davies	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana

*Government Orders*

(The House divided on Motion No. 216, which was negated on the following division:)

(*Division No. 499*)

**YEAS**

## Members

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
Marchand  
Rocheleau  
St-Hilaire

**NAYS**

## Members

Ablonczy  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cummins  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Galloway  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Harb  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Itody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi

Forsyth  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —214

Fry  
Galloway  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Harb  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Itody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Brien  
Crête  
de Savoye  
Gauthier  
Guimond  
Lebel  
Marceau  
Picard (Drummond)  
Sauvageau  
Venne—23

Abbott  
Adams  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Davies  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forsyth  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Lunn  
Mahoney

*Government Orders*

Maloney	Mancini
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Nystrom
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Stoffer	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vautour
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood—214	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 5, 11, 12, 25, 30, 33, 39 and 216 defeated. Consequently, I declare Motions Nos. 42, 43, 46, 49, 50, 52, 59, 60, 69, 74, 81, 105 to 107, 116, 119 to 121, 125, 129, 133, 146, 147, 155, 156, 159, 167, 169, 171, 172, 174, 181, 183, 189, 195, 197, 203, 207, 208 and 211 defeated.

The next question is on Motion No. 15.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find unanimous consent that those members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there agreement to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[*English*]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members vote yes to the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening vote no.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[*English*]

(The House divided on Motion No. 15, which was negated on the following division:)

(*Division No. 488*)

## YEAS

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Borotsik	Brien
Brisson	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	de Savoye
Doyle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Marceau
Marchand	Matthews
Muise	Picard (Drummond)
Power	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	Venne—36

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumont
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	Davies
Desjarlais	De Villers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring

*Government Orders*

Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Hardy	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Julien	Stoffer
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Tortsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —201	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 15 defeated.

[Translation]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to Motion No. 198.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there agreement to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 198, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 524)

## YEAS

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Borotsik	Brien
Brison	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégaric)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	de Savoye
Doyle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Marceau
Marchand	Matthews
Muise	Picard (Drummond)
Power	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	Venne—36

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	Davies
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Hardy	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)

*Government Orders*

Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Julien	Stoffer
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —201	

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 198 defeated.

[*English*]

The next question is on Motion No. 31. A negative vote on Motion No. 31 requires the question to be put on Motion No. 32.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

● (1930 )

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members vote no to the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

(The House divided on Motion No. 31, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(*Division No. 491*)

## YEAS

Members	
Abbott	Abлонczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brisson	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
Davies	Desjarlais
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dockrill	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Hardy	Harris
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad



*Government Orders*

Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —214

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Brien  
Crête  
de Savoye  
Gauthier  
Guimond  
Lebel  
Marceau  
Picard (Drummond)  
Sauvageau  
Venne—23

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
Marchand  
Rocheleau  
St-Hilaire

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

*[English]*

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you will find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to the following: Motions Nos. 48, 56 and 17.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 48, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 494)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Davies  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Lunn  
Mahoney

Ablonczy  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
Cummins  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Galloway  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Harb  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Itody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 31 carried.

*Government Orders*

Malhi	Maloney	Assad	Augustine
Mancini	Mark	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Baker	Beaumier
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Bélaïr	Bélangier
Massé	Matthews	Bellemare	Bennett
McCormick	McGuire	Benoit	Bertrand
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally	Bevilacqua	Blaikie
McTeague	McWhinney	Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Meredith	Mifflin	Bonwick	Borotsik
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell	Boudria	Bradshaw
Morrison	Muise	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Murray	Myers	Brison	Brown
Nault	Normand	Bryden	Bulte
Nystrom	Obhrai	Byrne	Caccia
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	Cadman	Calder
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan	Cannis	Caplan
Paradis	Patry	Casey	Casson
Penson	Peric	Catterall	Chamberlain
Peterson	Pettigrew	Chan	Charbonneau
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Chatters	Clouthier
Pillitteri	Power	Coderre	Collenette
Pratt	Proctor	Comuzzi	Copp
Provenzano	Ramsay	Cullen	Cummins
Redman	Reed	Davies	Desjarlais
Reynolds	Ritz	DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Robillard	Rock	Dion	Discepolo
Saada	Schmidt	Dockrill	Doyle
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)	Dromisky	Drouin
Sekora	Serré	Duhamel	Duncan
Shepherd	Solberg	Earle	Easter
Solomon	Speller	Eggleton	Epp
St. Denis	Steckle	Finestone	Finlay
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)	Folco	Fontana
Stinson	St-Jacques	Forseth	Fry
St-Julien	Stoffer	Gagliano	Galloway
Strahl	Szabo	Gilmour	Godfrey
Telegdi	Thibeault	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Torsney	Ur	Goodale	Gouk
Valeri	Vanclief	Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Vautour	Vellacott	Grewal	Grose
Volpe	Wappel	Guarnieri	Harb
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)	Hardy	Harris
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert	Harvard	Harvey
Wood—214		Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
		Hilstrom	Hubbard
		Ianno	Iftody
		Jackson	Jaffer
		Jennings	Johnston
		Jones	Jordan
		Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
		Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
		Kerpan	Keys
		Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
		Knutson	Konrad
		Kraft Sloan	Labiberte
		Lastewka	Lavigne
		Lee	Leung
		Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
		Lincoln	Longfield
		Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
		Mahoney	Malhi
		Maloney	Mancini
		Mark	Marleau
		Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
		Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Massé
		Matthews	McCormick
		McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
		McNally	McTeague
		McWhinney	Meredith
		Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
		Mitchell	Morrison
		Muise	Murray
		Myers	Nault
		Normand	Nystrom
		Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
		O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
		Pagtakhan	Paradis
		Patry	Penson
		Peric	Peterson
		Pettigrew	Phinney
		Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
		Power	Pratt
		Proctor	Provenzano
		Ramsay	Redman
		Reed	Reynolds
		Ritz	Robillard
		Rock	Robillard
		Schmidt	Saada
		Scott (Skeena)	Scott (Fredericton)
			Sekora

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
Marceau	Marchand
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
Venne—23	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 56, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 495)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson

*Government Orders*

Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —214

Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Galloway  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Harb  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Énard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —214

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Brien  
Crête  
de Savoye  
Gauthier  
Guimond  
Lebel  
Marceau  
Picard (Drummond)  
Sauvageau  
Venne—23

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
Marchand  
Rocheleau  
St-Hilaire

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

(The House divided on Motion No. 17, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 512)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Davies  
De Villers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky

Ablonczy  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélangier  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cummins  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Doyle  
Drouin

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Brien  
Crête  
de Savoye  
Gauthier  
Guimond

**NAYS**

## Members

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Lalonde

*Government Orders*

Lebel  
Marceau  
Picard (Drummond)  
Sauvageau  
Venne—23

Loubier  
Marchand  
Rocheleau  
St-Hilaire

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motions Nos. 48, 56 and 17 carried. As a consequence I therefore declare the following motions carried: Motions Nos. 51, 58, 80, 161, 173, 176, 204, 210, 213, 225, 20, 21, 27 to 29, 34, 35, 40, 44, 45, 54, 55, 72, 75 to 79, 82, 92, 98 to 100, 102 to 104, 114, 124, 126, 127, 131, 134, 136, 140 to 145, 152, 157, 158, 162 to 166, 168, 170, 175, 177 to 180, 182, 184, 188, 190, 196, 199, 217 to 224, 226 to 229, 232 and 234 to 236.

The next question is on Motion No. 160. A vote on this motion also applies to Motion No. 205.

**Mr. Randy White:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I am wondering if one is recorded as a vote if one is sleeping in the House. The member for Port Moody—Coquitlam—Port Coquitlam over here—

**The Deputy Speaker:** It is very difficult for the Chair to imagine how any member could possibly be asleep under such exciting circumstances.

The question is on Motion No. 160. A vote on this motion also applies to Motion No. 205.

[Translation]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find unanimous consent that those members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there agreement to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[English]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

• (1935)

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Quebecois members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening in the House vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote no to the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 160, which was negated on the following division:)

(Division No. 496)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Alarie	Anders
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Bellehumeur	Benoit
Bigras	Blaikie
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	Dockrill
Duncan	Earle
Epp	Forseth
Gagnon	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Guimond	Hardy
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Loubier	Lunn
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
McNally	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Morrison
Nystrom	Obhrai
Penson	Picard (Drummond)
Proctor	Ramsay
Reynolds	Ritz
Rocheleau	Sauvageau
Schmidt	Scott (Skeena)
Solberg	Solomon
St-Hilaire	Stinson
Stoffer	Strahl
Vautour	Vellacott
Venne	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)—85	

## NAYS

## Members

Adams	Alcock
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaïr	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Brison	Brown
Bryden	Bulte

*Government Orders*

Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Coppes  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Galloway  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Redman  
Robillard  
Saada  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Jacques  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Wappel  
Wilfert

Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Godfrey  
Graham  
Grose  
Harb  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Ifody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Kraft Sloan  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Lincoln  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Marleau  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rock  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—152

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members vote no to the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, members of the NDP present vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote no to the motion.

[*English*]

(The House divided on Motion No. 209, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(*Division No. 497*)

**YEAS**

**Members**

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Coppes	Cullen
Cummins	Davies
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Dockrill
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Earle	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Golding
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Hardy	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 160 defeated. Consequently Motion No. 205 is defeated.

The next question is on Motion No. 209. A vote on this motion also applies to Motion No. 212.

*Government Orders*

Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Lill	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Lincoln	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mancini	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Solomon
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Julien	Stoffer
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —201	

Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 209 carried. I therefore declare Motion No. 212 carried.

The next question is on Motion No. 215.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

[Translation]

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there agreement to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[English]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members will be voting in favour of the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members will be voting against the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 215, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 498)

**YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Benoit
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Bigras	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brien
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Borotsik	Brien
Brisson	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	de Savoye
Doyle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Guimond	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Lalonde
Lebel	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Marceau
Marchand	Matthews
Muise	Picard (Drummond)
Power	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	St-Hilaire
St-Jacques	Venne—36

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien

Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cullen  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harris  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Karetak-Lindell  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Venne

Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Crête  
Cummins  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patri  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Volpe

Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Borotsik  
Casey  
Harvey  
Jones  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Muise  
St-Jacques—13

Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —224

### Government Orders

#### NAYS

##### Members

Brison  
Doyle  
Herron  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Matthews  
Power

#### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 215 carried.

[Translation]

The next question is on Motion No. 19.

[English]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

● (1940 )

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote nay to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members will be voting in favour of the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, with enthusiasm members of the NDP support the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members will be voting in favour of the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 19, which was negated on the following division:)

*Government Orders**(Division No. 508)***YEAS**

## Members

Alarie	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bellehumeur
Bigras	Blaikie
Borotsik	Brien
Brisson	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Guimond
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Laliberte
Lalonde	Lebel
Lill	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
Muise	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Power
Proctor	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Solomon
St-Hilaire	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne —53	

**NAYS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Gilmour
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Harris	Harvard
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keys	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln

Longfield	Lunn
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Parry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Pratt
Provenzano	Ramsay
Redman	Reed
Reynolds	Ritz
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Schmidt
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solberg
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Julien	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —185	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Bakopanos
Barnes	Bergeron
Cardin	Carroll
Debien	Desrochers
Duceppe	Dumas
Laurin	MacAulay
Marchi	McLellan (Edmonton West)
Ménard	Mercier
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)	Minna
Plamondon	Proud
Richardson	Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)
Turp	

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 19 defeated.

The next question is on Motion No. 185. If Motion No. 185 is defeated, we would have to vote on Motion No. 186.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea, with the exception of the members for Davenport, Lac-Saint-Louis and York North who wish to vote nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.



[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Quebecois members will be voting against the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members will be voting in favour of the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 185, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 517)

### YEAS

#### Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brisson
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
De Villers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)

Martin (LaSalle—Énard)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Jacques
St-Julien	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —195	

### Government Orders

### NAYS

#### Members

Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bigras
Brien
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Dalphond-Guiral
de Savoye
Dockrill
Gagnon
Girard-Bujold
Guimond
Kraft Sloan
Lalonde
Lill
Loubier
Marceau
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Picard (Drummond)
Rocheleau
Solomon
Stoffer
Venne —42

### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Deuceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 185 carried.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I believe you would find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to Motion No. 193.

*Government Orders*

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is that agreed?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

(The House divided on Motion No. 193, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(*Division No. 523*)

**YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélaire	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brison
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)

Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —195

Power  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

**NAYS**

## Members

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Brien  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
Dockrill  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Guimond  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lill  
Loubier  
Marceau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Picard (Drummond)  
Rocheleau  
Solomon  
Stoffer  
Venne —42

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 193 carried.

The next question is on Motion No. 154.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I think you will find unanimous consent that those members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea, with the exception of the members for Davenport, Lac-Saint-Louis and York North, who vote nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there agreement to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[*English*]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Quebecois members will be voting against the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members will be voting against the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 154, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 520)

### YEAS

#### Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepolo	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Massé	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith

Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Julien
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Willfert	Wood —182

### Government Orders

### NAYS

#### Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Borotsik
Brien	Brison
Caccia	Casey
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Doyle
Earle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Guimond
Hardy	Harvey
Herron	Jones
Keddy (South Shore)	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Lincoln	Loubier
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
Muise	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Power
Proctor	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Solomon
St-Hilaire	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne —55	

### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 154 carried.

The next question is on Motion No. 230.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted

*Government Orders*

on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

• (1945 )

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Quebecois members will be voting against the motion.

[*English*]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening vote yes to the motion.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members will be voting in favour of the motion.

[*English*]

(The House divided on Motion No. 230, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 529)*

## YEAS

## Members

Adams	Alcock
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Brisson	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepolo
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Godfrey
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jennings

Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McTeague	McWhinney
Mifflin	Mitchell
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
Wilfert	Wood—152

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Alarie	Anders
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Bellehumeur	Benoit
Bigras	Blaikie
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	Dockrill
Duncan	Earle
Epp	Forseth
Gagnon	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Guimond	Hardy
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Loubier	Lunn
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
McNally	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Morrison
Nystrom	Obhrai
Penson	Picard (Drummond)
Proctor	Ramsay

## Government Orders

(Division No. 530)

Reynolds  
Rocheleau  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Vautour  
Venne  
White (North Vancouver)—85

Ritz  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Skeena)  
Solomon  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Vellacott  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 230 carried.

The next question is on Motion No. 231.

[Translation]

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I think you will find unanimous consent that the members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there agreement to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[English]

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, the Bloc Québécois members are voting no to the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, members of the NDP vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order to register a vote in the negative.

**Mr. Clifford Lincoln:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I would like to vote no to the motion.

**Mrs. Karen Kraft Sloan:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I would like to vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

(The House divided on Motion No. 231, which was agreed to on the following division:)

## YEAS

## Members

Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brown  
Bulte  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Galloway  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Guarnieri Harb  
Harvey  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Lastewka  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Marleau  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McWhinney  
Mitchell  
Murray  
Nault  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Provenzano  
Reed  
Rock  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Serré  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Julien  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Volpe  
Whelan  
Wood—149

Adams  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brison  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Dhaliwal  
Discepolo  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Godfrey  
Graham  
Grose  
Harvard  
Herron  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Knutson  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Longfield  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Mifflin  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Redman  
Robillard  
Saada  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Jacques  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Wappel  
Wilfert

*Government Orders*

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Alarie	Anders
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Bellehumeur	Benoit
Bigras	Blaikie
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Caccia
Cadman	Casson
Chatters	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Cummins
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Duncan
Earle	Epp
Forseth	Gagnon
Gauthier	Gilmour
Girard-Bujold	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goldring	Gouk
Grewal	Guimond
Hardy	Harris
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Jaffer	Johnston
Kennedy (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Lincoln	Loubier
Lunn	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Mark	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	McNally
Meredith	Mills (Red Deer)
Morrison	Nystrom
Obhrai	Penson
Picard (Drummond)	Proctor
Ramsay	Reynolds
Ritz	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Schmidt
Scott (Skeena)	Solberg
Solomon	St-Hilaire
Stinson	Stoffer
Strahl	Vautour
Vellacott	Venne
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—88

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 231 carried.

[*English*]

The next question is on Motion No. 233.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I wonder if I might ask the chair for clarification. Was that matter not dealt with and a previous vote applied to it? I am referring to Motion No. 128.

**The Deputy Speaker:** I am advised that it has not been dealt with. If the chief government whip has a suggestion, perhaps we could get consent.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I would seek the consent of the House to apply the results of the vote on Motion No. 128 to the motion now before the House, Motion No. 233.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is it agreed to apply the vote on Motion No. 128 to Motion No. 233?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Agreed and so ordered.

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I would like to indicate a vote in the negative to the motion.

**The Deputy Speaker:** That was done before.

(The House divided on Motion No. 233, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(*Division No. 531*)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Belair	Belanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brison
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	DeVillers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepolo	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano
Gallaway	Gilmour
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Harris	Harvard
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kennedy (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson

*Government Orders*

Konrad  
Lavigne  
Leung  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

Lastewka  
Lee  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rock  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood —194

## NAYS

## Members

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Blaikie  
Brown  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
Dockrill  
Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Guimond  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lill  
Loubier  
Marceau  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Picard (Drummond)  
Rocheleau  
Solomon  
Stoffer  
Venne —43

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Brien  
Caccia  
Crête  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Earle  
Gauthier  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Hardy  
Laliberte  
Lebel  
Lincoln  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Nystrom  
Proctor  
Sauvageau  
St-Hilaire  
Vautour

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** Accordingly, I declare Motion No. 233 carried.

**Hon. Christine Stewart (Minister of the Environment, Lib.)** moved that the bill, as amended, be concurred in at report stage with further amendments.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

• (1950 )

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Bloc Québécois vote no to the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present this evening in this Chamber vote no.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

**Mrs. Karen Kraft Sloan:** Mr. Speaker, I would like to register my vote as negative on concurrence.

**Mr. Clifford Lincoln:** Mr. Speaker, I would like to register my vote as no on concurrence.

**Hon. Charles Caccia:** No, Mr. Speaker.

(The House divided on the motion, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 532)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Anders  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Bulte  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey

Ablonczy  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bertrand  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson

*Government Orders*

Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clouthier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Duncan	Easter
Eggleton	Epp
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Forseth	Fry
Gagliano	Galloway
Gilmour	Godfrey
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grewal
Grose	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Hubbard
Ianno	Ifody
Jackson	Jaffer
Jennings	Johnston
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Keyes
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Konrad
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Mark
Marleau	Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mifflin	Mills (Red Deer)
Mitchell	Morrison
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Paradis	Patry
Penson	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Robillard
Rock	Saada
Schmidt	Scott (Fredericton)
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Jacques
St-Julien	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert
Wood —195	

Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	Dockrill
Earle	Gagnon
Gauthier	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Guimond
Hardy	Kraft Sloan
Laberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Lincoln	Loubier
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
Nystrom	Picard (Drummond)
Proctor	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Solomon
St-Hilaire	Stoffer
Vautour	Venne —42

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare the motion carried.

\* \* \*

## BANK ACT

The House resumed from May 26 consideration of the motion that Bill C-67, an act to amend the Bank Act, the Winding-up and Restructuring Act and other acts relating to financial institutions and to make consequential amendments to other acts, be read the third time and passed.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Pursuant to order made on Wednesday, May 26, 1999, the House will now proceed to the taking of the deferred recorded division on the motion at the third reading stage of Bill C-67.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House with Liberal members voting yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, the members of the Bloc Québécois vote no to the motion.

## NAYS

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Brien
Caccia	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral



*Government Orders*

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, the Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on the motion, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 533)*

**YEAS**

Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Assad	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellemare	Bennett
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Bonwick
Borotsik	Boudria
Bradshaw	Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)	Brison
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
Cummins	De Villers
Dhaliwal	Dion
Discepola	Doyle
Dromisky	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Finestone
Finlay	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Gilmour
Godfrey	Goldring
Goodale	Gouk
Graham	Gray (Windsor West)
Grewal	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Harris	Harvard
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hilstrom
Hubbard	Ianno
Iftody	Jackson
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Kraft Sloan
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	Lunn
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney

Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Énard)
Massé	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McKay (Scarborough East)	McNally
McTeague	McWhinney
Meredith	Mifflin
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pettigrew	Phinney
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Provenzano	Ramsay
Redman	Reed
Reynolds	Ritz
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Schmidt
Scott (Fredericton)	Scott (Skeena)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Solberg
Speller	St. Denis
Steckle	Stewart (Brant)
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Strahl	Szabo
Telegdi	Thibeault
Torsney	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vellacott	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)
Wilfert	Wood —198

**NAYS**

Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Blaikie	Brien
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
de Savoye	Desjarlais
Dockrill	Earle
Gagnon	Gauthier
Girard-Bujold	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Guimond	Hardy
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Loubier	Mancini
Marceau	Marchand
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Nystrom
Picard (Drummond)	Proctor
Rocheleau	Sauvageau
Solomon	St-Hilaire
Stoffer	Vautour
Venne—39	

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Deuppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

*Government Orders*

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare the motion carried.

(Division No. 534)

(Bill read the third time and passed)

## YEAS

\* \* \*

[Translation]

**CANADA TRAVELLING EXHIBITIONS  
INDEMNIFICATION ACT**

The House resumed from May 28, consideration of Bill C-64, an act to establish an indemnification program for travelling exhibitions, as reported (with amendment) from the committee.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The House will now proceed to the taking of the deferred divisions at report stage of Bill C-64.

The division is on the amendment to Motion No. 1.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I think you would find consent in the House to record the members who have just voted as voting on the motion now before the House, with the Liberals voting no.

[English]

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent of the House to proceed in such a fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, this is a good amendment. We are going to vote yes to this one.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Quebecois members vote in favour of the amendment.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, NDP members present vote yes to the amendment.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote no to the amendment.

[English]

(The House divided on the amendment, which was negated on the following division:)

Abbott  
Alarie  
Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bellehumeur  
Bigras  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brien  
Casson  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Cummins  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Duncan  
Epp  
Gagnon  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Gouk  
Guimond  
Harris  
Hilstrom  
Johnston  
Kerpan  
Laliberte  
Lebel  
Loubier  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
McNally  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Nystrom  
Penson  
Proctor  
Reynolds  
Rocheleau  
Schmidt  
Solberg  
St-Hilaire  
Stoffer  
Vautour  
Venne  
White (North Vancouver)—85

## Members

Ablonczy  
Anders  
Bailey  
Benoit  
Blaikie  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Cadman  
Chatters  
Crête  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
Dockrill  
Earle  
Forseth  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Godring  
Grewal  
Hardy  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Jaffer  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Konrad  
Lalonde  
Lill  
Lunn  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Meredith  
Morrison  
Obhrai  
Picard (Drummond)  
Ramsay  
Ritz  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Skeena)  
Solomon  
Stinson  
Strahl  
Vellacott  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)

## NAYS

## Members

Adams  
Anderson  
Augustine  
Baker  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Blondin-Andrew  
Bonwick  
Boudria  
Brisson  
Bryden  
Byrne  
Calder  
Caplan  
Catterall  
Chan  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copps  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Easter  
Finestone  
Folco  
Fry  
Galloway  
Goodale  
Gray (Windsor West)

Alcock  
Assad  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Beaumier  
Bélanger  
Bennett  
Bevilacqua  
Bonin  
Borotsik  
Bradshaw  
Brown  
Bulte  
Caccia  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Dhaliwal  
Discepola  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Eggleton  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Godfrey  
Graham  
Grose

## Government Orders

Guarnieri	Harb
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jennings
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McTeague	McWhinney
Mifflin	Mitchell
Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Speller
St. Denis	Steckle
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclief	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
Wlert	Wood—152

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakapanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare the amendment to Motion No. 1 defeated. The question therefore is on Motion No. 1.

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House with Liberal members voting yea.

• (1955)

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Québécois members vote no to the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, members of the New Democratic Party caucus in the House vote no to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on Motion No. 1, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 535)

## YEAS

## Members

Adams	Alcock
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Baker	Beaumur
Bélair	Bélanger
Bellemare	Bennett
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Brisson	Brown
Bryden	Bulte
Byrne	Caccia
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Copps	Cullen
DeVillers	Dhaliwal
Dion	Discepola
Doyle	Dromisky
Drouin	Duhamel
Easter	Eggleton
Finestone	Finlay
Folco	Fontana
Fry	Gagliano
Galloway	Godfrey
Goodale	Graham
Gray (Windsor West)	Grose
Guarnieri	Harb
Harvard	Harvey
Herron	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jackson	Jennings
Jones	Jordan
Karetak-Lindell	Karygiannis
Keddy (South Shore)	Keys
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)	Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)
Knutson	Kraft Sloan
Lastewka	Lavigne
Lee	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Lincoln
Longfield	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marleau
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)	Massé
Matthews	McCormick
McGuire	McKay (Scarborough East)
McTeague	McWhinney
Mifflin	Mitchell

*Government Orders*

Muise	Murray
Myers	Nault
Normand	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Paradis
Patry	Peric
Peterson	Pettigrew
Phinney	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Provenzano
Redman	Reed
Robillard	Rock
Saada	Scott (Fredericton)
Sekora	Serré
Shepherd	Speller
St. Denis	Steele
Stewart (Brant)	Stewart (Northumberland)
St-Jacques	St-Julien
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Torsney
Ur	Valeri
Vanclicf	Volpe
Wappel	Whelan
Wilfert	Wood—152

## NAYS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Alarie	Anders
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Bellehumeur	Benoit
Bigras	Blaikie
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Cadman
Casson	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	Dockrill
Duncan	Earle
Epp	Forseth
Gagnon	Gauthier
Gilmour	Girard-Bujold
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)	Goldring
Gouk	Grewal
Guimond	Hardy
Harris	Hill (Prince George—Peace River)
Hilstrom	Jaffer
Johnston	Kenney (Calgary Southeast)
Kerpan	Konrad
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lebel	Lill
Loubier	Lunn
Mancini	Marceau
Marchand	Mark
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (Winnipeg Centre)
McNally	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Morrison
Nystrom	Obhrai Penson
Picard (Drummond)	Proctor
Ramsay	Reynolds
Ritz	Rocheleau
Sauvageau	Schmidt
Scott (Skeena)	Solberg
Solomon	St-Hilaire
Stinson	Stoffer
Strahl	Vautour
Vellacott	Venne
White (Langley—Abbotsford)	White (North Vancouver)—85

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 1 carried.

**Hon. Sheila Copps (Minister of Canadian Heritage, Lib.)** moved that the bill, as amended, be concurred in.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion?

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, if the House would agree, I would propose that you seek unanimous consent that members who voted on the previous motion be recorded as having voted on the motion now before the House, with Liberal members voting yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in such a fashion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Mr. Chuck Strahl:** Mr. Speaker, Reform Party members present vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mrs. Madeleine Dalphond-Guiral:** Mr. Speaker, Bloc Quebecois members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, members of the NDP vote yes to the motion.

[Translation]

**Mr. André Harvey:** Mr. Speaker, Progressive Conservative members vote yes to the motion.

[English]

(The House divided on the motion, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 536)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alarie
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Assad
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bachand (Saint-Jean)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumur
Bélair	Bélangier
Bellehumeur	Bellemare
Bennett	Benoit
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Bigras	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Bonwick	Borotsik
Boudria	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brien	Brison
Brown	Bryden
Bulte	Byrne
Caccia	Cadman
Calder	Cannis
Caplan	Casey
Casson	Catterall
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Clouthier
Coderre	Collette
Comuzzi	Copps
Crête	Cullen
Cummins	Dalphond-Guiral

Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dhaliwal  
Discepolo  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Easter  
Epp  
Finlay  
Fontana  
Fry  
Gagnon  
Gauthier  
Girard-Bujold  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Grewal  
Guarnieri  
Harb  
Harris  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Konrad  
Laliberte  
Lastewka  
Lebel  
Leung  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Longfield  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marceau  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mifflin  
Mitchell  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Patry  
Peric  
Pettigrew  
Picard (Drummond)  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Provenzano  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Robillard  
Rock  
Sauvageau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Sekora  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
St. Denis  
Stewart (Brant)  
St-Hilaire  
St-Jacques  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—237

de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Dion  
Dockrill  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Earle  
Eggleton  
Finestone  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Gilmour  
Godfrey  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Gray (Windsor West)  
Grose  
Guimond  
Hardy  
Harvard  
Herron  
Hilstrom  
Ianno  
Jackson  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottetown)  
Knutson  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Lavigne  
Lee  
Lill  
Lincoln  
Loubier  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mancini  
Marchand  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Massé  
McCormick  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Paradis  
Penson  
Peterson  
Phinney  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Rocheleau  
Saada  
Schmidt  
Scott (Skeena)  
Serré  
Solberg  
Speller  
Steckle  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
Stinson  
St-Julien  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Torsney  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

### Private Members' Business

#### NAYS

Members

\*Nil/aucun

#### PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare the motion carried. When shall the bill be read a third time? By leave, now?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Hon. Sheila Copps** moved that the bill be read the third time and passed.

(Motion agreed to, bill read the third time and passed)

---

### PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS

[English]

#### CRIMINAL CODE

The House resumed from May 28 consideration of Bill C-251, an act to amend the Criminal Code and the Corrections and Conditional Release Act (cumulative sentences), as reported (with amendment) from the committee.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The House will now proceed to the taking of the deferred recorded divisions on the motions at report stage of Bill C-251 under Private Members' Business.

[Translation]

The question is on Motion No. 1.

[English]

The division will be taken row by row starting with the sponsor and then proceeding with those in favour of the motion beginning with the back row on the side of the House on which the sponsors sit. After proceeding through the rows on that first side, the members sitting on the other side of the House will vote, again beginning with the back row. Those opposed to the motion will be called in the same order.

*Private Members' Business*

● (2005)

(The House divided on Motion No. 1, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 537)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Adams	Alcock
Anders	Anderson
Augustine	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bailey	Baker
Beaumier	Bélaïr
Bélanger	Bellemare
Benoit	Bertrand
Bevilacqua	Blaikie
Blondin-Andrew	Bonin
Borotsik	Bradshaw
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Bryden
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Catterall	Chamberlain
Chan	Charbonneau
Chatters	Clothier
Coderre	Collenette
Comuzzi	Copps
Cullen	Cummins
Dion	Discepola
Doyle	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Gagliano	Gagnon
Galloway	Gilmour
Girard-Bujold	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Grewal	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetek-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keys	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Knutson
Konrad	Lastewka
Lebel	Leung
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)	Longfield
Lunn	MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)
Mahoney	Malhi
Maloney	Marchand
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Nystrom
Obhrai	O'Brien (Labrador)
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)	O'Reilly
Pagtakhan	Penson
Peric	Peterson
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)	Pillitteri
Power	Pratt
Proctor	Provenzano
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Schmidt
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Serré	Shepherd
Solberg	Solomon
Speller	Steckle
Stewart (Northumberland)	Stinson
St-Jacques	Stoffer
Strahl	Szabo

Telegdi  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—171

Thibeault  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

**NAYS**

## Members

Alarie	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Bellehumeur	Bigras
Brien	Brown
Byrne	Caccia
Carroll	Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	de Savoye
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dockrill	Dromisky
Earle	Finestone
Finlay	Gauthier
Grose	Guimond
Hardy	Harvard
Hilstrom	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lill	Loubier
Mancini	Marceau
McKay (Scarborough East)	Paradis
Patry	Phinney
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Saada	Sauvageau
Scott (Fredericton)	St-Hilaire
St-Julien	Torsney—46

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 1 carried.

The next question is on the amendment to Motion No. 2.

**Mr. Lynn Myers:** Mr. Speaker, I wonder if there would be unanimous consent to apply the votes in the manner that was just done consistent with the next five?

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is it agreed to apply the vote on the motion just taken to the motion now before the House?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Some hon. members:** No.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Accordingly, we will proceed in the usual way.

*Private Members' Business*

• (2015)

*Before the taking of the vote:*

**Mr. Gary Lunn:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I was standing to be recorded for yes but somehow I got missed. I am not sure how they could have missed me.

**The Deputy Speaker:** I am sure no one can imagine, but I am sure the hon. member will also be counted.

(The House divided on the amendment, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(Division No. 538)

## YEAS

## Members

Abbott  
Adams  
Anders  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Bélair  
Bellemare  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Brown  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Catterall  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Dion  
Dromisky  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Grewal  
Harb  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Ianno  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Lastewka  
Leung  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mitchell  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai

Ablonczy  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélangier  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brison  
Bryden  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copps  
Cummins  
Doyle  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagnon  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Guarnieri  
Harris  
Herron  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Konrad  
Lebel  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)

O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Peric  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Sekora  
Solberg  
Speller  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)  
Wood—163

O'Reilly  
Penson  
Phinney  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
Steckle  
Stinson  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Venne  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert

## NAYS

## Members

Alarie  
Bellehumeur  
Brien  
Carroll  
Crête  
Davies  
Desjarlais  
Dockrill  
Finestone  
Gauthier  
Guimond  
Hilstrom  
Laliberte  
Lill  
Mancini  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
Patry  
Rocheleau  
Sauvageau  
St-Hilaire  
Torsney—41

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Bigras  
Caccia  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
de Savoye  
DeVillers  
Earle  
Finlay  
Grose  
Harvard  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
Marceau  
Paradis  
Picard (Drummond)  
Saada  
Scott (Fredericton)  
St-Julien

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian  
Bakopanos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas  
MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin  
Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare the amendment to Motion No. 2 carried.

**Mr. Peter MacKay:** Mr. Speaker, I would again seek unanimous consent to have the results of the vote just taken applied to the remaining four votes.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to apply these votes?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Some hon. members:** No.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The question is on Motion No. 2, as amended.

*Private Members' Business*

**Mr. Lynn Myers:** Mr. Speaker, in the interest of co-operation I rise on a point of order to seek unanimous consent that the House apply the vote just taken to the four remaining.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The Chair is not prepared to keep doing this. I will ask once more and then we are proceeding. Is there unanimous consent to apply the vote just taken as indicated?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Some hon. members:** No.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The next question is on Motion No. 2, as amended.

• (2025)

[*Translation*]

(The House divided on Motion No. 2, which was agreed to on the following division: )

*(Division No. 539)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélanger	Bellemare
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Borotsik
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Bryden
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Cullen	Cummins
Dion	Discepolo
Doyle	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Folco
Fontana	Forseth
Gagliano	Gagnon
Gilmour	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Grewal	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keys	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Konrad
Lastewka	Lebel

Leung	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Longfield	Lunn
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Penson	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Proctor
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Schmidt
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Shepherd	Solberg
Solomon	Speller
Steckle	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert—156

**NAYS**

## Members

Adams	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Benoit	Brien
Caccia	Carroll
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphond-Guiral	Davies
Desjarlais	De Villers
Dockrill	Dromisky
Earle	Finstone
Finlay	Gauthier
Grose	Guimond
Hilstrom	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lill	Loubier
Mancini	McKay (Scarborough East)
Paradis	Patry
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Saada	Scott (Fredericton)
St-Julien	Torsney —36

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 2, as amended, carried.

[*English*]

The next question is on the amendment to Motion No. 3.



*Private Members' Business*

**Mr. Bob Kilger:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. I believe you will find consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to the amendment to Motion No. 3 under the name of the hon. member for Leeds—Grenville and Motion No. 3 under the name of the hon. member for Mississauga East. That would leave the report stage concurrence motion to be voted on subsequently by itself.

I am suggesting that we might have consent to apply the results of the vote just taken to the next two votes and only those.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed as outlined by the chief government whip?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Ghislain Lebel:** Mr. Speaker, on a point of order. It has been drawn to my attention that I was not recorded as voting in favour of the motion on the last vote. I want to make sure that this is done.

**The Deputy Speaker:** We can assure the hon. member that his name will be included on the list for Motion No. 3 and the amendment has having voted yea.

**Mr. Ghislain Lebel:** Mr. Speaker, I was present at the last vote, but I do not think I was recognized.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The name of the hon. member is now recorded.

[*English*]

(The House divided on the amendment, which was agreed to on the following division:)

(*Division No. 540*)

**YEAS**

Members

Abbott	Ablonczy
Alcock	Anders
Anderson	Augustine
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)	Bailey
Baker	Beaumier
Bélanger	Bellemare
Bertrand	Bevilacqua
Blaikie	Blondin-Andrew
Bonin	Borotsik
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)	Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)
Brison	Bryden
Cadman	Calder
Cannis	Caplan
Casey	Casson
Chamberlain	Chan
Charbonneau	Chatters
Clouthier	Coderre
Collenette	Comuzzi
Cullen	Cummins
Dion	Discepola
Doyle	Drouin
Duhamel	Duncan
Easter	Eggleton
Epp	Folco
Fontana	Forseth

Gagliano	Gagnon
Gilmour	Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)
Goldring	Goodale
Gouk	Graham
Grewal	Guarnieri
Harb	Harris
Harvey	Herron
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)	Hubbard
Ianno	Iftody
Jaffer	Jennings
Johnston	Jones
Jordan	Karetak-Lindell
Karygiannis	Keddy (South Shore)
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)	Kerpan
Keyes	Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)	Konrad
Lastewka	Lebel
Leung	Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)
Longfield	Lunn
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)	Mahoney
Malhi	Maloney
Mark	Marleau
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)	Martin (LaSalle—Émard)
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)	Matthews
McCormick	McGuire
McNally	McTeague
McWhinney	Meredith
Mills (Red Deer)	Mitchell
Morrison	Muise
Murray	Myers
Nault	Normand
Nystrom	Obhrai
O'Brien (Labrador)	O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)
O'Reilly	Pagtakhan
Penson	Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)
Pillitteri	Power
Pratt	Proctor
Ramsay	Redman
Reed	Reynolds
Ritz	Schmidt
Scott (Skeena)	Sekora
Shepherd	Solberg
Solomon	Speller
Steckle	Stewart (Northumberland)
Stinson	St-Jacques
Stoffer	Strahl
Szabo	Telegdi
Thibeault	Ur
Valeri	Vanclief
Vautour	Vellacott
Volpe	Wappel
Whelan	White (Langley—Abbotsford)
White (North Vancouver)	Wilfert—156

**NAYS**

Members

Adams	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Benoit	Brien
Caccia	Carroll
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)	Crête
Dalphon-Duval	Davies
Desjarlais	DeVillers
Dockrill	Dromisky
Earle	Finestone
Finlay	Gauthier
Grose	Guimond
Hilstrom	Kraft Sloan
Laliberte	Lalonde
Lill	Loubier
Mancini	McKay (Scarborough East)
Paradis	Patry
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Saada	Scott (Fredericton)
St-Julien	Torsney —36

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopoulos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin

*Private Members' Business*

MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

Gagliano  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Graham  
Guarnieri  
Harris  
Herron  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Konrad  
Lebel  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mitchell  
Muisse  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Sekora  
Solberg  
Speller  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert—157

Gagnon  
Girard-Bujold  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Grewal  
Harb  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Ianno  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keyes  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Lastewka  
Leung  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nystrom  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Penson  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
Steckle  
Stinson  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare the amendment to Motion No. 3 carried. The next question is on Motion No. 3.

**Mr. John Solomon:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. On Motion No. 3 as amended by the hon. member for Leeds—Grenville and Motion No. 3 in the name of the hon. member for Mississauga East, the member for Churchill shall not be counted for our caucus. She has departed.

[*Translation*]

**Ms. Jocelyne Girard-Bujold:** Mr. Speaker, I would like you to record my vote on Motion No. 3 as having voted in favour of the motion.

**The Deputy Speaker:** For the amendment to Motion No. 3 as well? For both?

**Ms. Jocelyne Girard-Bujold:** Yes, Mr. Speaker.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent to proceed in this fashion with the changes already indicated?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

[*English*]

(The House divided on Motion No. 3, which was agreed to on the following division:)

*(Division No. 541)***YEAS**

## Members

Abbott  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélanger  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brison  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Cullen  
Dion  
Doyle  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Fontana

Ablonczy  
Anders  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bellemare  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Bryden  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cummins  
Discepolo  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Folco  
Forseth

Adams  
Benoit  
Caccia  
Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic)  
Dalphond-Guiral  
DeVillers  
Dromisky  
Finestone  
Gauthier  
Guimond  
Kraft Sloan  
Lalonde  
Loubier  
McKay (Scarborough East)  
Patry  
Rocheleau  
Scott (Fredericton)  
Torsney —35

Assadourian  
Bakopoulos  
Bergeron  
Carroll  
Desrochers  
Dumas

**NAYS**

## Members

Bachand (Saint-Jean)  
Brien  
Carroll  
Crête  
Davies  
Dockrill  
Earle  
Finlay  
Grose  
Hilstrom  
Laliberte  
Lill  
Mancini  
Paradis  
Picard (Drummond)  
Saada  
St-Julien

**PAIRED MEMBERS**

Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Barnes  
Cardin  
Debien  
Duceppe  
Laurin

*Private Members' Business**(Division No. 542)*

MacAulay  
McLellan (Edmonton West)  
Mercier  
Minna  
Proud  
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)

Marchi  
Ménard  
Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)  
Plamondon  
Richardson  
Turp

**The Deputy Speaker:** I declare Motion No. 3, as amended, carried.

**Ms. Albina Guarnieri (Mississauga East, Lib.)** moved that the bill, as amended, be concurred in.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is it the pleasure of the House to adopt the motion?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Some hon. members:** No.

**The Deputy Speaker:** All those in favour of the motion will please say yea.

**Some hon. members:** Yea.

**The Deputy Speaker:** All those opposed will please say nay.

**Some hon. members:** Nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** In my opinion the yeas have it.

*And more than five members having risen:*

• (2035)

**Mr. Ivan Grose:** Mr. Speaker, due to a temporary lapse of attention my vote was not recorded on the last vote. I would like to be recorded as voting nay.

**The Deputy Speaker:** The member will be recorded accordingly.

**Mr. Ken Epp:** Mr. Speaker, I rise on a point of order. In anticipation of the pandemonium that will break out when the last vote is announced, I would like to say thank you for the wonderful way you have conducted the votes tonight.

**The Deputy Speaker:** We will wait for the pandemonium, thank you.

(The House divided on the motion, which was agreed to on the following division:)

Abbott  
Alcock  
Anderson  
Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)  
Baker  
Bélanger  
Benoit  
Bevilacqua  
Blondin-Andrew  
Borotsik  
Breitkreuz (Yorkton—Melville)  
Bryden  
Calder  
Caplan  
Casson  
Chan  
Chatters  
Coderre  
Comuzzi  
Cullen  
Dion  
Doyle  
Duhamel  
Easter  
Epp  
Fontana  
Gagliano  
Galloway  
Girard-Bujold  
Goldring  
Gouk  
Guarnieri  
Harris  
Herron  
Hubbard  
Iftody  
Jennings  
Jones  
Karetak-Lindell  
Keddy (South Shore)  
Kerpan  
Kilger (Stormont—Dundas—Charlottenburgh)  
Konrad  
Lebel  
Limoges (Windsor—St. Clair)  
Lunn  
Mahoney  
Maloney  
Marleau  
Martin (LaSalle—Émard)  
Matthews  
McGuire  
McTeague  
Meredith  
Mitchell  
Muise  
Myers  
Normand  
Obhrai  
O'Brien (London—Fanshawe)  
Pagtakhan  
Pickard (Chatham—Kent Essex)  
Power  
Proctor  
Redman  
Reynolds  
Schmidt  
Sekora  
Solberg  
Speller  
Stewart (Northumberland)  
St-Jacques  
Strahl  
Telegdi  
Ur  
Vanclief  
Vellacott  
Wappel  
White (Langley—Abbotsford)  
Wilfert—159

## YEAS

## Members

Ablonczy  
Anders  
Augustine  
Bailey  
Beaumier  
Bellemare  
Bertrand  
Blaikie  
Bonin  
Breitkreuz (Yellowhead)  
Brison  
Cadman  
Cannis  
Casey  
Chamberlain  
Charbonneau  
Clouthier  
Collenette  
Copp  
Cummins  
Discepola  
Drouin  
Duncan  
Eggleton  
Folco  
Forseth  
Gagnon  
Gilmour  
Godin (Acadie—Bathurst)  
Goodale  
Grewal  
Harb  
Harvey  
Hill (Prince George—Peace River)  
Ianno  
Jaffer  
Johnston  
Jordan  
Karygiannis  
Kenney (Calgary Southeast)  
Keys  
Kilgour (Edmonton Southeast)  
Lastewka  
Leung  
Longfield  
MacKay (Pictou—Antigonish—Guysborough)  
Malhi  
Mark  
Martin (Esquimalt—Juan de Fuca)  
Martin (Winnipeg Centre)  
McCormick  
McNally  
McWhinney  
Mills (Red Deer)  
Morrison  
Murray  
Nault  
Nyström  
O'Brien (Labrador)  
O'Reilly  
Penson  
Pillitteri  
Pratt  
Ramsay  
Reed  
Ritz  
Scott (Skeena)  
Shepherd  
Solomon  
Steckle  
Stinson  
Stoffer  
Szabo  
Thibeault  
Valeri  
Vautour  
Volpe  
Whelan  
White (North Vancouver)

*Adjournment Debate*

## NAYS

## Members

Adams	Bachand (Saint-Jean)
Brien	Brown
Caccia	Carroll
Crête	Dalphond-Guiral
Davies	DeVillers
Dockrill	Dromisky
Earle	Finestone
Finlay	Gauthier
Grose	Hilstrom
Kraft Sloan	Laliberte
Lalonde	Lill
Loubier	Mancini
McKay (Scarborough East)	Paradis
Patry	Phinney
Picard (Drummond)	Rocheleau
Saada	Scott (Fredericton)
St-Julien	Torsney —34

## PAIRED MEMBERS

Assadourian	Axworthy (Winnipeg South Centre)
Bakopanos	Barnes
Bergeron	Cardin
Carroll	Debien
Desrochers	Duceppe
Dumas	Laurin
MacAulay	Marchi
McLellan (Edmonton West)	Ménard
Mercier	Mills (Broadview—Greenwood)
Minna	Plamondon
Proud	Richardson
Tremblay (Rimouski—Mitis)	Turp

**Mr. Randy White:** Mr. Speaker, since the previous amendments to Bill C-251 now constitute legislation complete at report stage, I seek the unanimous consent of the House to vote at third reading of Bill C-251.

**The Deputy Speaker:** Is there unanimous consent?

**Some hon. members:** Agreed.

**Some hon. members:** No.

---

**ADJOURNMENT PROCEEDINGS**

[English]

A motion to adjourn the House under Standing Order 38 deemed to have been moved.

## KOSOVO

**Mr. Gordon Earle (Halifax West, NDP):** Mr. Speaker, it appears that U.S. A-10 Warthog jets are deploying depleted uranium shells in Kosovo. Since this is being done under the NATO umbrella, to which we are a partner, we bear responsibility for this atrocious act.

Turning a blind eye to the use of depleted uranium in Kosovo is not only unacceptable but also unforgivable.

Depleted uranium is 7.7 times more dense than lead. For this reason it is used in shells fired by the Warthog's Avenger Cannon. The weight allows the rounds to penetrate deeply into concrete, such as bunkers, as well as metal, such as tanks. Jane's Information Group also describes the enhanced "incendiary effects" of depleted uranium since it is a natural agent that ignites on contact with air.

The famous epidemiologist, Dr. Rosalie Bertell, has the following to say about depleted uranium:

DU is highly toxic to humans, both chemically as a heavy metal and radiologically as an alpha particle emitter which is very dangerous when taken internally.

• (2040 )

Upon impact, the DU bursts into flames. It produces a toxic and radioactive ceramic aerosol that is much lighter than uranium dust. It can travel in the air tens of kilometres from the point of release, or settle waiting to be stirred up in dust and suspended in the air by human or animal movement.

It is very small and can be breathed by anyone from babies and pregnant women to the elderly and the sick. This radioactive and toxic ceramic can stay in the lungs for years, irradiating the surrounding tissue with powerful alpha particles. It can affect the lungs, gastrointestinal system, liver, kidneys, bone, other tissues and renal system.

The A-10 Warthog is capable of firing 4,200 rounds of this abomination every minute. The U.S. government has suggested that almost one million rounds of this radioactive toxin casing were fired in Iraq during the gulf war. Iraq has witnessed explosive rates of stillbirths, children born with defects, childhood leukemia and other cancers, in particular near the Basara region where these shells were fired.

Dr. Bertell states the following about DU:

It is most likely a major contributor to the Gulf War Syndrome experienced by the veterans and the people of Iraq.

I understand that Pentagon spokesperson Major-General Chuck Wald admitted to the BBC on May 7 of this year that A-10 Warthogs were indeed deploying this evil in Kosovo.

NATO has already launched potentially devastating environmental offensives in Kosovo. It bombed the largest medical factory in Yugoslavia when it bombed the Galenika pharmaceutical complex, releasing highly toxic fumes. On April 15 NATO bombed the petrochemical complex in Pancevo releasing huge amounts of chlorine, ethylene dichloride and vinyl chloride monomer. The same day it hit an ammonia supply company.

NATO is not a foreign power. It is we. It is the people in this House. The Liberal government has not only the power but also the moral, ethical and humane obligation to speak out with force.

*Adjournment Debate*

Using DU is an abominable atrocity. It can be stopped. The Liberal government can do something about it.

Canadians, Yugoslavians and especially pregnant women and children in the region being bombed have the right to know that this government will not stop until it can assure all of us that any and all use of DU is stopped.

[*Translation*]

**Mr. Robert Bertrand (Parliamentary Secretary to Minister of National Defence, Lib.):** Mr. Speaker, our on-going commitment in Kosovo is important for this government and for all Canadians, not only because we are members of an alliance, but because of the moral issues at stake.

Our contribution has been recognized as significant and worthy. As we speak, members and planes of the Canadian forces are taking part in NATO air operations over Yugoslavia.

We are sending some 800 members of the Canadian armed forces to the former Yugoslavian Republic of Macedonia as part of our commitment to an international force that will help implement a peace accord.

The members of the Canadian forces deserve our recognition and our support for the most important job they have taken on on behalf of all Canadian citizens.

[*English*]

There are no munitions containing depleted uranium in the Canadian forces' inventory. There are no plans to purchase or use such ammunition in the future. Canada does not allow any foreign testing or use of depleted uranium ammunition on Canadian soil.

Some of our NATO allies are using this type of ammunition. The use of depleted uranium is not restricted by any international arms control treaty or convention.

Exposure to depleted uranium has been investigated as a possible cause for illness, in particular in gulf war veterans. None of the scientific work published to this day supports a link between exposure to depleted uranium and illnesses in gulf war veterans, including cancer and birth defects. American investigators followed gulf war veterans with depleted uranium shrapnel in their bodies and have not found any illnesses compatible with heavy metal or radiation poisoning.

[*Translation*]

**The Deputy Speaker:** The motion to adjourn the House is now deemed to have been adopted.

Accordingly, this House stands adjourned until tomorrow at 10 a.m., pursuant to Standing Order 24(1).

(The House adjourned at 8.44 p.m.)

---



# CONTENTS

Monday, May 31, 1999

## PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS

Mr. Godfrey .....	15475
Motion .....	15475
(Motion agreed to) .....	15475

### An Act to incorporate the Alliance of Manufacturers & Exporters Canada

Bill S-18. Second reading .....	15475
Mr. Godfrey .....	15475
(Motion adopted, bill read the second time, considered in committee of the whole and reported to the House; concurred in at report stage, read the third time and passed) .....	15475

### Canadian Armed Forces

Motion .....	15475
Mr. Bertrand .....	15475
Mr. Grewal .....	15476
Mr. Harb .....	15478
Mr. Benoit .....	15479
Ms. Desjarlais .....	15480
Mr. Borotsik .....	15480
Mr. Clouthier .....	15481

## GOVERNMENT ORDERS

### Canadian Environmental Protection Act, 1999

<b>Bill C-32—Time allocation motion</b>	
Mr. Boudria .....	15483
Motion agreed to .....	15484

### Canadian Environmental Protection Act, 1999

Bill C-32. Report stage .....	15484
Mr. Gilmour .....	15484
Divisions deemed demanded and deferred .....	15486
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15486
Motions Nos. 17, 20, 21, 27 to 29, 34, 35, 40, 44, 45, 54, 55, 72, 75 to 79, 82, 92, 98 to 100, 102 to 104, 114, 124, 126, 127, 131, 134, 136, 140 to 145, 152, 157, 158, 162 to 166, 168, 226 to 229, 232 and 234 to 236 .....	15486
Ms. Torsney .....	15489
Ms. Girard-Bujold .....	15490
Mr. Lincoln .....	15491
Divisions deemed demanded and deferred .....	15491
Mr. Laliberte .....	15491
Motions Nos. 36 and 37 .....	15492
Mr. Gilmour .....	15492
Motion No. 38 .....	15492
Mr. Laliberte .....	15492
Motions Nos. 41, 70 and 73 .....	15492
Ms. Girard-Bujold .....	15492
Mr. Caccia .....	15493
Mr. Herron .....	15493
Ms. Torsney .....	15493
Mr. Herron .....	15493
Mr. Laliberte .....	15494
Mr. Gilmour .....	15495
Mr. Bélair .....	15496
Mr. Sauvageau .....	15497

## STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

### Crohn's and Colitis Foundation of Canada

Mr. Myers .....	15497
-----------------	-------

### Prostate Cancer

Mr. White (North Vancouver) .....	15497
-----------------------------------	-------

### Canadian Volunteer Advisers to Business

Mr. Wilfert .....	15497
-------------------	-------

### The Environment

Ms. Torsney .....	15498
-------------------	-------

### Canada Post

Mr. St-Julien .....	15498
---------------------	-------

### Impaired Driving

Mr. Harris .....	15498
------------------	-------

### World No Tobacco Day

Mrs. Bennett .....	15498
--------------------	-------

### Natural Gas Resources

Mr. Crête .....	15499
-----------------	-------

### Taxation

Mr. Solberg .....	15499
-------------------	-------

### Kuwait

Mr. Harb .....	15499
----------------	-------

### Human Rights

Ms. Davies .....	15499
------------------	-------

### World No Tobacco Day

Mrs. Picard .....	15499
-------------------	-------

### Annapolis County Seniors Safety Program

Mr. Muise .....	15500
-----------------	-------

### National Drug Strategy

Mr. White (Langley—Abbotsford) .....	15500
--------------------------------------	-------

### Water Quality

Mr. Earle .....	15500
-----------------	-------

### Government of Canada

Mr. Borotsik .....	15500
--------------------	-------

### Scientific Research

Mr. Discepola .....	15501
---------------------	-------

### Summer Employment

Mr. Malhi .....	15501
-----------------	-------

### Statistics Canada

Mr. de Savoye .....	15501
---------------------	-------

## ORAL QUESTION PERIOD

### Kosovo

Mr. Manning .....	15501
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15501
Mr. Manning .....	15501
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15501
Mr. Manning .....	15502
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15502

### Government Grants

Mr. Strahl .....	15502
------------------	-------

Ms. Brown .....	15502
Mr. Strahl .....	15502
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15502
<b>Publishing Industry</b>	
Mr. Gauthier .....	15502
Ms. Copps .....	15502
Mr. Gauthier .....	15502
Ms. Copps .....	15503
Mrs. Lalonde .....	15503
Ms. Copps .....	15503
Mrs. Lalonde .....	15503
Ms. Copps .....	15503
<b>The Environment</b>	
Mr. Blaikie .....	15503
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15503
Mr. Blaikie .....	15503
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15503
Mr. Herron .....	15503
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15504
Mr. Herron .....	15504
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15504
<b>Transitional Jobs Fund</b>	
Mrs. Ablonczy .....	15504
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15504
Mrs. Ablonczy .....	15504
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15504
<b>Publishing Industry</b>	
Mr. Sauvageau .....	15504
Mr. Marchi .....	15505
Mr. Sauvageau .....	15505
Mr. Marchi .....	15505
<b>Government Grants</b>	
Mr. Solberg .....	15505
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15505
Mr. Solberg .....	15505
Mr. Solberg .....	15505
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15505
<b>Canadian Broadcasting Corporation</b>	
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15505
Ms. Copps .....	15505
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15505
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15506
<b>Correctional Service Canada</b>	
Mr. White (Langley—Abbotsford) .....	15506
Mr. MacAulay .....	15506
Mr. White (Langley—Abbotsford) .....	15506
Mr. MacAulay .....	15506
<b>Tainted Blood</b>	
Mr. Loubier .....	15506
Mr. Chrétien (Saint-Maurice) .....	15506
<b>The Environment</b>	
Mr. Harvard .....	15506
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15506
<b>Publishing Industry</b>	
Mr. Mark .....	15506
Ms. Copps .....	15506
Mr. Mark .....	15507
Ms. Copps .....	15507

<b>The Environment</b>	
Ms. Hardy .....	15507
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15507
Mr. Laliberte .....	15507
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15507
<b>Gun Control</b>	
Mr. MacKay .....	15507
Ms. McLellan .....	15507
Mr. MacKay .....	15508
Ms. McLellan .....	15508
<b>Shipbuilding Industry</b>	
Mr. Murray .....	15508
Mr. Lastewka .....	15508
<b>Agriculture</b>	
Mr. Bailey .....	15508
Mr. Vanclief .....	15508
<b>National Defence</b>	
Mr. Bachand (Saint-Jean) .....	15508
Mr. Eggleton .....	15508
<b>Natural Resources</b>	
Mr. Godin (Acadie—Bathurst) .....	15509
Mr. Goodale .....	15509
<b>Agriculture</b>	
Mr. Borotsik .....	15509
Mr. Vanclief .....	15509
<b>Trade and Tourism</b>	
Mr. Provenzano .....	15509
Mr. Dhaliwal .....	15509
<b>Agriculture</b>	
Mr. Bailey .....	15509
Mr. Vanclief .....	15509
<b>Money Laundering</b>	
Mr. Marceau .....	15510
Mr. Boudria .....	15510
<b>Pay Equity</b>	
Ms. Desjarlais .....	15510
Mr. Massé .....	15510
<b>Windsor—St. Clair</b>	
The Speaker .....	15510

## ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

<b>Government Response to Petitions</b>	
Mr. Adams .....	15510
<b>Committees of the House</b>	
<b>Industry</b>	
Ms. Whelan .....	15510
<b>Transport</b>	
Mr. Bonin .....	15510
<b>Proceeds of Crime (Money Laundering) Act</b>	
Bill C-81. Introduction and first reading .....	15511
Mr. Peterson .....	15511
(Motions deemed adopted, bill read the first time and printed) .....	15511
<b>Petitions</b>	
<b>Firearms</b>	
Mr. Gouk .....	15511
<b>Young Offenders Act</b>	
Mr. Gouk .....	15511



<b>Housing in Nunavik</b>	
Mr. St-Julien .....	15511
<b>Royal Canadian Mounted Police</b>	
Ms. St-Jacques .....	15511
<b>Hepatitis</b>	
Mr. Stoffer .....	15511
<b>Government Grants</b>	
Mr. Benoit .....	15511
<b>Government Regulation</b>	
Mr. Steckle .....	15511
<b>Firearms</b>	
Mr. Steckle .....	15512
<b>Taxation</b>	
Mr. Epp .....	15512
<b>Aboriginal Affairs</b>	
Ms. Desjarlais .....	15512
<b>Questions on the Order Paper</b>	
Mr. Adams .....	15512

## GOVERNMENT ORDERS

### Canadian Environmental Protection Act, 1999

Bill C-32. Report stage .....	15514
Mr. Sauvageau .....	15514
Ms. Torsney .....	15515
Mr. Earle .....	15516
Mr. Murray .....	15518
Mr. Bigras .....	15518
Mr. Stoffer .....	15520
Ms. Torsney .....	15521
Mr. Stoffer .....	15521
Mr. Guimond .....	15521
Ms. Desjarlais .....	15523
Mr. Bachand (Saint-Jean) .....	15524
Mrs. Dockrill .....	15526
Mr. Chrétien (Frontenac—Mégantic) .....	15526
Ms. Hardy .....	15528
Mr. Brien .....	15529
Mrs. Lalonde .....	15530
Mr. Rocheleau .....	15532
Mr. de Savoye .....	15533
Mrs. Picard .....	15534
Divisions on motions deemed demanded and deferred ...	15535
Mr. Gilmour .....	15536
Motion No. 53 .....	15536
Mr. Laliberte .....	15536
Motion No. 151 .....	15536
Mr. Gilmour .....	15536
Motion No. 153 .....	15536
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15536
Motions Nos. 154 and 185 .....	15536
Mr. Herron .....	15536
Motion No. 186 .....	15536
Mr. Gilmour .....	15536
Motions Nos. 187 and 191 .....	15536
Mr. Herron .....	15536
Motion No. 192 .....	15536
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15536
Motion No. 193 .....	15536
Mr. Gilmour .....	15536
Motion No. 194 .....	15536
Ms. Girard-Bujold .....	15536
Motion No. 198 .....	15536

Mr. Herron .....	15536
Motion No. 200 .....	15537
Mr. Gilmour .....	15537
Motions Nos. 201 and 202 .....	15537
Mr. Caccia .....	15537
Ms. Girard-Bujold .....	15538
Ms. Torsney .....	15539
Mr. Lincoln .....	15540
Mr. Caccia .....	15540
Mr. Laliberte .....	15540
The Deputy Speaker .....	15540
Mr. Laliberte .....	15540
Mr. Herron .....	15541
Motion No. 214 .....	15541
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15541
Motions Nos. 230, 231 and 233 .....	15541
Divisions deemed demanded and deferred .....	15541
The Deputy Speaker .....	15541
Motion No. 1 negatived .....	15542
Mr. Kilger .....	15542
Mr. Duncan .....	15542
Mr. Hilstrom .....	15542
Motions Nos. 13, 71, 87, 130, 132, 206, 6, 137, 10, 18, 38, 53, 153, 191 and 201 .....	15555
Mr. Kilger .....	15555
Mr. Strahl .....	15555
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15555
Mr. Solomon .....	15555
Mr. Harvey .....	15555
Mr. Caccia .....	15555
Motion No. 2 agreed to .....	15556
Mr. Kilger .....	15556
Mr. Strahl .....	15556
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15556
Mr. Solomon .....	15556
Mr. Harvey .....	15557
Motion No. 14 agreed to .....	15557
Mr. Kilger .....	15557
Motions Nos. 7 and 8 agreed to .....	15559
Mr. Kilger .....	15559
Mr. Strahl .....	15559
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15559
Mr. Solomon .....	15560
Mr. Harvey .....	15560
Mr. Caccia .....	15560
Mr. Lincoln .....	15560
Motion No. 26 negatived .....	15560
Mr. Kilger .....	15561
Mr. Strahl .....	15561
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15561
Mr. Solomon .....	15561
Mr. Harvey .....	15561
Motion No. 61 negatived .....	15562
Mr. Kilger .....	15562
Motions Nos. 22, 23, 24, 36, 37 and 151 negatived .....	15567
Mr. Kilger .....	15567
Mr. Strahl .....	15567
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15567
Mr. Solomon .....	15567
Mr. Harvey .....	15567
Motion No. 62 negatived .....	15568
Mr. Kilger .....	15568
Motion No. 115 negatived .....	15569
Mr. Kilger .....	15569

Mr. Strahl .....	15569	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15590
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15569	Mr. Solomon .....	15590
Mr. Solomon .....	15569	Mr. Harvey .....	15590
Mr. Harvey .....	15569	Motion No. 4 negatived .....	15591
Motion No. 64 agreed to .....	15570	Mr. Kilger .....	15591
Mr. Kilger .....	15570	Motions Nos. 5, 11, 12, 25, 30, 33, 39 and 216 negatived .....	15598
Mr. Strahl .....	15570	Mr. Kilger .....	15598
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15570	Mr. Strahl .....	15598
Mr. Solomon .....	15570	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15598
Mr. Harvey .....	15570	Mr. Solomon .....	15598
Motion No. 65 negatived .....	15571	Mr. Harvey .....	15598
Mr. Kilger .....	15571	Motion No. 15 negatived .....	15599
Motions Nos. 66, 84, 85, 89, 90, 117, 192 and 202 negatived .....	15578	Mr. Kilger .....	15599
Mr. Kilger .....	15578	Motion No. 198 negatived .....	15600
Mr. Strahl .....	15578	Mr. Kilger .....	15600
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15579	Mr. Strahl .....	15600
Mr. Solomon .....	15579	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15600
Mr. Harvey .....	15579	Mr. Solomon .....	15600
Motion No. 67 agreed to .....	15579	Mr. Harvey .....	15600
Mr. Kilger .....	15579	Motion No. 31 agreed to .....	15601
Motions Nos. 86 and 91 agreed to .....	15581	Mr. Kilger .....	15601
Mr. Kilger .....	15581	Motions Nos. 48, 56 and 17 agreed to .....	15604
Mr. Godfrey .....	15581	Mr. White (Langley—Abbotsford) .....	15604
Ms. Brown .....	15581	Mr. Kilger .....	15604
Ms. Augustine .....	15581	Mr. Strahl .....	15604
Ms. Bennett .....	15581	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15604
Mr. Strahl .....	15581	Mr. Solomon .....	15604
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15581	Mr. Harvey .....	15604
Mr. Solomon .....	15582	Motion No. 160 negatived .....	15605
Mr. Harvey .....	15582	Mr. Kilger .....	15605
Motion No. 88 agreed to .....	15582	Mr. Strahl .....	15605
Mr. Kilger .....	15582	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15605
Mr. Strahl .....	15583	Mr. Solomon .....	15605
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15583	Mr. Harvey .....	15605
Mr. Solomon .....	15583	Motion No. 209 agreed to .....	15606
Mr. Harvey .....	15583	Mr. Kilger .....	15606
Motion No. 101 negatived .....	15584	Mr. Strahl .....	15606
Mr. Kilger .....	15584	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15606
Motions Nos. 200 and 214 negatived .....	15585	Mr. Solomon .....	15606
Mr. Kilger .....	15585	Mr. Harvey .....	15606
Mr. Strahl .....	15585	Motion No. 215 agreed to .....	15607
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15585	Mr. Kilger .....	15607
Mr. Solomon .....	15586	Mr. Strahl .....	15607
Mr. Harvey .....	15586	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15607
Motion No. 122 agreed to .....	15586	Mr. Solomon .....	15607
Mr. Kilger .....	15586	Mr. Harvey .....	15607
Mr. Caccia .....	15586	Motion No. 19 negatived .....	15608
Motions Nos. 138 and 148 agreed to .....	15588	Mr. Kilger .....	15608
Mr. Caccia .....	15588	Mr. Strahl .....	15608
Mr. Kilger .....	15588	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15609
Mr. Strahl .....	15588	Mr. Solomon .....	15609
Mr. Strahl .....	15589	Mr. Harvey .....	15609
Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15589	Motion No. 185 agreed to .....	15609
Mr. Solomon .....	15589	Mr. Kilger .....	15609
Mr. Harvey .....	15589	Motion No. 193 agreed to .....	15610
Mr. Caccia .....	15589	Mr. Kilger .....	15610
Mrs. Kraft Sloan .....	15589	Mr. Strahl .....	15610
Mr. Lincoln .....	15589	Mrs. Dalphond-Guiral .....	15611
Ms. Brown .....	15589	Mr. Solomon .....	15611
Motion No. 128 agreed to .....	15590	Mr. Harvey .....	15611
Mr. Kilger .....	15590	Motion No. 154 agreed to .....	15611
Mr. Strahl .....	15590	Mr. Kilger .....	15611
		Mr. Strahl .....	15612

Mrs. Dalphond–Guiral .....	15612
Mr. Solomon .....	15612
Mr. Harvey .....	15612
Motion No. 230 agreed to .....	15613
Mr. Kilger .....	15613
Mr. Strahl .....	15613
Mrs. Dalphond–Guiral .....	15613
Mr. Solomon .....	15613
Mr. Harvey .....	15613
Mr. Caccia .....	15613
Mr. Lincoln .....	15613
Mrs. Kraft Sloan .....	15613
Motion No. 231 agreed to .....	15614
Mr. Kilger .....	15614
Mr. Caccia .....	15614
Motion No. 233 agreed to .....	15615
Motion for concurrence .....	15615
Mrs. Stewart (Northumberland) .....	15615
Mr. Kilger .....	15615
Mr. Strahl .....	15615
Mrs. Dalphond–Guiral .....	15615
Mr. Solomon .....	15615
Mr. Harvey .....	15615
Mrs. Kraft Sloan .....	15615
Mr. Lincoln .....	15615
Mr. Caccia .....	15615
Motion agreed to .....	15616

**Bank Act**

Bill C–67. Third reading .....	15616
Mr. Kilger .....	15616
Mr. Strahl .....	15616
Mrs. Dalphond–Guiral .....	15616
Mr. Solomon .....	15617
Mr. Harvey .....	15617
Motion agreed to .....	15618
(Bill read the third time and passed) .....	15618

**Canada Travelling Exhibitions Indemnification Act**

Bill C–64. Report stage .....	15618
Mr. Kilger .....	15618
Mr. Strahl .....	15618
Mrs. Dalphond–Guiral .....	15618
Mr. Solomon .....	15618
Mr. Harvey .....	15618
Amendment negatived .....	15619
Mr. Kilger .....	15619

Mr. Strahl .....	15619
Mrs. Dalphond–Guiral .....	15619
Mr. Solomon .....	15619
Mr. Harvey .....	15619
Motion No. 1 agreed to .....	15620
Motion for concurrence .....	15620
Ms. Copps .....	15620
Mr. Kilger .....	15620
Mr. Strahl .....	15620
Mrs. Dalphond–Guiral .....	15620
Mr. Solomon .....	15620
Mr. Harvey .....	15620
Motion agreed to .....	15621
Third reading .....	15621
Ms. Copps .....	15621
Motion agreed to .....	15621
(Bill read the third time and passed) .....	15621

**PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS**

**Criminal Code**

Bill C–251. Report stage .....	15621
Motion No. 1 agreed to .....	15622
Mr. Myers .....	15622
Mr. Lunn .....	15623
Amendment agreed to .....	15623
Mr. MacKay .....	15623
Mr. Myers .....	15624
Motion No. 2, as amended, agreed to .....	15624
Mr. Kilger .....	15625
Mr. Lebel .....	15625
Amendment agreed to .....	15626
Mr. Solomon .....	15626
Ms. Girard–Bujold .....	15626
Motion No. 3, as amended, agreed to .....	15627
Motion for concurrence .....	15627
Ms. Guarnieri .....	15627
Mr. Grose .....	15627
Mr. Epp .....	15627
(Motion agreed to) .....	15627
Mr. White (Langley—Abbotsford) .....	15628

**ADJOURNMENT PROCEEDINGS**

<b>Kosovo</b>	
Mr. Earle .....	15628
Mr. Bertrand .....	15629

**MAIL  POSTE**

Canada Post Corporation/Société canadienne des postes

Postage paid

Port payé

**Lettermail**

**Poste-lettre**

**03159442**

**Ottawa**

*If undelivered, return COVER ONLY to:*

Canadian Government Publishing,

45 Sacré-Coeur Boulevard,

Hull, Québec, Canada, K1A 0S9

*En cas de non-livraison,*

*retourner cette COUVERTURE SEULEMENT à:*

Les Éditions du gouvernement du Canada,

45 boulevard Sacré-Coeur,

Hull, Québec, Canada, K1A 0S9

**Published under the authority of the Speaker of the House of Commons**

**Publié en conformité de l'autorité du Président de la Chambre des communes**

**Also available on the Parliamentary Internet Parlementaire at the following address:**

**Aussi disponible sur le réseau électronique «Parliamentary Internet Parlementaire» à l'adresse suivante :**

**<http://wwwparl.gc.ca>**

---

**The Speaker of the House hereby grants permission to reproduce this document, in whole or in part, for use in schools and for other purposes such as private study, research, criticism, review or newspaper summary. Any commercial or other use or reproduction of this publication requires the express prior written authorization of the Speaker of the House of Commons.**

**Additional copies may be obtained from Canadian Government Publishing, Ottawa, Canada K1A 0S9**

**Le Président de la Chambre des communes accorde, par la présente, l'autorisation de reproduire la totalité ou une partie de ce document à des fins éducatives et à des fins d'étude privée, de recherche, de critique, de compte rendu ou en vue d'en préparer un résumé de journal. Toute reproduction de ce document à des fins commerciales ou autres nécessite l'obtention au préalable d'une autorisation écrite du Président.**

**On peut obtenir des copies supplémentaires en écrivant à : Les Éditions du gouvernement du Canada, Ottawa, Canada K1A 0S9**

**On peut obtenir la version française de cette publication en écrivant à : Les Éditions du gouvernement du Canada, Ottawa, Canada K1A 0S9**